

Columbus Office:
Vern Riffe Center
77 S. High Street, 10th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-6111

Phone: (614) 644-6041
Fax: (614) 719-6956
Rep06@OhioHouse.gov
www.ohiohouse.gov



Committees:
Primary & Secondary
Education, Ranking
Economic & Workforce
Development
Ways & Means

Special Appointments:
Educators Standard Board

Phillip M. Robinson Jr.
State Representative
Ohio House District 6

House Bill 497 Sponsor Testimony
Senate Primary & Secondary Education Committee
November 30, 2022

Chair Brenner, Vice-Chair Blessing, Ranking Member Hicks-Hudson, and members of the Ohio Senate Primary & Secondary Education Committee, thank you for the opportunity to testify in support of House Bill (HB) 497, legislation to reform the Ohio's Third Grade Reading Guarantee (TGRG). My joint sponsor, Representative Gayle Manning and I look forward to productive conversations with the committee and all related stakeholders.

I had a transformational experience after tutoring a young student while working in the private sector. This led to my subsequent career change and work in education non-profit management. In my new work, it became apparent to me that our schools need more support to help our children with many aspects of education, including reading. I have seen firsthand the challenges and unintended consequences of Statehouse policy changes in education, such as the TGRG. Testing anxieties and fear of retention is having a negative impact on students, parents, and teachers. Regardless of students' race, gender, and socioeconomic status; policies of retention and over testing are never the answer to improving learning in any discipline of study.

Our state needs to shift gears in how we support our schools' efforts to teach our young children how to read. For that reason, it is time to change our TGRG and redirect our efforts in reading abilities.

What HB 497 is very straight forward: 1) End the retention provision of the TGRG; and 2) Limits 3rd Grade testing of the English Language Arts (ELA) standardized test to only once a year. The bill does **NOT** end or get rid of any of the remediation, intervention, or support programs of the current TGRG, or change any other part of the program.

HB 497 has three goals that will be accomplished by the bill: 1) End the trend of punishing students that struggle with reading; 2) Reduce over testing and over emphasis on standardized state exams; and 3) Start a conversation and force the legislature to look to other ways to improve and invest in K-3rd grade reading education and proficiency levels through future legislation and policy.

6th House District: Southeast Cuyahoga County
Bentleyville – Brecksville – Broadview Heights – Chagrin Falls - Chagrin Falls Township – Gates Mills –
Glenwillow – Highland Heights – Hunting Valley – Independence – Lyndhurst – Mayfield Village – Moreland Hills
– Oakwood Village – Seven Hills – Solon – Valley View – Walton Hills

Printed in house.

Columbus Office:

Vern Riffe Center
77 S. High Street, 10th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-6111

Phone: (614) 644-6041
Fax: (614) 719-6956
Rep06@OhioHouse.gov
www.ohiohouse.gov



Committees:

Primary & Secondary
Education, Ranking
Economic & Workforce
Development
Ways & Means

Special Appointments:

Educators Standard Board

Phillip M. Robinson Jr.
State Representative
Ohio House District 6

Since implementing the TGRG in the '13-'14 school year, we have seen no meaningful or significant improvements to 4th Grade reading proficiency levels. Ohio's National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP) reading scores, prior to the pandemic, shows a decline from 2017 to 2019, with Ohio's reading score remaining virtually stagnant since 2002. Studies have confirmed this, like a recent 2020 analysis by Ohio State University's Crane Center for Early Childhood Research and Policy. Retention and extra testing is clearly not the answer.

When comparing 2019 NAEP average reading scores among states, the top three states in the U.S. are: 1) Massachusetts, which has a comprehensive 3rd grade reading policy that focuses on prevention, supporting early literacy, and child development; 2) New Jersey, which has no statewide retention mandate and lets local school districts decide their retention rules; and 3) Wyoming, which has no specific laws about 3rd grade reading all together.

Under the current retention policy, Ohio averages more than 3,600 third graders held back for failing the test each year. Only 15% of those third graders who repeated the grade were deemed proficient in reading after a year, and only 8% were deemed proficient by the time they were in fourth grade. Now those students must face the negative harm caused by retention.

The policy of retention has more long term negative consequences to students compared to possible and infrequent short term gains to reading skills. Most studies from over the last 30 years have found that holding students back creates little or no long-term academic benefits and can actually be harmful to students. Some of the negative effects can include: 1) reduced chance of high school graduation; 2) higher risk of dropping out of school and behavioral problems; 3) financial burden for schools; 4) hurts learning and proficiency in other disciplines; and 5) the potential social and emotional harm to students.

On an individual basis, retention may be needed for some students when local educators see the need, but not when state mandated based on standardized testing, ignoring the child's performance in other studies, and the community's socioeconomic factors.

The current TGRG rules are also another example of too much standardized testing, pulling both teachers and students away from actual learning and real remediation for students who are struggling in reading. We have heard time and time again from educators and families the problems caused by over testing and over emphasis on "one size fits all" standardized exams. And an additional benefit, eliminating the additional fall third grade ELA assessments have an estimated \$2.7 million in savings for Ohio tax payers at the start of the next fiscal year.

6th House District: Southeast Cuyahoga County

Bentleyville – Brecksville – Broadview Heights – Chagrin Falls - Chagrin Falls Township – Gates Mills –
Glenwillow – Highland Heights – Hunting Valley – Independence – Lyndhurst – Mayfield Village – Moreland Hills
– Oakwood Village – Seven Hills – Solon – Valley View – Walton Hills

Printed in house.

Columbus Office:

Vern Riffe Center
77 S. High Street, 10th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-6111

Phone: (614) 644-6041
Fax: (614) 719-6956
Rep06@OhioHouse.gov
www.ohiohouse.gov



Committees:

Primary & Secondary
Education, Ranking
Economic & Workforce
Development
Ways & Means

Special Appointments:

Educators Standard Board

Phillip M. Robinson Jr.
State Representative
Ohio House District 6

The TGRG's retention policy also disproportionately impacts families and demographic groups that are already facing difficulties in education due to barriers from their socioeconomic status. For example in 2019, while Ohio students not eligible for the National School Lunch Program (NSLP) had a 53% proficiency rate and 15% advanced in their reading level. Among students who do qualify for NSLP, there was only a 22% proficiency rate and 4% advanced rate. White students had a 43% proficiency rate and 10% advanced rate; while black students had a 15% proficiency rate and 2% advanced rate, and latin-x students had 22% proficiency rate and 3% advanced rate. In short, black, latin-x, and low-income household students have lower scores and are being held back at a higher rate, and face the downsides of repeating a grade at a higher rate than white and more affluent students.

Ohio needs to move to investing in proven ways to improve reading proficiency, things like teacher professional development in reading education; funding for more instructional coaches at schools; and earlier intervention starting in kindergarten. Another great way to improve K-3 reading and learning in general is universal pre-school and all-day kindergarten; issues my office are working on right now.

I think the winds of change are here on this issue. HB 497 has the support of parents, students, teachers, superintendents, school boards, school psychologists, and many Ohioans. The National Council of Teachers of English also recommend an end to state mandated retention. The bill passed out of House Primary & Secondary Education committee unanimously, and it passed out of the House with bipartisan support with 82 votes. And just his month, the Ohio State Board of Education with its current members passed a resolution recommending the state legislature repeal the TGRG's retention provision.

I have been working to advocate for these solutions as the Chief Impact Officer (CIO) at Reading Partners, a national nonprofit that works with communities to provide students with individual reading support. The more I learn about this issue, the more I know Ohio needs to turn the corner and move toward working solutions to the issue of reading proficiency. A student's zip code should not determine their destiny.

Chair Brenner, Vice-Chair Blessing, Ranking Member Hicks-Hudson and members of the committee, I thank you for your time and I am happy to answer any questions you have.

6th House District: Southeast Cuyahoga County

Bentleyville – Brecksville – Broadview Heights – Chagrin Falls - Chagrin Falls Township – Gates Mills – Glenwillow – Highland Heights – Hunting Valley – Independence – Lyndhurst – Mayfield Village – Moreland Hills – Oakwood Village – Seven Hills – Solon – Valley View – Walton Hills

Printed in house.