

**As Reported by the House Ways and Means Committee**

**131st General Assembly**

**Regular Session**

**2015-2016**

**Sub. H. B. No. 9**

**Representative Boose**

**Cosponsors: Representatives Blessing, Hambley, Hood, Scherer, Sprague,  
Strahorn, Young, Dever, Driehaus, Rogers**

---

**A BILL**

To amend sections 107.03 and 5703.48 and to enact  
section 5703.95 of the Revised Code to create a  
Tax Expenditure Review Committee for the purpose  
of periodically reviewing existing tax  
expenditures. 1  
2  
3  
4  
5

**BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF THE STATE OF OHIO:**

**Section 1.** That sections 107.03 and 5703.48 be amended and  
section 5703.95 of the Revised Code be enacted to read as  
follows: 6  
7  
8

**Sec. 107.03.** The governor shall submit to the general  
assembly, not later than four weeks after its organization, a  
state budget containing a complete financial plan for the  
ensuing fiscal biennium, excluding items of revenue and  
expenditure described in section 126.022 of the Revised Code.  
However, in years of a new governor's inauguration, the budget  
shall be submitted not later than the fifteenth day of March. In  
years of a new governor's inauguration, only the new governor  
shall submit a budget to the general assembly. In addition to  
other things required by law, the governor's budget shall 9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18

contain:	19
(A) A general budget summary by function and agency	20
setting forth the proposed total expenses from each and all	21
funds and the anticipated resources for meeting such expenses;	22
such resources to include any available balances in the several	23
funds at the beginning of the biennium and a classification by	24
totals of all revenue receipts estimated to accrue during the	25
biennium under existing law and proposed legislation.	26
(B) A detailed statement showing the amounts recommended	27
to be appropriated from each fund for each fiscal year of the	28
biennium for current expenses, including, but not limited to,	29
personal services, supplies and materials, equipment, subsidies	30
and revenue distribution, merchandise for resale, transfers, and	31
nonexpense disbursements, obligations, interest on debt, and	32
retirement of debt, and for the biennium for capital outlay, to	33
the respective departments, offices, institutions, as defined in	34
section 121.01 of the Revised Code, and all other public	35
purposes; and, in comparative form, the actual expenses by	36
source of funds during each fiscal year of the previous two	37
bienniums for each such purpose. No alterations shall be made in	38
the requests for the legislative and judicial branches of the	39
state filed with the director of budget and management under	40
section 126.02 of the Revised Code. If any amount of federal	41
money is recommended to be appropriated or has been expended for	42
a purpose for which state money also is recommended to be	43
appropriated or has been expended, the amounts of federal money	44
and state money involved shall be separately identified.	45
(C) A detailed estimate of the revenue receipts in each	46
fund from each source under existing laws during each year of	47
the biennium; and, in comparative form, actual revenue receipts	48

in each fund from each source for each year of the two previous 49  
bienniums; 50

(D) The estimated cash balance in each fund at the 51  
beginning of the biennium covered by the budget; the estimated 52  
liabilities outstanding against each such balance; and the 53  
estimated net balance remaining and available for new 54  
appropriations; 55

(E) A detailed estimate of the additional revenue receipts 56  
in each fund from each source under proposed legislation, if 57  
enacted, during each year of the biennium; 58

(F) A description of each tax expenditure; a detailed 59  
estimate of the amount of revenues not available to the general 60  
revenue fund under existing laws during each fiscal year of the 61  
biennium covered by the budget due to the operation of each tax 62  
expenditure; and, in comparative form, the amount of revenue not 63  
available to the general revenue fund during each fiscal year of 64  
the immediately preceding biennium due to the operation of each 65  
tax expenditure. The report prepared by the department of 66  
taxation pursuant to section 5703.48 of the Revised Code shall 67  
be submitted to the general assembly as an appendix to the 68  
governor's budget. As used in this division, "tax expenditure" 69  
has the same meaning as in section 5703.48 of the Revised Code. 70

(G) The most recent report prepared by the tax expenditure 71  
review committee under division (F) of section 5703.95 of the 72  
Revised Code, which shall be submitted to the general assembly 73  
as an appendix to the governor's budget. 74

**Sec. 5703.48.** (A) As used in this section and section 75  
107.03 of the Revised Code, "tax expenditure" means ~~any a~~ tax 76  
provision in the Revised Code that exempts, either in whole or 77

in part, certain persons, income, goods, services, or property 78  
from the effect of taxes ~~established in the Revised Code~~ levied 79  
by the state, including, but not limited to, tax deductions, 80  
exemptions, deferrals, exclusions, allowances, credits, 81  
reimbursements, and preferential tax rates, provided all of the 82  
following apply to the provision: 83

(1) The provision reduces, or has the potential to reduce, 84  
revenue to the general revenue fund; 85

(2) The persons, income, goods, services, or property 86  
exempted by the provision would have been part of a defined tax 87  
base; 88

(3) The persons, income, goods, services, or property 89  
exempted by the provision are not subject to an alternate tax 90  
levied by the state; 91

(4) The provision is subject to modification or repeal by 92  
an act of the general assembly. 93

(B) The department of taxation shall prepare and submit to 94  
the governor not later than the first day of November in each 95  
even-numbered year a report describing the effect of tax 96  
expenditures on the general revenue fund. The report shall 97  
contain a description of each tax expenditure under existing 98  
laws and, in comparative form, a detailed estimate of the 99  
approximate amount of revenue not available to the state general 100  
revenue fund in each fiscal year of the current and ensuing 101  
fiscal bienniums as a result of the operation of each tax 102  
expenditure. The report shall be prepared in such a manner as to 103  
facilitate the inclusion of the information provided by the 104  
report in the governor's budget. 105

Sec. 5703.95. (A) As used in this section, "tax 106

expenditure" has the same meaning as in section 5703.48 of the 107  
Revised Code. 108

(B) There is hereby created the tax expenditure review 109  
committee, consisting of seven members, composed of the 110  
following: 111

(1) Three members of the house of representatives 112  
appointed by the speaker of the house of representatives in 113  
consultation with the minority leader of the house of 114  
representatives. Members described in division (B)(1) of this 115  
section shall not all be members of the same party and should be 116  
members of the house of representatives committee that deals 117  
primarily with tax legislation; 118

(2) Three members of the senate appointed by the president 119  
of the senate in consultation with the minority leader of the 120  
senate. Members described in division (B)(2) of this section 121  
shall not all be members of the same party and should be members 122  
of the senate committee that deals primarily with tax 123  
legislation; 124

(3) The tax commissioner or the tax commissioner's 125  
designee. The member described in division (B)(3) of this 126  
section shall be a nonvoting member. 127

The speaker of the house of representatives and the 128  
president of the senate shall make initial appointments to the 129  
committee not later than thirty days following the effective 130  
date of the enactment of this section. Thereafter, the terms of 131  
the office for appointed members shall be the same as the term 132  
of each general assembly. Members may be reappointed, provided 133  
the member continues to meet all other eligibility requirements. 134  
Vacancies shall be filled in the manner provided for original 135

appointments. Any member appointed to fill a vacancy before the 136  
expiration of the term for which the predecessor was appointed 137  
shall hold office as a member for the remainder of that term. 138  
Appointed members of the committee serve at the pleasure of the 139  
member's appointing authority and may be removed only by the 140  
appointing authority. 141

(C) The tax expenditure review committee shall hold its 142  
first meeting within ninety days after the effective date of the 143  
enactment of this section. At the first meeting, the members 144  
shall elect a chairperson, who shall be one of the members 145  
described in division (B) (1) or (2) of this section. Thereafter, 146  
the committee shall meet at least once during the first year of 147  
each fiscal biennium to review existing tax expenditures 148  
pursuant to division (D) of this section, provided the committee 149  
shall hold, for any such expenditure, at least one meeting at 150  
which a person may present to the committee evidence or 151  
testimony related to that expenditure. Any person may submit to 152  
the chairperson a request that the committee meet to accept 153  
evidence or testimony on a tax expenditure. The committee is a 154  
public body for the purposes of section 121.22 of the Revised 155  
Code. 156

The chairperson of the committee shall serve until the 157  
thirty-first day of December of each even-numbered year. 158  
Thereafter, members shall elect a new chairperson. If the 159  
preceding chairperson was a member described in division (B) (1) 160  
of this section, the new chairperson shall be a member described 161  
in division (B) (2) of this section. If the preceding chairperson 162  
was a member described in division (B) (2) of this section, the 163  
new chairperson shall be a member described in division (B) (1) 164  
of this section. 165

A vacancy on the committee does not impair the right of 166  
the other members to exercise all the functions of the 167  
committee. The presence of a majority of the voting members of 168  
the committee constitutes a quorum for the conduct of business 169  
of the committee. The concurrence of at least a majority of the 170  
voting members of the committee is necessary for any action to 171  
be taken by the committee. 172

Upon the committee's request, the department of taxation, 173  
development services agency, office of budget and management, or 174  
other state agency shall provide any information in its 175  
possession that the committee requires to perform its duties. 176

The staff of the legislative service commission shall 177  
assist the committee as directed by the committee. 178

(D) The committee shall establish a schedule for review 179  
for each tax expenditure so that each expenditure is reviewed at 180  
least once every eight years. The schedule may provide for the 181  
review of each tax expenditure in the order the expenditures 182  
were enacted or modified, beginning with the least recently 183  
enacted or modified tax expenditure. Alternatively, the review 184  
schedule may group tax expenditures by the individuals or 185  
industries benefiting from the expenditures, the objectives of 186  
each expenditure, or the policy rationale of each expenditure. 187  
In its review, the committee shall make recommendations as to 188  
whether each tax expenditure should be continued without 189  
modification, modified, scheduled for further review at a future 190  
date to consider repealing the expenditure, or repealed 191  
outright. For each expenditure reviewed, the committee may 192  
recommend accountability standards for the future review of the 193  
expenditure. The committee may consider, when reviewing a tax 194  
expenditure, any of the relevant factors described in division 195

<u>(E) of this section.</u>	196
<u>(E) In conducting reviews pursuant to division (D) of this section, the committee may consider the following factors:</u>	197 198
<u>(1) The number and classes of persons, organizations, businesses, or types of industries that would receive the direct benefit or consequences of the tax expenditure;</u>	199 200 201
<u>(2) The fiscal impact of the tax expenditure on state and local taxing authorities, including any past fiscal effects and expected future fiscal impacts of the tax expenditure in the following eight-year period;</u>	202 203 204 205
<u>(3) Public policy objectives that might support the tax expenditure. In researching such objectives, the committee may consider the expenditure's legislative history, the tax expenditure's sponsor's intent in proposing the tax expenditure, or the extent to which the tax expenditure encourages or would encourage business growth or relocation into the state, promotes or would promote growth or retention of high-wage jobs in the state, or aids or would aid community stabilization.</u>	206 207 208 209 210 211 212 213
<u>(4) Whether the tax expenditure successfully accomplishes any of the objectives identified in division (E) (3) of this section;</u>	214 215 216
<u>(5) Whether the objectives identified in division (E) (3) of this section would or could have been accomplished successfully in the absence of the tax expenditure or with less cost to the state or local governments;</u>	217 218 219 220
<u>(6) Whether the objectives identified in division (E) (3) of this section could have been accomplished successfully through a program that requires legislative appropriations for funding;</u>	221 222 223 224

(7) The extent to which the tax expenditure may provide 225  
unintended benefits to an individual, organization, or industry 226  
other than those the general assembly or sponsor intended or 227  
creates an unfair competitive advantage for its recipient with 228  
respect to other businesses in the state; 229

(8) The extent to which terminating the tax expenditure 230  
may have negative effects on taxpayers that currently benefit 231  
from the tax expenditure; 232

(9) The extent to which terminating the tax expenditure 233  
may have negative or positive effects on the state's employment 234  
and economy; 235

(10) The feasibility of modifying the tax expenditure to 236  
provide for adjustment or recapture of the proceeds of the tax 237  
expenditure if the objectives of the tax expenditure are not 238  
fulfilled by the recipient of the tax expenditure. 239

(F) The committee shall prepare a report of its 240  
determinations under division (D) of this section and, not later 241  
than the first day of July of each even-numbered year, submit a 242  
copy of the report to the governor, the speaker of the house of 243  
representatives, the president of the senate, the minority 244  
leader of the house of representatives, and the minority leader 245  
of the senate. The first report shall be submitted either in the 246  
year of the effective date of this section or in the first even- 247  
numbered year thereafter. If the committee maintains a web site, 248  
the committee shall cause a copy of the report to be posted on 249  
the web site in a form enabling access to the report by the 250  
public within thirty days after the report is submitted under 251  
this division. If the committee does not maintain a web site, 252  
the committee shall request that the president of the senate and 253  
the speaker of the house of representatives cause the report to 254

be posted on the web site of the general assembly. 255

(G) Any bill introduced in the house of representatives or 256  
the senate that proposes to enact or modify one or more tax 257  
expenditures should include a statement explaining the 258  
objectives of the tax expenditure or its modification and the 259  
sponsor's intent in proposing the tax expenditure or its 260  
modification. 261

**Section 2.** That existing sections 107.03 and 5703.48 of 262  
the Revised Code are hereby repealed. 263