### **As Introduced**

132nd General Assembly Regular Session 2017-2018

H. B. No. 81

**Representatives Seitz, Antonio** 

Cosponsors: Representatives Dever, Miller, Hambley, Duffey, Brinkman, Blessing, Riedel, Lepore-Hagan, Smith, K., Ryan, Stein

# A BILL

To amend sections 2929.02, 2929.022, 2929.024,	1
2929.03, 2929.04, 2929.06, 2953.21, and 2953.23	2
and to enact section 2929.025 of the Revised	3
Code to provide that a person convicted of	4
aggravated murder who shows that the person had	5
a serious mental illness at the time of	6
committing the offense cannot be sentenced to	7
death for the offense and to provide a mechanism	8
for resentencing to a life sentence a person	9
previously sentenced to death who proves that	10
the person had a serious mental illness at the	11
time of committing the offense.	12

## BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF THE STATE OF OHIO:

Section 1. That sections 2929.02, 2929.022, 2929.024,	13
2929.03, 2929.04, 2929.06, 2953.21, and 2953.23 be amended and	14
section 2929.025 of the Revised Code be enacted to read as	15
follows:	16
Sec. 2929.02. (A) Whoever is convicted of or pleads quilty	17
Sec. 2929.02. (A) whoever is convicted of of preads guilty	± /
to aggravated murder in violation of section 2903.01 of the	18

Revised Code.

Revised Code shall suffer death or be imprisoned for life, as	19
determined pursuant to sections 2929.022, 2929.03, and 2929.04	20
of the Revised Code, except that no person who raises the matter	21
of age pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code and who	22
is not found to have been eighteen years of age or older at the	23
time of the commission of the offense and no person who raises	24
the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of	25
the alleged commission of the offense pursuant to section	26
2929.025 of the Revised Code and is found under that section to	27
be ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental	28
<u>illness</u> shall suffer death. In addition, the offender may be	29
fined an amount fixed by the court, but not more than twenty-	30
five thousand dollars.	31
(B)(1) Except as otherwise provided in division (B)(2) or	32
(B)(1) Except as otherwise provided in division (B)(2) or (3) of this section, whoever is convicted of or pleads guilty to	32 33
	_
(3) of this section, whoever is convicted of or pleads guilty to	33
(3) of this section, whoever is convicted of or pleads guilty to murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code shall	33 34
(3) of this section, whoever is convicted of or pleads guilty to murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code shall be imprisoned for an indefinite term of fifteen years to life.	33 34 35
<ul><li>(3) of this section, whoever is convicted of or pleads guilty to murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code shall be imprisoned for an indefinite term of fifteen years to life.</li><li>(2) Except as otherwise provided in division (B)(3) of</li></ul>	33 34 35 36
<ul> <li>(3) of this section, whoever is convicted of or pleads guilty to murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code shall be imprisoned for an indefinite term of fifteen years to life.</li> <li>(2) Except as otherwise provided in division (B)(3) of this section, if a person is convicted of or pleads guilty to</li> </ul>	33 34 35 36 37
<ul> <li>(3) of this section, whoever is convicted of or pleads guilty to murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code shall be imprisoned for an indefinite term of fifteen years to life.</li> <li>(2) Except as otherwise provided in division (B)(3) of this section, if a person is convicted of or pleads guilty to murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code, the</li> </ul>	33 34 35 36 37 38
<ul> <li>(3) of this section, whoever is convicted of or pleads guilty to murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code shall be imprisoned for an indefinite term of fifteen years to life.</li> <li>(2) Except as otherwise provided in division (B)(3) of this section, if a person is convicted of or pleads guilty to murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code, the victim of the offense was less than thirteen years of age, and</li> </ul>	33 34 35 36 37 38 39
<ul> <li>(3) of this section, whoever is convicted of or pleads guilty to murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code shall be imprisoned for an indefinite term of fifteen years to life.</li> <li>(2) Except as otherwise provided in division (B) (3) of this section, if a person is convicted of or pleads guilty to murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code, the victim of the offense was less than thirteen years of age, and the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty to a sexual</li> </ul>	33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40

(3) If a person is convicted of or pleads guilty to murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code and also is convicted of or pleads guilty to a sexual motivation

to life pursuant to division (B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the

44

45

46

47

#### H. B. No. 81 As Introduced

specification and a sexually violent predator specification that 49 were included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 50 information that charged the murder, the court shall impose upon 51 the offender a term of life imprisonment without parole that 52 shall be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code. 53

(4) In addition, the offender may be fined an amount fixed by the court, but not more than fifteen thousand dollars.

(C) The court shall not impose a fine or fines for 56 aggravated murder or murder which, in the aggregate and to the 57 extent not suspended by the court, exceeds the amount which the 58 offender is or will be able to pay by the method and within the 59 time allowed without undue hardship to the offender or to the 60 dependents of the offender, or will prevent the offender from 61 making reparation for the victim's wrongful death. 62

(D)(1) In addition to any other sanctions imposed for a 63 violation of section 2903.01 or 2903.02 of the Revised Code, if 64 the offender used a motor vehicle as the means to commit the 65 violation, the court shall impose upon the offender a class two 66 suspension of the offender's driver's license, commercial 67 driver's license, temporary instruction permit, probationary 68 license, or nonresident operating privilege as specified in 69 division (A)(2) of section 4510.02 of the Revised Code. 70

(2) As used in division (D) of this section, "motor 71vehicle" has the same meaning as in section 4501.01 of the 72Revised Code. 73

Sec. 2929.022. (A) If an indictment or count in an 74 indictment charging a defendant with aggravated murder contains 75 a specification of the aggravating circumstance of a prior 76 conviction listed in division (A) (5) of section 2929.04 of the 77

Page 3

54

Revised Code, the defendant may elect to have the panel of three 78 judges, if the defendant waives trial by jury, or the trial 79 judge, if the defendant is tried by jury, determine the 80 existence of that aggravating circumstance at the sentencing 81 hearing held pursuant to divisions (C) and (D) of section 82 2929.03 of the Revised Code. 83

(1) If the defendant does not elect to have the existence 84 of the aggravating circumstance determined at the sentencing 85 hearing, the defendant shall be tried on the charge of 86 aggravated murder, on the specification of the aggravating 87 circumstance of a prior conviction listed in division (A) (5) of 88 section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, and on any other 89 specifications of an aggravating circumstance listed in division 90 (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code in a single trial as 91 in any other criminal case in which a person is charged with 92 aggravated murder and specifications. 93

(2) If the defendant does elect to have the existence of
94
the aggravating circumstance of a prior conviction listed in
95
division (A) (5) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code
96
determined at the sentencing hearing, then, following a verdict
97
of guilty of the charge of aggravated murder, the panel of three
98
judges or the trial judge shall:

(a) Hold a sentencing hearing pursuant to division (B) of 100
this section, unless required to do otherwise under division (A) 101
(2) (b) of this section; 102

(b) If the offender raises the matter of age at trial103pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code and is not104found at trial to have been eighteen years of age or older at105the time of the commission of the offense or raises the matter106of the offender's serious mental illness at the time of the107

alleged commission of the offense pursuant to section 2929.025	108
of the Revised Code and is found under that section to be	109
ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental	110
illness, conduct a hearing to determine if the specification of	111
the aggravating circumstance of a prior conviction listed in	112
division (A)(5) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code is proven	113
beyond a reasonable doubt. After conducting the hearing, the	114
panel or judge shall proceed as follows:	115
(i) If that aggravating circumstance is proven beyond a	116
reasonable doubt or if the defendant at trial was convicted of	117
any other specification of an aggravating circumstance, the	118
panel or judge shall impose sentence according to division (E)	119
of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code.	120
(ii) If that aggravating circumstance is not proven beyond	121
a reasonable doubt and the defendant at trial was not convicted	122
of any other specification of an aggravating circumstance,	123
except as otherwise provided in this division, the panel or	124
judge shall impose sentence of life imprisonment with parole	125
eligibility after serving twenty years of imprisonment on the	126
offender. If that aggravating circumstance is not proven beyond	127
a reasonable doubt, the defendant at trial was not convicted of	128
any other specification of an aggravating circumstance, the	129
victim of the aggravated murder was less than thirteen years of	130
age, and the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty to a	131
sexual motivation specification that was included in the	132
indictment, count in the indictment, or information charging the	133
offense, the panel or judge shall sentence the offender pursuant	134
to division (B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an	135
indefinite term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and	136
a maximum term of life imprisonment.	137

#### H. B. No. 81 As Introduced

(B) At the sentencing hearing, the panel of judges, if the 138 defendant was tried by a panel of three judges, or the trial 139 judge, if the defendant was tried by jury, shall, when required 140 pursuant to division (A)(2) of this section, first determine if 141 the specification of the aggravating circumstance of a prior 142 conviction listed in division (A) (5) of section 2929.04 of the 143 Revised Code is proven beyond a reasonable doubt. If the panel 144 of judges or the trial judge determines that the specification 145 of the aggravating circumstance of a prior conviction listed in 146 division (A)(5) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code is proven 147 beyond a reasonable doubt or if they do not determine that the 148 specification is proven beyond a reasonable doubt but the 149 defendant at trial was convicted of a specification of any other 150 aggravating circumstance listed in division (A) of section 151 2929.04 of the Revised Code, the panel of judges or the trial 152judge and trial jury shall impose sentence on the offender 153 pursuant to division (D) of section 2929.03 and section 2929.04 154 of the Revised Code. If the panel of judges or the trial judge 155 does not determine that the specification of the aggravating 156 circumstance of a prior conviction listed in division (A)(5) of 157 section 2929.04 of the Revised Code is proven beyond a 158 reasonable doubt and the defendant at trial was not convicted of 159 any other specification of an aggravating circumstance listed in 160 division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, the panel 161 of judges or the trial judge shall terminate the sentencing 162 hearing and impose sentence on the offender as follows: 163

(1) Subject to division (B) (2) of this section, the panel
or judge shall impose a sentence of life imprisonment with
parole eligibility after serving twenty years of imprisonment on
the offender.

(2) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than 168

thirteen years of age and the offender also is convicted of or 169 pleads quilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 170 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 171 information charging the offense, the panel or judge shall 172 sentence the offender pursuant to division (B)(3) of section 173 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite term consisting of 174 a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life 175 imprisonment. 176

Sec. 2929.024. If (A) In a case described in division (B) 177 of this section, if the court determines that the defendant is 178 indigent and that investigation services, experts, or other 179 services are reasonably necessary for the proper representation 180 of a defendant charged with aggravated murder at trial or at the 181 sentencing hearing, the court shall authorize the defendant's 182 counsel to obtain the necessary services for the defendant, and 183 shall order that payment of the fees and expenses for the 184 necessary services be made in the same manner that payment for 185 appointed counsel is made pursuant to Chapter 120. of the 186 Revised Code. If the court determines that the necessary 187 services had to be obtained prior to court authorization for 188 payment of the fees and expenses for the necessary services, the 189 court may, after the services have been obtained, authorize the 190 defendant's counsel to obtain the necessary services and order 191 that payment of the fees and expenses for the necessary services 192 be made as provided in this section. 193

(B) Division (A) of this section applies in a case in194which either of the following apply:195(1) The court determines that the defendant is indigent.196

(2) The defendant is described in division (C) of section1972929.025 of the Revised Code and raises the matter of the198

defendant's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged	199
commission of the aggravated murder as described in that	200
division.	201
Sec. 2929.025. (A) As used in this section:	202
(1) A person has a "serious mental illness" if both of the	203
following apply with respect to the person, subject to division	204
(A) (2) of this section:	205
(a) The person has been diagnosed as described in division	206
(B) of this section with one or more of the following	207
conditions:	208
(i) Schizophrenia;	209
	209
(ii) Schizoaffective disorder;	210
<u>(iii) Bipolar disorder;</u>	211
<u>(iv) Major depressive disorder;</u>	212
<u>(v) Delusional disorder.</u>	213
(b) At the time of the alleged aggravated murder with	214
	211
which the person is charged, the condition or conditions	-
described in division (A)(1)(a) of this section with which the	216
person has been diagnosed, while not meeting the standard to be	217
found not guilty by reason of insanity as defined in section	218
2901.01 of the Revised Code or the standard to be found	219
incompetent to stand trial as described in division (G) of	220
section 2945.37 of the Revised Code, nevertheless significantly	221
impaired the person's capacity to do one or more of the	222
following:	223
<u>(i) Exercise rational judgment in relation to the person's</u>	224
conduct;	225

(ii) Conform the person's conduct to the requirements of	226
law;	227
(iii) Appreciate the nature, consequences, or wrongfulness	228
of the person's conduct.	229
(2) A disorder manifested primarily by repeated criminal	230
conduct or attributable solely to the acute effects of voluntary	231
use of alcohol or any other drug of abuse does not, standing	232
alone, constitute a "serious mental illness" for purposes of	233
division (A)(1) of this section.	234
(3) "Examiner" means a person who makes an evaluation	235
ordered under division (F)(1) of this section.	236
(4) "Prosecutor" means a prosecuting attorney who has	237
authority to prosecute a charge of aggravated murder that is	238
	230
before the court.	239
(B) The diagnosis of a person with a condition or	240
conditions described in division (A)(1)(a) of this section may	241
be made at any time prior to, on, or after the day of the	242
alleged aggravated murder with which the person is charged or	243
the day on which the person pursuant to division (C) of this	244
section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness	245
at the time of the alleged commission of that aggravated murder.	246
Diagnosis of the condition or conditions after the date of the	247
alleged aggravated murder with which the person is charged does	248
not preclude the person from presenting evidence that the person	249
had a serious mental illness at the time of the alleged	250
commission of that offense or, in the circumstances described in	251
division (C) of this section, from having the benefit of the	252
rebuttable presumption described in that division.	253
(C) A person charged with aggravated murder and one or	254
10, 11 person charged wren aggravated marder and one or	204

more specifications of an aggravating circumstance listed in	255
division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code may, before	256
trial, raise the matter of the person's serious mental illness	257
at the time of the alleged commission of the offense. If a	258
person raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness	259
at the time of the alleged commission of the offense, the court	260
shall order an evaluation of the person in accordance with	261
division (F) of this section and shall hold a pretrial hearing	262
on the matter. The person who raises the matter may present	263
evidence that the person had a serious mental illness at the	264
time of the alleged commission of the offense, and the person	265
has the burden of raising that matter and of going forward with	266
the evidence relating to the diagnosis described in division (A)	267
(1) (a) of this section and the impairment described in division	268
(A)(1)(b) of this section. If the person submits prima facie	269
evidence that the person has been diagnosed with a condition	270
described in division (A)(1)(a) of this section and that the	271
condition existed at the time of the alleged commission of the	272
offense, it shall be rebuttably presumed that the condition	273
significantly impaired the person's capacity at the time of the	274
alleged offense in a manner described in division (A)(1)(b)(i),	275
(ii), or (iii) of this section.	276
(D) If a person described in division (C) of this section	277
raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the	278
time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and	279
submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that	280
the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in	281
division (A)(1)(a) of this section and that the condition	282
existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,	283
the prosecution shall have an opportunity to present evidence to	284

contest the diagnosis, to rebut the presumption that the

<u>illness.</u>

condition, if present, significantly impaired the person's286capacity at the time of the alleged commission of the offense in287a manner described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of288this section, or to both contest the diagnosis and rebut the289presumption. The prosecution has the burden of proving, by a290preponderance of the evidence, that the diagnosis of the291condition described in division (A) (1) (a) of this section that292was made of the person was erroneous or that the condition, if293present, did not significantly impair the person's capacity at294the time of the alleged offense in a manner described in295division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section.297raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the298submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that300the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in301division (A) (1) (a) of this section and that the condition302existed at the time of the alleged commission of the erign finds that303one of the following applies:304(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that306that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the308prisecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence,306that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309prisecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence,306the prosecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence,		
a manner described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of288this section, or to both contest the diagnosis and rebut the289presumption. The prosecution has the burden of proving, by a290preponderance of the evidence, that the diagnosis of the291condition described in division (A) (1) (a) of this section that292was made of the person was erroneous or that the condition, if293present, did not significantly impair the person's capacity at294the time of the alleged offense in a manner described in295division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section.296(E) If a person described in division (B) of this section297raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the298time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and299submits prima facic evidence as described in that division that300the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in301division (A) (1) (a) of this section and that the condition302existed at the time of the alleged commission of the evidence,306that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner301division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	condition, if present, significantly impaired the person's	286
this section, or to both contest the diagnosis and rebut the289presumption. The prosecution has the burden of proving, by a290preponderance of the evidence, that the diagnosis of the291condition described in division (A) (1) (a) of this section that292was made of the person was erroneous or that the condition, if293present, did not significantly impair the person's capacity at294the time of the alleged offense in a manner described in295division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section.296(E) If a person described in division (B) of this section297raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the298time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and299submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that300the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in301division (A) (1) (a) of this section and that the condition302existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,303one of the following applies:304(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that305that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is31	capacity at the time of the alleged commission of the offense in	287
presumption. The prosecution has the burden of proving, by a290preponderance of the evidence, that the diagnosis of the291condition described in division (A) (1) (a) of this section that292was made of the person was erroneous or that the condition, if293present, did not significantly impair the person's capacity at294the time of the alleged offense in a manner described in295division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section.297raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the298time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and299submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that300the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in301division (A) (1) (a) of this section and that the condition302existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,303one of the following applies:304(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that305that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	a manner described in division (A)(1)(b)(i), (ii), or (iii) of	288
preponderance of the evidence, that the diagnosis of the291condition described in division (A) (l) (a) of this section that292was made of the person was erroneous or that the condition, if293present, did not significantly impair the person's capacity at294the time of the alleged offense in a manner described in295division (A) (l) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section.296(E) If a person described in division (B) of this section297raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the298time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and299submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that300the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in301division (A) (l) (a) of this section and that the condition302existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,303one of the following applies:304(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that305that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (l)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310division (A) (l) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	this section, or to both contest the diagnosis and rebut the	289
condition described in division (A) (1) (a) of this section that292was made of the person was erroneous or that the condition, if293present, did not significantly impair the person's capacity at294the time of the alleged offense in a manner described in295division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section.296(E) If a person described in division (B) of this section297raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the298time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and299submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that300the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in301division (A) (1) (a) of this section and that the condition302existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,303one of the following applies:304(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	presumption. The prosecution has the burden of proving, by a	290
was made of the person was erroneous or that the condition, if293present, did not significantly impair the person's capacity at294the time of the alleged offense in a manner described in295division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section.296(E) If a person described in division (B) of this section297raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the298time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and299submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that300the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in301division (A) (1) (a) of this section and that the condition302existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,303one of the following applies:304(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that306that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	preponderance of the evidence, that the diagnosis of the	291
present, did not significantly impair the person's capacity at294the time of the alleged offense in a manner described in295division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section.296(E) If a person described in division (B) of this section297raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the298time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and299submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that300the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in301division (A) (1) (a) of this section and that the condition302existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,303one of the following applies:304(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that305that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	condition described in division (A)(1)(a) of this section that	292
the time of the alleged offense in a manner described in       295         division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section.       296         (E) If a person described in division (B) of this section       297         raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the       298         time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and       299         submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that       300         the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in       301         division (A) (1) (a) of this section and that the condition       302         existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,       303         one of the following applies:       304         (1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that       305         that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)       307         (a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or       308         that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the       309         person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner       310         described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this       311         section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is       312	was made of the person was erroneous or that the condition, if	293
division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section.296(E) If a person described in division (B) of this section297raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the298time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and299submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that300the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in301division (A) (1) (a) of this section and that the condition302existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,303one of the following applies:304(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that305that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	present, did not significantly impair the person's capacity at	294
(E) If a person described in division (B) of this section297raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the298time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and299submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that300the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in301division (A) (1) (a) of this section and that the condition302existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,303one of the following applies:304(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that305the prosecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence,306that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	the time of the alleged offense in a manner described in	295
raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the298time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and299submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that300the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in301division (A) (1) (a) of this section and that the condition302existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,303one of the following applies:304(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that305the prosecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence,306that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	division (A)(1)(b)(i), (ii), or (iii) of this section.	296
time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and299submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that300the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in301division (A) (1) (a) of this section and that the condition302existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,303one of the following applies:304(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that305the prosecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence,306that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	(E) If a person described in division (B) of this section	297
submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that300the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in301division (A) (1) (a) of this section and that the condition302existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,303one of the following applies:304(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that305the prosecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence,306that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the	298
the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in301division (A) (1) (a) of this section and that the condition302existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,303one of the following applies:304(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that305the prosecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence,306that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and	299
division (A) (1) (a) of this section and that the condition302existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,303one of the following applies:304(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that305the prosecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence,306that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that	300
existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense, one of the following applies:303(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that305the prosecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence, that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in	301
one of the following applies:304(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that305the prosecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence,306that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	division (A)(1)(a) of this section and that the condition	302
(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that305the prosecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence,306that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,	303
the prosecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence,306that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	one of the following applies:	304
the prosecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence,306that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that	305
that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A) (1)307(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312		
(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or308that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312		
that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the309person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312		
person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner310described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312		
described in division (A) (1) (b) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this311section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is312	that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the	309
section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is 312	person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner	310
	described in division (A)(1)(b)(i), (ii), or (iii) of this	311
ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental 313	section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is	312
	ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental	313

(2) If the court at the pretrial hearing finds that the

314

prosecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence, that	316
the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A)(1)(a)	317
of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or	318
that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the	319
person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner	320
described in division (A)(1)(b)(i), (ii), or (iii) of this	321
section, one of the following applies:	322
(a) If the aggravated murder charge is not to be tried by	323
a jury, the court shall issue a finding that the person is not	324
ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental	325
illness.	326
(b) If the aggravated murder charge is to be tried by a	327
jury, the person may request that the matter of serious mental	328
illness be submitted to the jury at trial. If the person does	329
not request that the matter be submitted to the jury, the court	330
shall issue a finding that the person is not ineligible for a	331
sentence of death due to serious mental illness. If the person	332
requests that the matter be submitted to the jury, the matter	333
shall be submitted to the jury at trial, the procedures and	334
rules regarding introduction of evidence and burden of proof at	335
the pretrial hearing that are set forth in divisions (C) and (D)	336
of this section apply, and the person in accordance with those	337
procedures and rules may introduce all relevant evidence,	338
including, but not limited to evidence that is different from or	339
in addition to the evidence introduced at the pretrial hearing.	340
If the matter is submitted to the jury at trial, one of the	341
following applies:	342
(i) Unless the jury finds that the prosecution has proved,	343
by a preponderance of the evidence, that the diagnosis of the	344
condition described in division (A)(1)(a) of this section that	345

was made of the person was erroneous or that the condition, if	346
present, did not significantly impair the person's capacity at	347
the time of the alleged offense in a manner described in	348
division (A)(1)(b)(i), (ii), or (iii) of this section, the court	349
shall issue a finding that the person is ineligible for a	350
sentence of death due to serious mental illness.	351
(ii) If the jury finds that the prosecution has proved, by	352
a preponderance of the evidence, that the diagnosis of the	353
condition described in division (A)(1)(a) of this section that	354
was made of the person was erroneous or that the condition, if	355
present, did not significantly impair the person's capacity at	356
the time of the alleged offense in a manner described in	357
division (A)(1)(b)(i), (ii), or (iii) of this section, the court	358
shall issue a finding that the person is not ineligible for a	359
sentence of death due to serious mental illness.	360
(F)(1) If a person described in division (C) of this	361
(F)(1) If a person described in division (C) of this section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness	361 362
section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness	362
section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder	362 363
section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an	362 363 364
section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code	362 363 364 365
section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code applies with respect to an evaluation ordered under this	362 363 364 365 366
section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code applies with respect to an evaluation ordered under this division.	362 363 364 365 366 367
section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code applies with respect to an evaluation ordered under this division. (2) No statement that a person makes in an evaluation	362 363 364 365 366 367 368
<pre>section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code applies with respect to an evaluation ordered under this division.  (2) No statement that a person makes in an evaluation ordered under division (F)(1) of this section or in a pretrial</pre>	362 363 364 365 366 367 368 369
<pre>section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code applies with respect to an evaluation ordered under this division.</pre> (2) No statement that a person makes in an evaluation ordered under division (F) (1) of this section or in a pretrial hearing or a proceeding before a jury under divisions (C) to (E)	362 363 364 365 366 367 368 369 370
<pre>section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code applies with respect to an evaluation ordered under this division.</pre> (2) No statement that a person makes in an evaluation ordered under division (F) (1) of this section or in a pretrial hearing or a proceeding before a jury under divisions (C) to (E) of this section relating to the person's serious mental illness	362 363 364 365 366 367 368 369 370 371
<pre>section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code applies with respect to an evaluation ordered under this division.</pre> (2) No statement that a person makes in an evaluation ordered under division (F)(1) of this section or in a pretrial hearing or a proceeding before a jury under divisions (C) to (E) of this section relating to the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder	362 363 364 365 366 367 368 369 370 371 371

prosecutor or defense counsel may call as a witness any examiner	376
who evaluated the person or prepared a report pursuant to a	377
referral under this section. Neither the appointment nor the	378
testimony of an examiner in an evaluation ordered under division	379
(F)(1) of this section precludes the prosecutor or defense	380
counsel from calling other witnesses or presenting other	381
evidence on the issue of the person's serious mental illness at	382
the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder or	383
on competency or insanity issues.	384
(G) A person's pleading of not guilty by reason of	385
insanity or incompetence to stand trial, or a finding after such	386
a plea that the person is not insane or that the person is	387
competent to stand trial, does not preclude the person from	388
raising the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the	389
time of the alleged commission of the offense pursuant to	390
division (C) of this section and, if a person so raises that	391
matter, does not limit or affect any of the procedures described	392
in this section or the authority of a court to make any finding	393
described in this section.	394
Sec. 2929.03. (A) If the indictment or count in the	395
indictment charging aggravated murder does not contain one or	396
more specifications of aggravating circumstances listed in	397
division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, then,	398
following a verdict of guilty of the charge of aggravated	399
murder, the trial court shall impose sentence on the offender as	400
follows:	401
(1) Except as provided in division (A)(2) of this section,	402
the trial court shall impose one of the following sentences on	403
the offender:	404
(a) Life imprisonment without parole;	405

(b) Subject to division (A) (1) (e) of this section, life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty years of imprisonment;

(c) Subject to division (A) (1) (e) of this section, life
imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five
full years of imprisonment;
411

(d) Subject to division (A) (1) (e) of this section, life
imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving thirty full
413
years of imprisonment;
414

(e) If the victim of the appravated murder was less than 415 thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or 416 pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 417 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 418 information charging the offense, and the trial court does not 419 impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole on the 420 offender pursuant to division (A)(1)(a) of this section, the 421 trial court shall sentence the offender pursuant to division (B) 422 (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite term 423 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 424 of life imprisonment that shall be served pursuant to that 425 section. 426

(2) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty
427
to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent
428
predator specification that are included in the indictment,
429
count in the indictment, or information that charged the
430
aggravated murder, the trial court shall impose upon the
431
offender a sentence of life imprisonment without parole that
432
shall be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.

(B) If the indictment or count in the indictment charging 434

406

407

aggravated murder contains one or more specifications of 435 aggravating circumstances listed in division (A) of section 436 2929.04 of the Revised Code, the verdict shall separately state 437 whether all of the following: 438 (1) Whether the accused is found guilty or not guilty of 439 440 the principal charge and, if; 441 (2) If guilty of the principal charge, whether the offender was eighteen years of age or older at the time of the 442 commission of the offense $\tau$  if the matter of age was raised by 443 the offender pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code, 444 445 and whether; (3) If quilty of the principal charge, whether the 446 offender was found under section 2929.025 of the Revised Code to 447 be ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental 448 illness if the matter of serious mental illness at the time of 449 450 the commission of the offense was raised by the offender pursuant to that section; 451 (4) If guilty of the principal charge, whether the 452 offender is guilty or not guilty of each specification. The 453 The jury shall be instructed on its duties in this regard. 454 The instruction to the jury shall include an instruction that a 455

specification shall be proved beyond a reasonable doubt in order456to support a guilty verdict on the specification, but the457instruction shall not mention the penalty that may be the458consequence of a guilty or not guilty verdict on any charge or459specification.460

(C) (1) If the indictment or count in the indictment
461
charging aggravated murder contains one or more specifications
462
of aggravating circumstances listed in division (A) of section
463

2929.04 of the Revised Code, then, following a verdict of guilty 464 of the charge but not guilty of each of the specifications, and 465 regardless of whether the offender raised the matter of age 466 pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code or the matter 467 of serious mental illness at the time of the commission of the 468 offense pursuant to section 2929.025 of the Revised Code, the 469 470 trial court shall impose sentence on the offender as follows: (a) Except as provided in division (C) (1) (b) of this 471 section, the trial court shall impose one of the following 472 sentences on the offender: 473 (i) Life imprisonment without parole; 474 (ii) Subject to division (C)(1)(a)(v) of this section, 475 life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty 476 years of imprisonment; 477 (iii) Subject to division (C)(1)(a)(v) of this section, 478 life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-479 five full years of imprisonment; 480 (iv) Subject to division (C)(1)(a)(v) of this section, 481 life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving thirty 482 full years of imprisonment; 483 484 (v) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or 485 pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 486 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 487 information charging the offense, and the trial court does not 488 impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole on the 489 offender pursuant to division (C)(1)(a)(i) of this section, the 490 trial court shall sentence the offender pursuant to division (B) 491 (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite term 492

consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 493 of life imprisonment. 494 (b) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads quilty 495 to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent 496 predator specification that are included in the indictment, 497 count in the indictment, or information that charged the 498 aggravated murder, the trial court shall impose upon the 499 500 offender a sentence of life imprisonment without parole that shall be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code. 501 (2) (a) If the indictment or count in the indictment 502 contains one or more specifications of aggravating circumstances 503 listed in division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code 504 and if the offender is found quilty of both the charge and one 505 or more of the specifications, the penalty to be imposed on the 506 offender shall be one of the following: 507 (i) Except as provided in division (C)(2)(a)(ii) or (iii), 508 and subject to divisions (D)(1) and (E) of this section, the 509 penalty to be imposed on the offender shall be death, life 510 imprisonment without parole, life imprisonment with parole 511 eligibility after serving twenty-five full years of 512 imprisonment, or life imprisonment with parole eligibility after 513

(ii) Except as provided in division (C)(2)(a)(iii) of this 515 section, if the victim of the aggravated murder was less than 516 thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or 517 pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 518 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 519 information charging the offense, and the trial court does not 520 impose a sentence of death or life imprisonment without parole 521 on the offender pursuant to division (C) (2) (a) (i) of this 522

serving thirty full years of imprisonment.

Page 18

section, the penalty to be imposed on the offender shall be an 523 indefinite term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and 524 a maximum term of life imprisonment that shall be imposed 525 pursuant to division (B) (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised 526 Code and served pursuant to that section. 527

(iii) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads
guilty to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually
violent predator specification that are included in the
indictment, count in the indictment, or information that charged
the aggravated murder, the penalty to be imposed on the offender
shall be death or life imprisonment without parole that shall be
sarved pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.

(b) A penalty imposed pursuant to division (C) (2) (a) (i),
(ii), or (iii) of this section shall be determined pursuant to
536
divisions (D) and (E) of this section and shall be determined by
537
one of the following:

(i) By the panel of three judges that tried the offender upon the offender's waiver of the right to trial by jury;

(ii) By the trial jury and the trial judge, if theoffender was tried by jury.542

(D) (1) Death may not be imposed as a penalty for 543 aggravated murder if the offender raised the matter of age at 544 trial pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code and was 545 not found at trial to have been eighteen years of age or older 546 at the time of the commission of the offense or raised the 547 matter of the offender's serious mental illness at the time of 548 the commission of the offense pursuant to section 2929.025 of 549 the Revised Code and was found under that section to be 550 ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental 551

539

#### H. B. No. 81 As Introduced

<u>illness</u>. When death may be imposed as a penalty for aggravated 552 murder, the court shall proceed under this division. When death 553 may be imposed as a penalty, the court, upon the request of the 554 defendant, shall require a pre-sentence investigation to be made 555 and, upon the request of the defendant, shall require a mental 556 examination to be made, and shall require reports of the 557 investigation and of any mental examination submitted to the 558 court, pursuant to section 2947.06 of the Revised Code. No 559 statement made or information provided by a defendant in a 560 mental examination or proceeding conducted pursuant to this 561 division shall be disclosed to any person, except as provided in 562 this division, or be used in evidence against the defendant on 563 the issue of guilt in any retrial. A pre-sentence investigation 564 or mental examination shall not be made except upon request of 565 the defendant. Copies of any reports prepared under this 566 division shall be furnished to the court, to the trial jury if 567 the offender was tried by a jury, to the prosecutor, and to the 568 offender or the offender's counsel for use under this division. 569 The court, and the trial jury if the offender was tried by a 570 jury, shall consider any report prepared pursuant to this 571 division and furnished to it and any evidence raised at trial 572 that is relevant to the aggravating circumstances the offender 573 was found guilty of committing or to any factors in mitigation 574 of the imposition of the sentence of death, shall hear testimony 575 and other evidence that is relevant to the nature and 576 circumstances of the aggravating circumstances the offender was 577 found quilty of committing, the mitigating factors set forth in 578 division (B) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, and any 579 other factors in mitigation of the imposition of the sentence of 580 death, and shall hear the statement, if any, of the offender, 581 and the arguments, if any, of counsel for the defense and 582 583 prosecution, that are relevant to the penalty that should be

imposed on the offender. The defendant shall be given great 584 latitude in the presentation of evidence of the mitigating 585 factors set forth in division (B) of section 2929.04 of the 586 Revised Code and of any other factors in mitigation of the 587 imposition of the sentence of death. If the offender chooses to 588 make a statement, the offender is subject to cross-examination 589 590 only if the offender consents to make the statement under oath or affirmation. 591

The defendant shall have the burden of going forward with the evidence of any factors in mitigation of the imposition of the sentence of death. The prosecution shall have the burden of proving, by proof beyond a reasonable doubt, that the aggravating circumstances the defendant was found guilty of committing are sufficient to outweigh the factors in mitigation of the imposition of the sentence of death.

(2) Upon consideration of the relevant evidence raised at 599 trial, the testimony, other evidence, statement of the offender, 600 arguments of counsel, and, if applicable, the reports submitted 601 pursuant to division (D)(1) of this section, the trial jury, if 602 the offender was tried by a jury, shall determine whether the 603 604 aggravating circumstances the offender was found guilty of committing are sufficient to outweigh the mitigating factors 605 present in the case. If the trial jury unanimously finds, by 606 proof beyond a reasonable doubt, that the aggravating 607 circumstances the offender was found guilty of committing 608 outweigh the mitigating factors, the trial jury shall recommend 609 to the court that the sentence of death be imposed on the 610 offender. Absent such a finding, the jury shall recommend that 611 the offender be sentenced to one of the following: 612

(a) Except as provided in division (D)(2)(b) or (c) of

592

593

594

595

596

597

598

this section, to life imprisonment without parole, life614imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five615full years of imprisonment, or life imprisonment with parole616eligibility after serving thirty full years of imprisonment;617

(b) Except as provided in division (D)(2)(c) of this 618 section, if the victim of the aggravated murder was less than 619 thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or 620 pleads quilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 621 622 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or information charging the offense, and the jury does not 623 624 recommend a sentence of life imprisonment without parole pursuant to division (D)(2)(a) of this section, to an indefinite 625 term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum 626 term of life imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (B) 627 (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code and served pursuant 628 to that section. 629

(c) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty
to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent
for specification that are included in the indictment,
count in the indictment, or information that charged the
aggravated murder, to life imprisonment without parole.

If the trial jury recommends that the offender be 635 sentenced to life imprisonment without parole, life imprisonment 636 with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five full years of 637 imprisonment, life imprisonment with parole eligibility after 638 serving thirty full years of imprisonment, or an indefinite term 639 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 640 of life imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (B)(3) 641 of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code, the court shall impose 642 the sentence recommended by the jury upon the offender. If the 643

sentence is an indefinite term consisting of a minimum term of 644 thirty years and a maximum term of life imprisonment imposed as 645 described in division (D)(2)(b) of this section or a sentence of 646 life imprisonment without parole imposed under division (D)(2) 647 (c) of this section, the sentence shall be served pursuant to 648 section 2971.03 of the Revised Code. If the trial jury 649 recommends that the sentence of death be imposed upon the 650 offender, the court shall proceed to impose sentence pursuant to 651 division (D)(3) of this section. 652

(3) Upon consideration of the relevant evidence raised at 653 trial, the testimony, other evidence, statement of the offender, 654 arguments of counsel, and, if applicable, the reports submitted 655 to the court pursuant to division (D)(1) of this section, if, 656 after receiving pursuant to division (D) (2) of this section the 657 trial jury's recommendation that the sentence of death be 658 imposed, the court finds, by proof beyond a reasonable doubt, or 659 if the panel of three judges unanimously finds, by proof beyond 660 a reasonable doubt, that the appravating circumstances the 661 offender was found guilty of committing outweigh the mitigating 662 factors, it shall impose sentence of death on the offender. 663 Absent such a finding by the court or panel, the court or the 664 panel shall impose one of the following sentences on the 665 offender: 666

(a) Except as provided in division (D) (3) (b) of thissection, one of the following:668

(i) Life imprisonment without parole; 669

(ii) Subject to division (D) (3) (a) (iv) of this section,
life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twentyfive full years of imprisonment;
672

(iii) Subject to division (D) (3) (a) (iv) of this section,
life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving thirty
full years of imprisonment;
675

(iv) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than 676 thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or 677 pleads quilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 678 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 679 information charging the offense, and the trial court does not 680 impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole on the 681 682 offender pursuant to division (D)(3)(a)(i) of this section, the court or panel shall sentence the offender pursuant to division 683 (B) (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite 684 term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum 685 term of life imprisonment. 686

(b) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent predator specification that are included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or information that charged the aggravated murder, life imprisonment without parole that shall be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.

(E) If the offender raised the matter of age at trial-693 pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code, was convicted 694 of aggravated murder and one or more specifications of an 695 aggravating circumstance listed in division (A) of section 696 2929.04 of the Revised Code, and if the offender either raised 697 the matter of age at trial pursuant to section 2929.023 of the 698 <u>Revised Code</u> and was not found at trial to have been eighteen 699 years of age or older at the time of the commission of the 700 offense or raised the matter of the offender's serious mental 701 illness at the time of the commission of the offense pursuant to 702

Page 24

687

688

689

690

691

section 2929.025 of the Revised Code and was found under that	703
section to be ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious	704
mental illness, the court or the panel of three judges shall not	705
impose a sentence of death on the offender. Instead, the court	706
or panel shall impose one of the following sentences on the	707
offender:	708
(1) Except as provided in division (E)(2) of this section,	709
one of the following:	710
(a) Life imprisonment without parole;	711
(b) Subject to division (E) <del>(2)(1)</del> (d) of this section, life	712
imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five	713
full years of imprisonment;	714
(c) Subject to division (E) <del>(2)<u>(</u>1)</del> (d) of this section, life	715
imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving thirty full	716
years of imprisonment;	717
(d) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than	718
thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or	719
pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was	720
included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or	721
information charging the offense, and the trial court does not	722
impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole on the	723
offender pursuant to division (E) $\frac{(2)(1)}{(2)}$ (a) of this section, the	724
court or panel shall sentence the offender pursuant to division	725
(B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite	726
term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum	727
term of life imprisonment.	728
(2) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty	729
to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent	730

predator specification that are included in the indictment,

count in the indictment, or information that charged the732aggravated murder, life imprisonment without parole that shall733be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.734

(F) The court or the panel of three judges, when it 735 imposes sentence of death, shall state in a separate opinion its 736 specific findings as to the existence of any of the mitigating 737 factors set forth in division (B) of section 2929.04 of the 738 Revised Code, the existence of any other mitigating factors, the 739 aggravating circumstances the offender was found guilty of 740 741 committing, and the reasons why the aggravating circumstances the offender was found guilty of committing were sufficient to 742 outweigh the mitigating factors. The court or panel, when it 743 imposes life imprisonment or an indefinite term consisting of a 744 minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life 745 imprisonment under division (D) of this section, shall state in 746 a separate opinion its specific findings of which of the 747 mitigating factors set forth in division (B) of section 2929.04 748 of the Revised Code it found to exist, what other mitigating 749 factors it found to exist, what appravating circumstances the 750 offender was found guilty of committing, and why it could not 751 find that these aggravating circumstances were sufficient to 752 outweigh the mitigating factors. For cases in which a sentence 753 of death is imposed for an offense committed before January 1, 754 1995, the court or panel shall file the opinion required to be 755 prepared by this division with the clerk of the appropriate 756 court of appeals and with the clerk of the supreme court within 757 fifteen days after the court or panel imposes sentence. For 758 cases in which a sentence of death is imposed for an offense 759 committed on or after January 1, 1995, the court or panel shall 760 file the opinion required to be prepared by this division with 761 the clerk of the supreme court within fifteen days after the 762

court or panel imposes sentence. The judgment in a case in which763a sentencing hearing is held pursuant to this section is not764final until the opinion is filed.765

(G) (1) Whenever the court or a panel of three judges 766
imposes a sentence of death for an offense committed before 767
January 1, 1995, the clerk of the court in which the judgment is 768
rendered shall make and retain a copy of the entire record in 769
the case, and shall deliver the original of the entire record in 770
the case to the appellate court. 771

(2) Whenever the court or a panel of three judges imposes
a sentence of death for an offense committed on or after January
1, 1995, the clerk of the court in which the judgment is
774
rendered shall make and retain a copy of the entire record in
775
the case, and shall deliver the original of the entire record in
776
the case to the supreme court.

Sec. 2929.04. (A) Imposition of the death penalty for 778 aggravated murder is precluded unless one or more of the 779 following is specified in the indictment or count in the 780 indictment pursuant to section 2941.14 of the Revised Code and 781 proved beyond a reasonable doubt: 782

(1) The offense was the assassination of the president of 783 the United States or a person in line of succession to the 784 presidency, the governor or lieutenant governor of this state, 785 the president-elect or vice president-elect of the United 786 States, the governor-elect or lieutenant governor-elect of this 787 state, or a candidate for any of the offices described in this 788 division. For purposes of this division, a person is a candidate 789 if the person has been nominated for election according to law, 790 if the person has filed a petition or petitions according to law 791 to have the person's name placed on the ballot in a primary or 792

general election, or if the person campaigns as a write-in 793 candidate in a primary or general election. 794 (2) The offense was committed for hire. 795 (3) The offense was committed for the purpose of escaping 796 detection, apprehension, trial, or punishment for another 797 offense committed by the offender. 798 (4) The offense was committed while the offender was under 799 detention or while the offender was at large after having broken 800 detention. As used in division (A)(4) of this section, 801 "detention" has the same meaning as in section 2921.01 of the 802 803 Revised Code, except that detention does not include hospitalization, institutionalization, or confinement in a 804 mental health facility or intellectual disabilities facility 805 unless at the time of the commission of the offense either of 806 the following circumstances apply: 807 (a) The offender was in the facility as a result of being 808 charged with a violation of a section of the Revised Code. 809 (b) The offender was under detention as a result of being 810 convicted of or pleading quilty to a violation of a section of 811 the Revised Code. 812 (5) Prior to the offense at bar, the offender was 813 convicted of an offense an essential element of which was the 814

purposeful killing of or attempt to kill another, or the offense815at bar was part of a course of conduct involving the purposeful816killing of or attempt to kill two or more persons by the817offender.818

(6) The victim of the offense was a law enforcement
819
officer, as defined in section 2911.01 of the Revised Code, whom
820
the offender had reasonable cause to know or knew to be a law
821

enforcement officer as so defined, and either the victim, at the822time of the commission of the offense, was engaged in the823victim's duties, or it was the offender's specific purpose to824kill a law enforcement officer as so defined.825

(7) The offense was committed while the offender was 826 committing, attempting to commit, or fleeing immediately after 827 committing or attempting to commit kidnapping, rape, aggravated 828 arson, aggravated robbery, or aggravated burglary, and either 829 the offender was the principal offender in the commission of the 830 aggravated murder or, if not the principal offender, committed 831 the aggravated murder with prior calculation and design. 826

(8) The victim of the appravated murder was a witness to 833 an offense who was purposely killed to prevent the victim's 834 testimony in any criminal proceeding and the aggravated murder 835 was not committed during the commission, attempted commission, 836 or flight immediately after the commission or attempted 837 commission of the offense to which the victim was a witness, or 838 the victim of the aggravated murder was a witness to an offense 839 and was purposely killed in retaliation for the victim's 840 testimony in any criminal proceeding. 841

(9) The offender, in the commission of the offense,
purposefully caused the death of another who was under thirteen
843
years of age at the time of the commission of the offense, and
844
either the offender was the principal offender in the commission
845
of the offense or, if not the principal offender, committed the
846
offense with prior calculation and design.

(10) The offense was committed while the offender was
committing, attempting to commit, or fleeing immediately after
committing or attempting to commit terrorism.
850

(B) If one or more of the aggravating circumstances listed	851
in division (A) of this section is specified in the indictment	852
or count in the indictment and proved beyond a reasonable doubt,	853
and if the offender did not raise the matter of age pursuant to	854
section 2929.023 of the Revised Code or $rac{ ext{if}}{ ext{the offender}_{ au}}$ after	855
raising <del>the <u>that</u> matter of age,</del> was found at trial to have been	856
eighteen years of age or older at the time of the commission of	857
the offense, and if the offender did not raise the matter of the	858
offender's serious mental illness at the time of the commission	859
of the offense pursuant to section 2929.025 of the Revised Code	860
or the offender after raising that matter was found by the court	861
to not be ineligible for a sentence of death, the court, trial	862
jury, or panel of three judges shall consider, and weigh against	863
the aggravating circumstances proved beyond a reasonable doubt,	864
the nature and circumstances of the offense, the history,	865
character, and background of the offender, and all of the	866
following factors:	867
(1) Whether the victim of the offense induced or	868
facilitated it;	869
	000
(2) Whether it is unlikely that the offense would have	870
been committed, but for the fact that the offender was under	871
duress, coercion, or strong provocation;	872
(3) Whether, at the time of committing the offense, the	873
offender, because of a mental disease or defect, lacked	874
offender, because of a mental disease or defect, lacked substantial capacity to appreciate the criminality of the	874 875
substantial capacity to appreciate the criminality of the	875
substantial capacity to appreciate the criminality of the offender's conduct or to conform the offender's conduct to the	875 876

criminal convictions and delinquency adjudications;

(6) If the offender was a participant in the offense but 881 not the principal offender, the degree of the offender's 882 participation in the offense and the degree of the offender's 883 participation in the acts that led to the death of the victim; 884

(7) Any other factors that are relevant to the issue of whether the offender should be sentenced to death. 886

(C) The defendant shall be given great latitude in the 887 presentation of evidence of the factors listed in division (B) 888 of this section and of any other factors in mitigation of the 889 imposition of the sentence of death. 890

The existence of any of the mitigating factors listed in division (B) of this section does not preclude the imposition of a sentence of death on the offender but shall be weighed pursuant to divisions (D)(2) and (3) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code by the trial court, trial jury, or the panel of three judges against the aggravating circumstances the offender was found guilty of committing.

Sec. 2929.06. (A) (1) If a sentence of death imposed upon 898 an offender is set aside, nullified, or vacated because the, or 899 voided for any of the following reasons, the trial court that 900 sentenced the offender shall conduct a hearing to resentence the 901 offender in accordance with division (A) (2) of this section: 902

(a) The court of appeals, in a case in which a sentence of 903 death was imposed for an offense committed before January 1, 904 1995, or the supreme court, in cases a case in which the supreme 905 court reviews the sentence upon appeal, could not affirm the 906 sentence of death under the standards imposed by section 2929.05 907 of the Revised Code, is set aside, nullified, or vacated for 908

880

885

891

892

893

894

895

Page 32

#### the.

(b) The sole reason that the statutory procedure for910imposing the sentence of death that is set forth in sections9112929.03 and 2929.04 of the Revised Code is unconstitutional912

(c) The sentence of death is set aside, nullified, or913vacated pursuant to division (C) of section 2929.05 of the914Revised Code, or is set aside, nullified, or vacated because a.915

(d) A court has determined that the offender is a person 916 with an intellectual disability under standards set forth in 917 decisions of the supreme court of this state or the United 918 States supreme court, the trial court that sentenced the 919 offender shall conduct a hearing to resentence the offender. 920

(e) The sentence of death is voided by a court pursuant to921division (G) of section 2953.21 of the Revised Code.922

(2) At the a resentencing hearing conducted under division 923 (A) (1) of this section, the court shall impose upon the offender 924 a sentence of life imprisonment or an indefinite term consisting 925 of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life 926 imprisonment that is determined as specified in this division. 927 If division (D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code, at the 928 time the offender committed the aggravated murder for which the 929 sentence of death was imposed, required the imposition when a 930 sentence of death was not imposed of a sentence of life 931 imprisonment without parole or a sentence of an indefinite term 932 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 933 of life imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (A) or 934 (B) (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code and served 935 pursuant to that section, the court shall impose the sentence so 936 required. In all other cases, the sentences of life imprisonment 937

that are available at the hearing, and from which the court 938 shall impose sentence, shall be the same sentences of life 939 imprisonment that were available under division (D) of section 940 2929.03 or under section 2909.24 of the Revised Code at the time 941 the offender committed the offense for which the sentence of 942 death was imposed. Nothing in this division regarding the 943 resentencing of an offender shall affect the operation of 944 section 2971.03 of the Revised Code. 945

946 (B) Whenever any court of this state or any federal court sets aside, nullifies, or vacates a sentence of death imposed 947 upon an offender because of error that occurred in the 948 sentencing phase of the trial and if division (A) of this 949 950 section does not apply, the trial court that sentenced the offender shall conduct a new hearing to resentence the offender. 951 If the offender was tried by a jury, the trial court shall 952 impanel a new jury for the hearing. If the offender was tried by 953 a panel of three judges, that panel or, if necessary, a new 954 panel of three judges shall conduct the hearing. At the hearing, 955 the court or panel shall follow the procedure set forth in 956 division (D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code in 957 958 determining whether to impose upon the offender a sentence of death, a sentence of life imprisonment, or an indefinite term 959 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 960 of life imprisonment. If, pursuant to that procedure, the court 961 or panel determines that it will impose a sentence other than a 962 sentence of death, the court or panel shall impose upon the 963 offender one of the sentences of life imprisonment that could 964 have been imposed at the time the offender committed the offense 965 for which the sentence of death was imposed, determined as 966 specified in this division, or an indefinite term consisting of 967 a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life 968

#### H. B. No. 81 As Introduced

imprisonment that is determined as specified in this division. 969 If division (D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code, at the 970 time the offender committed the aggravated murder for which the 971 sentence of death was imposed, required the imposition when a 972 sentence of death was not imposed of a sentence of life 973 imprisonment without parole or a sentence of an indefinite term 974 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 975 of life imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (A) or 976 (B) (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code and served 977 pursuant to that section, the court or panel shall impose the 978 sentence so required. In all other cases, the sentences of life 979 imprisonment that are available at the hearing, and from which 980 the court or panel shall impose sentence, shall be the same 981 sentences of life imprisonment that were available under 982 division (D) of section 2929.03 or under section 2909.24 of the 983 Revised Code at the time the offender committed the offense for 984 which the sentence of death was imposed. 985

(C) If a sentence of life imprisonment without parole 986 imposed upon an offender pursuant to section 2929.021 or 2929.03 987 of the Revised Code is set aside, nullified, or vacated for the 988 sole reason that the statutory procedure for imposing the 989 sentence of life imprisonment without parole that is set forth 990 in sections 2929.03 and 2929.04 of the Revised Code is 991 unconstitutional, the trial court that sentenced the offender 992 shall conduct a hearing to resentence the offender to life 993 imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five 994 full years of imprisonment or to life imprisonment with parole 995 eligibility after serving thirty full years of imprisonment. 996

(D) Nothing in this section limits or restricts the rights
997
of the state to appeal any order setting aside, nullifying, or
998
vacating a conviction or sentence of death, when an appeal of
999

that nature otherwise would be available.

(E) This section, as amended by H.B. 184 of the 125th 1001 general assembly, shall apply to all offenders who have been 1002 sentenced to death for an aggravated murder that was committed 1003 on or after October 19, 1981, or for terrorism that was 1004 committed on or after May 15, 2002. This section, as amended by 1005 H.B. 184 of the 125th general assembly, shall apply equally to 1006 all such offenders sentenced to death prior to, on, or after 1007 March 23, 2005, including offenders who, on March 23, 2005, are 1008 challenging their sentence of death and offenders whose sentence of death has been set aside, nullified, or vacated by any court 1010 of this state or any federal court but who, as of March 23, 1011 2005, have not yet been resentenced. 1012

Sec. 2953.21. (A)(1)(a) <u>A person in any of the following</u> 1013 categories may file a petition in the court that imposed 1014 sentence, stating the grounds for relief relied upon, and asking 1015 the court to vacate or set aside the judgment or sentence or to 1016 grant other appropriate relief: 1017

(i) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal 1018 offense or adjudicated a delinquent child and who claims that 1019 there was such a denial or infringement of the person's rights 1020 as to render the judgment void or voidable under the Ohio 1021 Constitution or the Constitution of the United States, any; 1022

(ii) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal 1023 offense and sentenced to death and who claims that there was a 1024 denial or infringement of the person's rights under either of 1025 those Constitutions that creates a reasonable probability of an 1026 altered verdict, and any; 1027

1028 (iii) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal

Page 35

1009

offense that is a felony and who is an offender for whom DNA	1029
testing that was performed under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of	1030
the Revised Code or under former section 2953.82 of the Revised	1031
Code and analyzed in the context of and upon consideration of	1032
all available admissible evidence related to the person's case	1033
as described in division (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised	1034
Code provided results that establish, by clear and convincing	1035
evidence, actual innocence of that felony offense or, if the	1036
person was sentenced to death, establish, by clear and	1037
convincing evidence, actual innocence of the aggravating	1038
circumstance or circumstances the person was found guilty of	1039
committing and that is or are the basis of that sentence of	1040
death, may file a petition in the court that imposed sentence,	1041
stating the grounds for relief relied upon, and asking the court-	1042
to vacate or set aside the judgment or sentence or to grant	1043
other appropriate relief;	1044
(iv) Any person who has been convicted of aggravated	1045
murder and sentenced to death for the offense and who claims	1046
that the person had a serious mental illness at the time of the	1047
commission of the offense and that as a result the court should	1048
render void the sentence of death.	1049
The (b) A petitioner under division (A)(1)(a) of this	1050

<u>section</u> may file a supporting affidavit and other documentary evidence in support of the claim for relief.

 (b) (c)
 As used in division (A) (1) (a) of this section,
 1053

 "actual:
 1054

(i) "Actual innocence" means that, had the results of the1055DNA testing conducted under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of the1056Revised Code or under former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code1057been presented at trial, and had those results been analyzed in1058

1051

the context of and upon consideration of all available 1059 admissible evidence related to the person's case as described in 1060 division (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised Code, no 1061 reasonable factfinder would have found the petitioner guilty of 1062 the offense of which the petitioner was convicted, or, if the 1063 person was sentenced to death, no reasonable factfinder would 1064 have found the petitioner guilty of the aggravating circumstance 1065 or circumstances the petitioner was found guilty of committing 1066 and that is or are the basis of that sentence of death. 1067

## (ii) "Serious mental illness" has the same meaning as in 1068 section 2929.025 of the Revised Code. 1069

(c) (d)As used in divisions (A) (1) (a) and (b) (c) of this1070section, "former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code" means1071section 2953.82 of the Revised Code as it existed prior to July10726, 2010.1073

(d) (e) At any time in conjunction with the filing of a 1074 petition for postconviction relief under division (A) of this 1075 section by a person who has been sentenced to death, or with the 1076 litigation of a petition so filed, the court, for good cause 1077 shown, may authorize the petitioner in seeking the 1078 postconviction relief and the prosecuting attorney of the county 1079 served by the court in defending the proceeding, to take 1080 depositions and to issue subpoenas and subpoenas duces tecum in 1081 accordance with divisions (A) (1)  $\frac{(d)}{(e)}$ , (A) (1)  $\frac{(e)}{(f)}$ , and (C) of 1082 this section, and to any other form of discovery as in a civil 1083 action that the court in its discretion permits. The court may 1084 limit the extent of discovery under this division. In addition 1085 to discovery that is relevant to the claim and was available 1086 under Criminal Rule 16 through conclusion of the original 1087 criminal trial, the court, for good cause shown, may authorize 1088 the petitioner or prosecuting attorney to take depositions and 1089 issue subpoenas and subpoenas duces tecum in either of the 1090 following circumstances: 1091

(i) For any witness who testified at trial or who was 1092 disclosed by the state prior to trial, except as otherwise 1093 provided in this division, the petitioner or prosecuting 1094 attorney shows clear and convincing evidence that the witness is 1095 material and that a deposition of the witness or the issuing of 1096 a subpoena or subpoena duces tecum is of assistance in order to 1097 substantiate or refute the petitioner's claim that there is a 1098 reasonable probability of an altered verdict. This division does 1099 not apply if the witness was unavailable for trial or would not 1100 voluntarily be interviewed by the defendant or prosecuting 1101 attorney. 1102

(ii) For any witness with respect to whom division (A) (1)
(d) (e) (i) of this section does not apply, the petitioner or
prosecuting attorney shows good cause that the witness is
1105
material and that a deposition of the witness or the issuing of
a subpoena or subpoena duces tecum is of assistance in order to
substantiate or refute the petitioner's claim that there is a
reasonable probability of an altered verdict.

 $\frac{(e)}{(f)}$  If a person who has been sentenced to death and who 1110 files a petition for postconviction relief under division (A) of 1111 this section requests postconviction discovery as described in 1112 division (A)(1)(d)(e) of this section or if the prosecuting 1113 attorney of the county served by the court requests 1114 postconviction discovery as described in that division, within 1115 ten days after the docketing of the request, or within any other 1116 time that the court sets for good cause shown, the prosecuting 1117 attorney shall respond by answer or motion to the petitioner's 1118

request or the petitioner shall respond by answer or motion to 1119 the prosecuting attorney's request, whichever is applicable. 1120

(f) (g) If a person who has been sentenced to death and who 1121 files a petition for postconviction relief under division (A) of 1122 this section requests postconviction discovery as described in 1123 division (A) (1) (d) (e) of this section or if the prosecuting 1124 attorney of the county served by the court requests 1125 postconviction discovery as described in that division, upon 1126 motion by the petitioner, the prosecuting attorney, or the 1127 person from whom discovery is sought, and for good cause shown, 1128 the court in which the action is pending may make any order that 1129 justice requires to protect a party or person from oppression or 1130 undue burden or expense, including but not limited to the orders 1131 described in divisions (A)(1)((g)(h)(i) to (viii) of this 1132 section. The court also may make any such order if, in its 1133 discretion, it determines that the discovery sought would be 1134 irrelevant to the claims made in the petition; and if the court 1135 makes any such order on that basis, it shall explain in the 1136 order the reasons why the discovery would be irrelevant. 1137

(g)(h) If a petitioner, prosecuting attorney, or person 1138 from whom discovery is sought makes a motion for an order under 1139 division (A) (1)  $\frac{(f)}{(f)}$  (q) of this section and the order is denied in 1140 whole or in part, the court, on terms and conditions as are 1141 just, may order that any party or person provide or permit 1142 discovery as described in division (A)(1)(d)(e) of this section. 1143 The provisions of Civil Rule 37(A)(4) apply to the award of 1144 expenses incurred in relation to the motion, except that in no 1145 case shall a court require a petitioner who is indigent to pay 1146 expenses under those provisions. 1147

Before any person moves for an order under division (A)(1) 1148

 $\frac{f}{(q)}$  of this section, that person shall make a reasonable 1149 effort to resolve the matter through discussion with the 1150 petitioner or prosecuting attorney seeking discovery. A motion 1151 for an order under division (A) (1)  $\frac{(f)}{(g)}$  (g) of this section shall 1152 be accompanied by a statement reciting the effort made to 1153 resolve the matter in accordance with this paragraph. 1154 The orders that may be made under division (A) (1)  $\frac{(f)}{(g)}$  of 1155 this section include, but are not limited to, any of the 1156 following: 1157 (i) That the discovery not be had; 1158 (ii) That the discovery may be had only on specified terms 1159 and conditions, including a designation of the time or place; 1160 (iii) That the discovery may be had only by a method of 1161 discovery other than that selected by the party seeking 1162 discovery; 1163 (iv) That certain matters not be inquired into or that the 1164 scope of the discovery be limited to certain matters; 1165 (v) That discovery be conducted with no one present except 1166 persons designated by the court; 1167 (vi) That a deposition after being sealed be opened only 1168 by order of the court; 1169 (vii) That a trade secret or other confidential research, 1170 development, or commercial information not be disclosed or be 1171 disclosed only in a designated way; 1172 (viii) That the parties simultaneously file specified 1173

documents or information enclosed in sealed envelopes to be1174opened as directed by the court.1175

## H. B. No. 81 As Introduced

(h)(i)Any postconviction discovery authorized under1176division (A)(1)(d)(e)of this section shall be completed not1177later than eighteen months after the start of the discovery1178proceedings unless, for good cause shown, the court extends that1179period for completing the discovery.1180

(i)(j)Nothing in division (A)(1)(d)(e) of this section1181authorizes, or shall be construed as authorizing, the1182relitigation, or discovery in support of relitigation, of any1183matter barred by the doctrine of res judicata.1184

(j)(k)Division (A)(1) of this section does not apply to1185any person who has been convicted of a criminal offense and1186sentenced to death and who has unsuccessfully raised the same1187claims in a petition for postconviction relief.1188

(2) (a) Except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of 1189 the Revised Code, a petition under division (A)(1)(a)(i), (ii), 1190 or (iii) of this section shall be filed no later than three 1191 hundred sixty-five days after the date on which the trial 1192 transcript is filed in the court of appeals in the direct appeal 1193 of the judgment of conviction or adjudication or, if the direct 1194 appeal involves a sentence of death, the date on which the trial 1195 transcript is filed in the supreme court. If no appeal is taken, 1196 except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of the Revised 1197 Code, the petition shall be filed no later than three hundred 1198 sixty-five days after the expiration of the time for filing the 1199 1200 appeal.

(b) Except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of the1201Revised Code, a petition under division (A) (1) (a) (iv) of this1202section shall be filed not later than three hundred sixty-five1203days after the effective date of this amendment.1204

(3) In a petition filed under division (A) (1) (a) (i), (ii), 1205 or (iii) of this section, a person who has been sentenced to 1206 death may ask the court to render void or voidable the judgment 1207 with respect to the conviction of aggravated murder or the 1208 specification of an aggravating circumstance or the sentence of 1209 death. A person sentenced to death who files a petition under 1210 division (A)(1)(a)(iv) of this section may ask the court to 1211 render void the sentence of death and to order the resentencing 1212 of the person under division (A) of section 2929.06 of the 1213 Revised Code. 1214

(4) A petitioner shall state in the original or amended
petition filed under division (A) of this section all grounds
for relief claimed by the petitioner. Except as provided in
section 2953.23 of the Revised Code, any ground for relief that
is not so stated in the petition is waived.

(5) If the petitioner in a petition filed under division 1220 (A) (1) (a) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section was convicted of or 1221 pleaded guilty to a felony, the petition may include a claim 1222 that the petitioner was denied the equal protection of the laws 1223 in violation of the Ohio Constitution or the United States 1224 Constitution because the sentence imposed upon the petitioner 1225 for the felony was part of a consistent pattern of disparity in 1226 sentencing by the judge who imposed the sentence, with regard to 1227 the petitioner's race, gender, ethnic background, or religion. 1228 If the supreme court adopts a rule requiring a court of common 1229 pleas to maintain information with regard to an offender's race, 1230 gender, ethnic background, or religion, the supporting evidence 1231 for the petition shall include, but shall not be limited to, a 1232 copy of that type of information relative to the petitioner's 1233 sentence and copies of that type of information relative to 1234 sentences that the same judge imposed upon other persons. 1235

(6) Notwithstanding any law or court rule to the contrary, 1236 there is no limit on the number of pages in, or on the length 1237 of, a petition filed under division (A) (1) (a) (i), (ii), (iii), 1238 or (iv) of this section by a person who has been sentenced to 1239 death. If any court rule specifies a limit on the number of 1240 pages in, or on the length of, a petition filed under division 1241 (A) (1) (a) (i), (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this section or on a 1242 prosecuting attorney's response to such a petition by answer or 1243 motion and a person who has been sentenced to death files a 1244 petition that exceeds the limit specified for the petition, the 1245 prosecuting attorney may respond by an answer or motion that 1246 exceeds the limit specified for the response. 1247

(B) The clerk of the court in which the petition for 1248 postconviction relief and, if applicable, a request for 1249 postconviction discovery described in division (A) (1)  $\frac{(d)}{(d)}$  of 1250 this section is filed shall docket the petition and the request 1251 and bring them promptly to the attention of the court. The clerk 1252 of the court in which the petition for postconviction relief 1253 and, if applicable, a request for postconviction discovery 1254 described in division (A)(1)(d)(e) of this section is filed 1255 1256 immediately shall forward a copy of the petition and a copy of the request if filed by the petitioner to the prosecuting 1257 attorney of the county served by the court. If the request for 1258 postconviction discovery is filed by the prosecuting attorney, 1259 the clerk of the court immediately shall forward a copy of the 1260 request to the petitioner or the petitioner's counsel. 1261

(C) If a person who has been sentenced to death and who
files a petition for postconviction relief under division (A) (1)
(a) (i), (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this section requests a
deposition or the prosecuting attorney in the case requests a
deposition, and if the court grants the request under division
1262

(A) (1) (d) (e) of this section, the court shall notify the 1267
petitioner or the petitioner's counsel and the prosecuting 1268
attorney. The deposition shall be conducted pursuant to 1269
divisions (B), (D), and (E) of Criminal Rule 15. Notwithstanding 1270
division (C) of Criminal Rule 15, the petitioner is not entitled 1271
to attend the deposition. The prosecuting attorney shall be 1272
permitted to attend and participate in any deposition. 1273

(D) The court shall consider a petition that is timely 1274 filed under within the period specified in division (A) (2) of 1275 1276 this section even if a direct appeal of the judgment is pending. Before granting a hearing on a petition filed under division (A) 1277 (1) (a) (i), (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this section, the court shall 1278 determine whether there are substantive grounds for relief. In 1279 making such a determination, the court shall consider, in 1280 addition to the petition, the supporting affidavits, and the 1281 documentary evidence, all the files and records pertaining to 1282 the proceedings against the petitioner, including, but not 1283 limited to, the indictment, the court's journal entries, the 1284 journalized records of the clerk of the court, and the court 1285 reporter's transcript. The court reporter's transcript, if 1286 ordered and certified by the court, shall be taxed as court 1287 costs. If the court dismisses the petition, it shall make and 1288 file findings of fact and conclusions of law with respect to 1289 such dismissal. If the petition was filed by a person who has 1290 been sentenced to death, the findings of fact and conclusions of 1291 law shall state specifically the reasons for the dismissal of 1292 the petition and of each claim it contains. 1293

(E) Within ten days after the docketing of the petition,
or within any further time that the court may fix for good cause
shown, the prosecuting attorney shall respond by answer or
motion. Division (A) (6) of this section applies with respect to

the prosecuting attorney's response. Within twenty days from the1298date the issues are raised, either party may move for summary1299judgment. The right to summary judgment shall appear on the face1300of the record.1301

(F) Unless the petition and the files and records of the 1302 case show the petitioner is not entitled to relief, the court 1303 shall proceed to a prompt hearing on the issues even if a direct 1304 appeal of the case is pending. If the court notifies the parties 1305 that it has found grounds for granting relief, either party may 1306 request an appellate court in which a direct appeal of the 1307 judgment is pending to remand the pending case to the court. 1308

With respect to a petition filed under division (A)(1)(a) 1309 (iv) of this section, the procedures and rules regarding 1310 introduction of evidence and burden of proof at the pretrial 1311 hearing that are set forth in divisions (C), (D), and (F) of 1312 section 2929.025 of the Revised Code apply in considering the 1313 petition. With respect to such a petition, the grounds for 1314 granting relief are that the person has been diagnosed with one 1315 or more of the conditions set forth in division (A)(1)(a) of 1316 section 2929.025 of the Revised Code and that, at the time of 1317 the appravated murder that was the basis of the sentence of 1318 death, the condition or conditions significantly impaired the 1319 person's capacity in a manner described in division (A)(1)(b) 1320 (i), (ii), or (iii) of that section. 1321

(G) A petitioner who files a petition under division (A)
(1) (a) (i), (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this section may amend the
petition as follows:

(1) If the petition was filed by a person who has been
1325
sentenced to death, at any time that is not later than one
1326
hundred eighty days after the petition is filed, the petitioner
1327

may amend the petition with or without leave or prejudice to the 1328 proceedings. 1329

(2) If division (G) (1) of this section does not apply, at
any time before the answer or motion is filed, the petitioner
may amend the petition with or without leave or prejudice to the
proceedings.

(3) The petitioner may amend the petition with leave of
court at any time after the expiration of the applicable period
specified in division (G) (1) or (2) of this section.

(H) If the court does not find grounds for granting 1337 relief, it shall make and file findings of fact and conclusions 1338 of law and shall enter judgment denying relief on the petition. 1339 If the petition was filed by a person who has been sentenced to 1340 death, the findings of fact and conclusions of law shall state 1341 specifically the reasons for the denial of relief on the 1342 petition and of each claim it contains. If no direct appeal of 1343 the case is pending and the court finds grounds for relief or if 1344 a pending direct appeal of the case has been remanded to the 1345 court pursuant to a request made pursuant to division (F) of 1346 this section and the court finds grounds for granting relief, it 1347 shall make and file findings of fact and conclusions of law and 1348 shall enter a judgment that vacates and sets aside the judgment 1349 in question, and, in the case of a petitioner who is a prisoner 1350 in custody, except as otherwise described in this division, 1351 shall discharge or resentence the petitioner or grant a new 1352 trial as the court determines appropriate. If the court finds 1353 grounds for relief in the case of a petitioner who filed a 1354 petition under division (A)(1)(a)(iv) of this section, the court 1355 shall render void the sentence of death and order the 1356 resentencing of the offender under division (A) of section 1357

2929.06 of the Revised Code. If the petitioner has been 1358 sentenced to death, the findings of fact and conclusions of law 1359 shall state specifically the reasons for the finding of grounds 1360 for granting the relief, with respect to each claim contained in 1361 the petition. The court also may make supplementary orders to 1362 the relief granted, concerning such matters as rearraignment, 1363 retrial, custody, and bail. If the trial court's order granting 1364 the petition is reversed on appeal and if the direct appeal of 1365 the case has been remanded from an appellate court pursuant to a 1366 request under division (F) of this section, the appellate court 1367 reversing the order granting the petition shall notify the 1368 appellate court in which the direct appeal of the case was 1369 pending at the time of the remand of the reversal and remand of 1370 the trial court's order. Upon the reversal and remand of the 1371 trial court's order granting the petition, regardless of whether 1372 notice is sent or received, the direct appeal of the case that 1373 was remanded is reinstated. 1374

(I) Upon the filing of a petition pursuant to division (A)
(1) (a) (i), (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this section by a person
1376
sentenced to death, only the supreme court may stay execution of
1377
the sentence of death.

(J) (1) If a person sentenced to death intends to file a 1379 petition under this section, the court shall appoint counsel to 1380 represent the person upon a finding that the person is indigent 1381 and that the person either accepts the appointment of counsel or 1382 is unable to make a competent decision whether to accept or 1383 reject the appointment of counsel. The court may decline to 1384 appoint counsel for the person only upon a finding, after a 1385 hearing if necessary, that the person rejects the appointment of 1386 counsel and understands the legal consequences of that decision 1387 or upon a finding that the person is not indigent. 1388

(2) The court shall not appoint as counsel under division 1389 (J) (1) of this section an attorney who represented the 1390 petitioner at trial in the case to which the petition relates 1391 unless the person and the attorney expressly request the 1392 appointment. The court shall appoint as counsel under division 1393 (J) (1) of this section only an attorney who is certified under 1394 Rule 20 of the Rules of Superintendence for the Courts of Ohio 1395 to represent indigent defendants charged with or convicted of an 1396 offense for which the death penalty can be or has been imposed. 1397 The ineffectiveness or incompetence of counsel during 1398 proceedings under this section does not constitute grounds for 1399 relief in a proceeding under this section, in an appeal of any 1400 action under this section, or in an application to reopen a 1401 direct appeal. 1402

(3) Division (J) of this section does not preclude 1403 attorneys who represent the state of Ohio from invoking the 1404 provisions of 28 U.S.C. 154 with respect to capital cases that 1405 were pending in federal habeas corpus proceedings prior to July 1406 1, 1996, insofar as the petitioners in those cases were 1407 represented in proceedings under this section by one or more 1408 counsel appointed by the court under this section or section 1409 120.06, 120.16, 120.26, or 120.33 of the Revised Code and those 1410 appointed counsel meet the requirements of division (J)(2) of 1411 this section. 1412

(K) Subject to the appeal of a sentence for a felony that 1413 is authorized by section 2953.08 of the Revised Code, the remedy 1414 set forth in this section is the exclusive remedy by which a 1415 person may bring a collateral challenge to the validity of a 1416 conviction or sentence in a criminal case or to the validity of 1417 an adjudication of a child as a delinquent child for the 1418 commission of an act that would be a criminal offense if 1419

Page 49

committed by an adult or the validity of a related order of	1420
disposition.	1421
Sec. 2953.23. (A) Whether a hearing is or is not held on a	1422
petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the Revised Code,	1423
a court may not entertain a petition filed after the expiration	1424
of the period prescribed in division (A) of that section or a	1425
	1426
second petition or successive petitions for similar relief on	
behalf of a petitioner unless division (A)(1) or (2) of this	1427
section applies:	1428
(1) Both of the following apply:	1429
(a) Either the petitioner shows that the petitioner was	1430
unavoidably prevented from discovery of the facts upon which the	1431
petitioner must rely to present the claim for relief, or,	1432
subsequent to the period prescribed in division (A)(2) of	1433
section 2953.21 of the Revised Code or to the filing of an	1434
earlier petition, the United States Supreme Court recognized a	1435
new federal or state right that applies retroactively to persons	1436
in the petitioner's situation, and the petition asserts a claim	1437
based on that right.	1438
(b) The petitioner shows by clear and convincing evidence	1439
that, but for constitutional error at trial, no reasonable	1440

that, but for constitutional error at trial, no reasonable1440factfinder would have found the petitioner guilty of the offense1441of which the petitioner was convicted or, if the claim1442challenges a sentence of death that, but for constitutional1443error at the sentencing hearing, no reasonable factfinder would1444have found the petitioner eligible for the death sentence.1445

(2) The petitioner was convicted of a felony, the
petitioner is an offender for whom DNA testing was performed
under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of the Revised Code or under
1448

former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code and analyzed in the 1449 context of and upon consideration of all available admissible 1450 evidence related to the inmate's case as described in division 1451 (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised Code, and the results of 1452 the DNA testing establish, by clear and convincing evidence, 1453 actual innocence of that felony offense or, if the person was 1454 sentenced to death, establish, by clear and convincing evidence, 1455 actual innocence of the aggravating circumstance or 1456 circumstances the person was found quilty of committing and that 1457 is or are the basis of that sentence of death. 1458

As used in this division, "actual innocence" has the same 1459 meaning as in division (A)(1)(b)(c) of section 2953.21 of the 1460 Revised Code, and "former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code" 1461 has the same meaning as in division (A)(1)(c)(d) of section 1462 2953.21 of the Revised Code. 1463

(B) An order awarding or denying relief sought in a 1464
petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the Revised Code 1465
is a final judgment and may be appealed pursuant to Chapter 1466
2953. of the Revised Code. 1467

If a petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the 1468 Revised Code by a person who has been sentenced to death is 1469 denied and the person appeals the judgment, notwithstanding any 1470 law or court rule to the contrary, there is no limit on the 1471 number of pages in, or on the length of, a notice of appeal or 1472 briefs related to an appeal filed by the person. If any court 1473 rule specifies a limit on the number of pages in, or on the 1474 length of, a notice of appeal or briefs described in this 1475 division or on a prosecuting attorney's response or briefs with 1476 respect to such an appeal and a person who has been sentenced to 1477 death files a notice of appeal or briefs that exceed the limit 1478

specified for the petition, the prosecuting attorney may file a	1479
response or briefs that exceed the limit specified for the	1480
answer or briefs.	1481
	1 4 0 0
Section 2. That existing sections 2929.02, 2929.022,	1482
2929.024, 2929.03, 2929.04, 2929.06, 2953.21, and 2953.23 of the	1483
Revised Code are hereby repealed.	1484