TASK FORCE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Ohio Safety Belt Task Force



May 2024

Prepared for Governor Mike DeWine





The Ohio Department of Public Safety is committed to reducing fatalities on Ohio's roadways. **Wearing a safety belt is the simplest step someone can take to limit injuries, or even save their life if they're involved in a vehicle crash.** We must motivate drivers and passengers alike to take safety into their own hands and secure themselves in vehicles.

While the vast majority of Ohio drivers understand the importance of wearing a safety belt, far too many are choosing to drive or ride unbuckled. In 2022, 63 percent of people who suffered a fatal injury in motor vehicle crashes on Ohio's roads were not wearing a safety belt when one was available. In raw numbers, that adds up 527 people, or more than one person every day.

"Buckling up is the single most effective thing you can do to protect yourself in a crash."

- National Highway Traffic Safety Administration

During the same year, Ohio hit an 18-year low in the number of people buckling up, when the observed safety belt usage rate dropped to 80.8 percent. For comparison, the national safety belt usage rate was 91.6 percent that year.





In response to this, the Ohio Department of Public Safety formed the Safety Belt Task Force. This task force, run though the Ohio Traffic Safety Council's Occupant Protection Subcommittee, brought together more than 30 subject-matter experts to formulate suggestions about how to increase voluntary safety belt use across Ohio. The group met four times between August and December 2023. The following report outlines their findings and recommendations.

TASK FORCE MEMBERS

Ben Suver Chief of Staff at Ohio Department of Public Safety

Colonel Charles Jones Ohio State Highway Patrol

Captain Chris Kinn Ohio State Highway Patrol (Co-Chair)

Lt. Colonel Josh Swindell Ohio State Highway Patrol

Lt. Nathan Dennis Ohio State Highway Patrol

Kimberly Schwind Ohio Traffic Safety Office (Co-Chair)

Judy Converse Ohio Traffic Safety Office

Emily Davidson Ohio Traffic Safety Office

Roshonda Elder Ohio Traffic Safety Office

Michelle May Ohio Department of Transportation Safety Program

Jeremy Thompson Ohio Department of Transportation Safety Program

Matt Bruning Ohio Department of Transportation David Rose Ohio Department of Transportation

Tiffany Boykins Ohio Department of Health

John Bolte Ohio State University

Angela Harden Ohio State University

Kara Hitchens AAA

Katherine McLauglin Beachwood PD (OACP)

Jon Scowden Chief Deputy Delaware (BSSA)

Dave Butler

Mary Jo Kohl FFCLA

Vaughn Flasher FOR Coalition

Curt Steiner FOR Coalition

Carl Hickey Franklin County Sheriff

Brian Bautsch Honda **Kari Kinnard** National Highway Traffic Safety Administration

Jeff Welter National Highway Traffic Safety Administration

Lauren Cardoni Mid Ohio Regional Planning Commission (and OARC)

Alex Homan Nationwide

Alan Hill Oakwood Department of Public Safety (OACP)

Dean Fadel Ohio Insurance Institute

Carol Lucio SADD

Ron Burton Chief Operating Officer at Transportation Research Center

Julius B. Feibel St. Charles Preparatory School

Cory Hopwood Cambridge Systematics, Inc.

INTRODUCTION

Motor vehicle crashes are among the top potential causes of death throughout a person's lifetime. In addition, they can cause serious life-changing injuries. The National Highway Traffic Safety Administration (NHTSA) says, **"buckling up is the single most effective thing you can do to protect yourself in a crash."** Yet, in 2022 approximately 19 percent of Ohioans were not wearing their safety belts, and 63 percent of people who died in crashes on Ohio's roadways were unbuckled, when a safety belt was available.

In addition to its high unbelted fatality rate, Ohio also has one of the lowest safety belt usage rates in the country.

Between 2019 and 2021, 1,555 of the 2,531 MOTORISTS (61%) KILLED in Ohio were NOT WEARING an available SAFETY BELT, according to the Ohio State Highway Patrol. An additional 6,606 UNBELTED INDIVIDUALS suffered "SERIOUS INJURIES"

during that time frame.



The U.S. DOT has adopted the Safe System Approach as the guiding framework to save lives on the nation's roadways. The Safe System Approach recognizes that:

- We inevitably make mistakes and decisions, which can lead or contribute to traffic crashes; and
- Human bodies have physical limits for tolerating crash forces.

Choosing to wear a safety belt is a simple and easy decision to save your life and others' – protecting the human body from harmful crash impact forces. According to NHTSA, wearing a safety belt saved an estimated 14,955 lives and could have saved an additional 2,549 people if they had been wearing safety belts, in 2017 alone. **There is no doubt that safety belts save lives.**

KEY DATA POINTS

According to the annual Observational Seat Belt Survey conducted by the Ohio Traffic Safety Office (OTSO), a division of the Ohio Department of Public Safety (ODPS), Ohio had the 9th lowest safety belt usage rate in 2021, at 84.1 percent. In 2022, the state's safety belt usage rate dropped to 80.8 percent – this is the lowest level since 2005, the 10th lowest rate in the country, and 10.8 percent lower than the national average of 91.6 percent in 2022. The 2022 annual Observational Seat Belt Survey highlighted a set of key data points, trends, and observations which helps determine the scope of safety belt noncompliance in Ohio.



According to fatal crash data collected by ODPS, a total of 475 unbelted traffic deaths occurred when occupying the front-left seat position (a driver) or the front-right seat position (a passenger), in 2022. As stated by NHTSA, wearing a safety belt in the front seat of a motor vehicle can reduce the risk of fatal injury by 45 percent and moderate to critical injury by 50 percent during a crash. Safety belts should be worn at all times, regardless of what seat you are occupying.

Ohio drivers are less likely to wear their safety belt when traveling on local roads. In 2022, the safety belt compliance rate was 82.4 percent, compared to 86.8 percent compliance on primary roads, which mainly consist of interstate and limited access highways. Although it may seem safe to be unbelted when traveling on local roads, severe traffic crashes resulting in death or serious injury occur on all road types in every community.

Males are less likely to wear their safety belt in Ohio. The populations most at-risk of not wearing their safety belt include occupants of trucks, especially young and middle-aged males, and young males in cars. As stated by NHTSA, wearing a safety belt in a truck can reduce the risk of fatal injury by 60 percent and moderate to critical injury by 65 percent during a crash. No one is immune to death or serious injury in a traffic crash. Every person, regardless of demographics, should wear a safety belt.

In 2023, Fix Our Roads Ohio (FOR Ohio) conducted the Ohio Licensed Drivers Statewide Survey to gather the public opinions of 1,000 licensed drivers. According to the survey results, **Ohio drivers agree that wearing a safety belt is important.** Ninety-five percent of Ohio drivers agree that wearing a safety belt in the front seat can save your life, and 90 percent of drivers believe it is either extremely or very important to put on a safety belt every time they get in the car.



In addition, the Ohio Licensed Drivers Statewide Survey identified that safety belt usage is higher in the front seats and while traveling on highways than in the back seats of a motor vehicle, when driving locally, or when traveling as a passenger in a taxi, Uber, or Lyft.

Consistently choosing to wear a safety belt is a simple way to save your life and others.

OHIO STATISTICS

USAGE RATE

In the past decade, the safety belt usage rate in Ohio has remained below the national average. The usage rate declined 5 percent in 2022, from 2019, recording the lowest rate in the past 10 years.

SAFETY BELT USAGE RATE (2012-2022)



Source: National Highway Traffic Safety Administration (NHTSA) Traffic Safety Facts; Ohio Department of Public Safety (ODPS) Observational Survey of Seat Belt Use in Ohio, 2022.

Out of 88 counties, 26 had a safety belt usage rate less than the statewide average of 80.8 percent in 2022; 24 counties had usage rate of 90 percent and above.

SAFETY BELT USAGE RATE BY COUNTY (2022)



Source: ODPS Observational Survey of Seat Belt Use in Ohio, 2022.

COMPLIANCE BY DEMOGRAPHICS

Younger occupants had a much lower safety belt usage rate than that of middle-age and older occupants. Occupants aged 15–25 years have the lowest usage rate of 81 percent.



SAFETY BELT COMPLIANCE RATE BY AGE GROUP

Source: ODPS Observational Survey of Seat Belt Use in Ohio, 2022.

Female occupants had comparatively higher safety belt usage rate than male.

SAFETY BELT COMPLIANCE RATE BY GENDER (2022)



Source: ODPS Observational Survey of Seat Belt Use in Ohio, 2022.

COMPLIANCE BY VEHICLE TYPE

SUVs had the highest compliance rate, followed by vans and cars. Both type of trucks (light and heavy truck) had the lowest compliance rates.



SAFETY BELT COMPLIANCE RATE BY VEHICLE TYPE

Source: ODPS Observational Survey of Seat Belt Use in Ohio, 2022.

COMPLIANCE BY ROAD TYPE

Local roads had a lower compliance rate compared to primary and secondary roads.

SAFETY BELT COMPLIANCE RATE BY ROAD TYPE (2022)



Source: ODPS Observational Survey of Seat Belt Use in Ohio, 2022.

UNBELTED DEATHS BY LOCATION

A little over 50 percent of the deaths involving unbuckled drivers or passengers occurred in urban areas. State routes experienced nearly 30 percent of the unbelted deaths, while US routes and interstates saw a total of 28 percent of the unbelted deaths.

UNBELTED DEATHS BY LAND USE AREA (2022)



UNBELTED DEATHS BY LOCATION (2022)



Source: ODPS Crash System, 2022.

UNBELTED DEATHS BY SEATING POSITION

In 2022, 476 unrestrained front seat drivers and occupants died in motor vehicle crashes.

For drivers and front seat passengers, using a lap and shoulder belt reduces the risk of fatal injury by 60 percent in a light truck, and by 45 percent in a car (NHTSA).





Source: ODPS Crash System, 2022.



OHIO LAW

Ohio Law 4513.263 regulates the legality of safety belt usage in the state.

According to Ohio Law 4513.263 Section B -

It is illegal to operate an automobile or a school bus on any street or highway unless that person is wearing all of the available elements of a properly adjusted occupant restraining device.

It is illegal to operate an automobile on any street or highway unless **each passenger** in the automobile who is subject to the requirement set forth in division (B)(3) of this section (noted below) is wearing all of the available elements of a properly adjusted occupant restraining device.

It is illegal to occupy, as a passenger, a seating position on the front seat of an automobile being operated on any street or highway unless that person is wearing all of the available elements of a properly adjusted occupant restraining device.

It is illegal to operate a taxicab on any street or highway unless all factory-equipped occupant restraining devices in the taxicab are maintained in usable form.

However, exemptions are provided to those who are employees of the United States Postal Service; those who work for a newspaper home delivery service; a person with an affidavit from a physician or chiropractor, which states that the person has a physical impairment that makes using a safety belt impractical or impossible; or a person who has an affidavit, which states that safety belt use is impractical or impossible and are registered with the registrar's office

According to Ohio Law 4513.263 Section D -

No law enforcement officer shall stop the operator of an automobile traveling on any street or highway for the sole purpose of determining whether a violation of Section B has been or is being committed, or for the sole purpose of issuing a ticket, citation, or summons for a violation of that nature. In addition, no law enforcement officer shall view the interior or visually inspect any automobile being operated on any street or highway for the sole purpose of determining whether a violation of that nature has been or is being committed.

The penalties for violating **Ohio** Law 4513.263 includes:

- A driver violation fine of \$30.00
- A passenger violation fine of \$20.00

The cost of a human life is far greater than a simple \$30 or \$20 fine. With low fines comes a high probability of repeated offenders – meaning more drivers and passengers unbelted and a greater chance of death or serious injury if a crash occurs.



EFFECTIVENESS OF PRIMARY LAWS

In the United States, **currently 34 states and the** District of Columbia have primary safety belt laws, and 15 have secondary safety belt laws. A

primary safety belt law allows law enforcement officers to ticket a driver or passenger for not wearing their safety belt. However, a secondary safety belt law allows law enforcement officers to issue a ticket for noncompliance only when a driver has been stopped for another citable infraction. Since Ohio is currently one of the 15 states with a secondary enforcement law, Ohio drivers may not be stopped for failure to wear a seatbelt without another violation. In 2022, the observed seat belt usage rate in Ohio was 80.8 percent, which is quite lower than that of the neighboring states. Data indicates secondary safety belt laws are less effective than primary laws. Studies show that primary laws increase seat belt use by about 14 percent and reduce occupant fatalities by about 8 percent, compared to secondary laws. In addition, states that have a primary safety belt law also have higher safety belt usage rates.



Source: National Highway Traffic Safety Administration's (NHTSA) National Center for Statistics and Analysis.

STATE	PRIMARY SAFETY BELT LAW	SAFETY BELT CITATIONS (2022)	% UNBELTED FATALITIES (2022)
Illinois	Yes	14,435	23%
Indiana	Yes	30,958	18%
Kentucky	Yes	55,089	54%
Michigan	Yes	6,569	21%
Ohio	Νο	59,163	63 %
Pennsylvania	No	18,249	44%
West Virginia	Yes	13,700	28%

In 2022, Ohio issued 59,163 safety belt citations. According to NHTSA estimates, if Ohio were to pass a primary seat belt law, seat belt usage could increase by 6.4 percent saving an estimated 49 lives and 1,264 serious injuries. **The connection is clear – primary safety belt laws save lives.**

49LIVES

A primary seat belt law in Ohio

COULD INCREASE SAFETY BELT USAGE by 6.4%

COULD SAVE

which

and COULD PREVENT 1,264 SERIOUS INJURIES per year.



Of the states with the **25 highest** seatbelt usage rates, **23 of them have primary** seatbelt laws.

Nevada and Montana are the only states in the top 25 with secondary enforcement laws. Both of these states are far less populated than Ohio. Nevada's law also includes passengers who ride in the back seat, while Ohio law only includes front seat passengers.

The Safety Belt Task Force spoke with Nevada about their efforts. Nevada attributes their high safety belt usage rate to:

- Enforcement Continuous high visibility enforcement.
- High mobility Nevada is one of the fastest growing states in the country, with many new residents moving there from states that have primary enforcement seat belt laws.
- Perception Many believe Nevada has a primary seat belt law.
- Outreach and Communication Outreach efforts never distinguish or differentiate between primary and secondary seat belt laws.

TASK FORCE MEETINGS

The Safety Belt Task Force met four times between August and December of 2023. Each meeting focused on a different strategy area and featured speakers that provided meaningful insights to Safety Belt Task Force members. Meetings and topics included:

- Aug 3, 2023. Kickoff Meeting: Ohio Department of Public Safety Chief of Staff Ben Suver and Ohio State Highway Patrol Superintendent Colonel Charles Jones welcomed the task force members and shared the purpose and goals of the group. The Ohio State Highway Patrol and Ohio Traffic Safety Office outlined the current data and safety belt landscape in Ohio, leading to an open discussion with members about the perceived issues and opportunities in the state.
- Oct 3, 2023. Laws and Policy: Captain Christopher Kinn provided an overview of updated data and Ohio's safety belt law. Neil Newhouse, co-founder of Public Opinion Strategies and pollster of FOR Ohio, presented results from the Ohio Licensed Drivers Statewide Survey. Katie Mueller from the National Safety Council spoke on employee engagement, and Michelle May from the Ohio Department of Transportation spoke about what is already being done to engage Ohio employers about traffic safety-related issues. This meeting included an open discussion on potential strategies to address safety belt use related to laws and policy.
- Nov 16, 2023. Education and Research: The group reviewed updated unbelted fatality trends, followed by a presentation from the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation on their state safety belt messaging efforts. Pennsylvania is a neighboring state with a secondary safety belt law and a higher seat belt usage rate. The state of Nevada also sent information to be shared with the Safety Belt Task Force. Nevada has a secondary safety belt law and one of the highest seat belt usage rates in the country. The task force concluded the meeting with open discussion and potential recommendations related to education and research.
- Dec 19, 2023. Recommendations: Lori Millen from the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration presented on messaging campaign development. Task force members also reviewed and discussed proposed recommendations across each of the topic areas in previous meeting to be utilized in the report. Ohio Department of Public Safety Chief of Staff Ben Suver and Ohio State Highway Patrol Superintendent Colonel Charles Jones concluded the meeting with closing remarks.



RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the meetings, statistics, and other data provided by our members, the Safety Belt Task Force is recommending the following actions. Implementing these recommendations will involve ongoing coordination between key stakeholders and Ohio leaders, including members of the Ohio General Assembly.



RECOMMENDED ACTION	DISCUSSION	WHY RECOMMENDED
Primary enforcement safety belt law.	Prevents Ohio drivers and occupants from traveling without a safety belt. Ohio currently has a secondary law for drivers and front seat occupants only, meaning drivers and front seat passengers have to first be pulled over for something else before receiving a safety belt citation.	States with primary laws typically have the highest safety belt usage rates and lower fatal and serious injuries. In 2022, Ohio had the 10 th lowest usage rate, and a 63 percent unbelted fatality rate. Based on the Ohio Licensed Drivers Statewide Survey conducted by FOR Ohio, Ohioans widely agree safety belts save lives, and largely agree the state should mandate them.
Increased fines and/or the addition of points for safety belt violations: Harsher penalties, such as points, for drivers under Graduated Driver Licensing (GDL) provisions. Research on states points/fines.	Increases compliance with following laws. Fines are currently \$30 for drivers and \$20 for front seat passengers, and drivers do not receive points on their licenses for not wearing a safety belt.	Fines for not wearing a safety belt have not increased since the year 2000. Surveys show the public does not believe the fines are high enough to change behavior. According to NHTSA's Countermeasures That Work (2023), low fines may send the message that seat belt laws are not taken seriously. As examined by Nichols, Tippets, et al. (2010, 2014), increasing safety belt noncompliance fines in states from \$25 to \$60 was associated with a 3-4 percent increase in observed safety belt use. Ohio law requires all vehicle occupants to wear a safety belt when the driver holds a temporary permit or probationary license, yet data shows these young drivers remain among the least likely to wear safety belts. According to NHTSA's Countermeasures That Work (2023), younger drivers and passengers have lower reported safety belt use rates than adult drivers and passengers. The Safety Belt Task Force advised that teens are more likely to respond to the threat of points being added to their license than fines.
Consider including back seat occupants in Ohio's safety belt law.	Surveys show that people are more likely to comply with safety measures if they are in law. This would extend to ride sharing like Uber/Lyft as it does in other states, which already have several safety measures in their general practices. Ohio law already requires children up to age 8 to wear a safety belt in the back seat. In addition, new teen drivers with a temporary permit or probationary license are required by law to ensure all occupants wear a safety belt, regardless of seating position.	Backseat safety belts save lives for all occupants, as well as protect backseat occupants from harming those in the front seat, in the event of a crash. Pennsylvania is a neighboring state with a secondary enforcement seat belt law, and a higher seat belt usage rate. Representatives from Pennsylvania spoke during a Safety Belt Task Force meeting. The task force noted that many of Pennsylvania's safety belt efforts are similar to Ohio's. However, Pennsylvania's law is primary under certain ages, including children in the back seat.

RECOMMENDED ACTION	DISCUSSION	WHY RECOMMENDED
Reduce fine amounts for primary violation when safety belt is being worn (if primary enforcement safety belt law is not enacted).	Other states (i.e., Wyoming) have incentives, where officers can reduce fines for other offenses if a safety belt is being used.	This would encourage voluntary safety belt compliance without being punitive.
As autonomous vehicle technologies advance, consider laws that require safety belt use in order for vehicle to start or operate.	The percentage of vehicles with telematics on safety belt usage is increasing rapidly.	As advanced technology increases on Ohio roadways, it is important that this technology is designed to be in compliance with all of Ohio laws.



POLICY

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Employer Policies: Encourage all employers whose employees drive (both pool and personal cars) to have a policy requiring safety belt use for all occupants:

- Use the distracted driving policy examples as a model to develop safety belt policy materials.
- Work with the National Safety Council to post all employer policy and education materials on <u>oh.ourdrivingconcern.org</u>.
- Educate employers about the resources available.
- Work with ride share companies to adopt these policies as well.

According to the National Safety Council (NSC), transportation incidents accounted for the largest number of Ohio workplace deaths (67) in 2021. The next highest category was slips and falls (34). During a presentation to the Safety Belt Task Force, the NSC said motor vehicle crash deaths are costly, but preventable.

DISCUSSION

The NSC has received federal (NHTSA) grant funding from the Ohio Traffic Safety Office to develop an employee education program in Ohio, called Our Driving Concern. This will include a website with tools and sample policies for employers focused on seat belt usage and other traffic safety initiatives. The tools can build upon the employee engagement efforts already developed for distracted driving.

WHY RECOMMENDED

Many employers have their employees operating vehicles as part of their job duties/ responsibilities. As demonstrated in this report, wearing a safety belt reduces injuries and saves lives. Requiring safety belt use by employees creates a safer environment, and can save employers money.





EDUCATION

RECOMMENDED ACTION	DISCUSSION	WHY RECOMMENDED	
 Educate Ohioans on why this issue is important, by creating an Ohio-specific social norming messaging campaign that focuses on the following: Safety Belts Save Lives – dangers of not wearing a safety belt. Vehicle insurance won't cover at-fault crashes without a safety belt. Importance of wearing a safety belt in the back seat. Statistics. Personal stories. Champions outside of traffic safety advocates. Alignment with other key traffic safety messages, such as Phones Down. 	Improve Ohioans' understanding of current laws and impacts to the safety of general public. Additional statistics and personal stories are effective means of shifting attitudes, but they are more impactful with support from champions outside of traditional safety advocates and agencies. NHTSA conducts research on campaign messaging for distracted driving and safety belts. The style of messaging that focus groups consider effective is frequently changing.	Public polling showed Ohioans largely do not understand the benefits of a primary safety belt law and why it's important to buckle up in the back seat. The Safety Belt Task Force suggests educating the public to garner public support for recommended legislation.	
 Implement an Elementary Seat Belt Program to educate students and families about the importance of wearing a safety belt: Partner with law enforcement and SADD to deliver the content. 	SADD has already developed a curriculum using federal (NHTSA) grant funds provided through the Ohio Traffic Safety Office (OTSO). OTSO is working with SADD and The Ohio State University to refine the curriculum and incorporate additional educational materials for schools and families. Law enforcement and/or high school students will deliver the content to elementary students throughout Ohio.	This program reaches Ohio's children at a pivotal point, when many are transitioning from a child safety seat to a regular safety belt. Educating students at this point in their development helps instill the lifelong habit of buckling up and encouraging others to do the same. The program will also include materials for students to bring home and videos to reach parents and other family members.	
Partner with law enforcement, health classes, and SADD to include safety belt financial messaging in financial literacy high school courses.	Materials are being shared with teachers now in financial literacy materials. Insurance can deny full benefit if an at fault driver is injured in crash while not wearing safety belt.	Not buckling up can end up costing drivers in fines, medical costs and insurance claims. This is an important part of financial literacy, as it teaches students the potential financial impacts of not wearing a safety belt.	



RESEARCH

RECOMMENDED ACTION	DISCUSSION	WHY RECOMMENDED
 Conduct backseat safety research: Follow-up public opinion poll. Focus group(s). Literature reviews of current research and statistics. 	The task force agreed more information is needed on the impacts of not buckling up in the back seat. Since much of this research likely already exists, task force members recommended a literature review to identify current research on the topic. In addition, a follow-up public opinion poll and focus groups would help identify why people don't buckle up as often in the back seat and the best way to encourage them to buckle up in all seating positions. The Safety Belt Task Force discussed many instances where passengers do not buckle up in the backseat of vehicles, including ride sharing services.	The Ohio Licensed Drivers Statewide Survey conducted by FOR Ohio showed a gap in understanding about the importance of buckling up in the back seat.
 Motivating factors to wear a safety belt: Follow-up public opinion poll. Focus group(s). Literature reviews of current research and statistics. 	The Safety Belt Task Force discussed diving deeper into what motivates people to buckle up or to remain unbuckled. What's learned from this research can be applied to targeted education campaigns encouraging hard-to-reach groups to wear their seatbelt.	While the majority of Ohioans wear their safety belt, the 15-20 percent who do not buckle up are continuously overrepresented in fatal crashes. More information is needed to determine how to reach this group of people.

TASK FORCE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Ohio Safety Belt Task Force

For more information visit: <u>https://publicsafety.ohio.gov/home</u>



