# Before <br> The Ohio House <br> Government Oversight Committee 

Testimony Opposing Senate Bill 9
(As to PUCO Regulations Needed for Consumer Protection)

Presented by Bruce Weston<br>Ohio Consumers' Counsel

On Behalf of the<br>Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

December 9, 2021

Hello Chair Wilkin, Vice-Chair White, Ranking Member Brown, and members of the Committee. I hope you and your colleagues are well. As agency director, I am testifying on behalf of the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel for the millions of Ohio residential utility consumers who would be affected by Senate Bill 9. Thank you for this opportunity to testify.

I am providing limited opponent testimony on the Bill, with regard to the Bill's potential for preventing or reducing the regulations needed for protection of utility consumers. Accordingly, for consumer protection, please exempt the PUCO’s regulations from Senate Bill 9. In this regard, I understand that yesterday there was a precedent of the Committee adopting Amendment AM_134_2285 to exempt the Ohio Casino Control Commission from the Bill.

Utilities have a bargain with the government to allow them to operate as monopolies in exchange for government regulation to protect consumers from their monopoly power. Senate Bill 9's potential for preventing or reducing regulations of utility monopolies can break that bargain against the public interest.

Instead of fewer regulations, the public can need more PUCO regulations as utility service issues change or develop over time. Also, new regulations are needed for reforms of PUCO processes that favor utilities. Likewise, many existing PUCO regulations are needed for consumer protection and should not be eliminated under the Bill as a trade for new regulations.

The COVID pandemic has highlighted the essential nature of utility services and the need for consumer protection regulations. Many Ohioans have struggled during this time with a lack of money for utilities, health, food, and housing. There are PUCO regulations, for example, to protect Ohioans from unreasonable disconnections of their utility service. Disconnection of utility service can even be life threatening. There was a tragedy in 2011 when two consumers in Cincinnati died from hypothermia after their electric service was disconnected during cold weather.

The PUCO also conducts limited regulation of some non-monopoly providers of services that are vested with the public interest. An example is the PUCO's oversight of energy marketers. In allowing for electricity marketing, the legislature required the PUCO, in R.C. 4928.10, to adopt rules including "a prohibition against unfair, deceptive, and unconscionable acts and practices in the marketing, solicitation, and sale of such a competitive retail electric service and in the administration of any contract for service, and also shall include additional consumer protections concerning all of the following...." R.C. 4929.22 contains a similar requirement for the PUCO to adopt rules to regulate natural gas marketers.

But just recently (September 8, 2021) the PUCO wrote that it could not propose various additional consumer protection rules regarding energy marketers. The PUCO explained that "[i]n light of R.C. 121.95, only limited amendments are being proposed for this set of five-year rule reviews." The PUCO also noted the constraint in R.C. 121.95(F) that state agencies (including the PUCO) "may not adopt a new regulatory restriction unless it simultaneously removes two or more existing regulatory restrictions." (See Attached PUCO Entry at paragraphs 6 and 7, without Attachments.)

This result where R.C. 121.95 is preventing the PUCO from adopting consumer protection regulations is bad for Ohioans. More regulations are needed to protect consumers. Thus, PUCO regulations should be exempted from Senate Bill 9 and from R.C. 121.95. Alternatively, with regard to energy marketing, the legislature should enact changes to protect Ohio consumers by banning: door-to-door energy sales; automatic renewal of energy contracts; and "teaser" rates (where energy is marketed using a low initial price that soon is replaced with a higher price). Attached is recent "shadow-billing" information from Columbia Gas showing that its consumers have paid energy marketers about two billion dollars more than what Columbia charged for natural gas since 1997.

Additionally, the FirstEnergy and House Bill 6 scandals have shown a need for more regulations. The PUCO should have more (not less) authority, jurisdiction and regulations to investigate utilities, their management and the complicated arrangements with utility affiliates. And there should be more (not less) regulations for safeguards, remedies and penalties involving any misconduct by utilities and the PUCO.

Having said the above, there are some utility regulations that should be eliminated, like those (including the statute) for allowing so-called electric security plans. Electric security plans, especially as implemented by the PUCO, can hinder the competitive market that we support for power plants and can be used to allow utility cherry-picking of charges (so-called riders) that drive up consumers' electric bills. Those regulations have burdened consumers with subsidies, such as to AEP, Duke and AES for uneconomic and polluting OVEC coal plants (before the coal plant subsidies of House Bill 6).

In conclusion, for consumer protection PUCO regulations should be exempted from Senate Bill 9 and current R.C. 121.95. In this regard, I understand that yesterday there was a precedent of the Committee adopting Amendment AM_134_2285 to exempt the Ohio Casino Control Commission from the Bill. Thank you for your consideration.

## THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Commission's
Review of Ohio Adm. Code Chapters 4901:1-21, 4901:1-23, 4901:1-24, 4901:127, 4901:1-28, 4901:1-29, 4901:1-30, 4901:1-31, 4901:1-32, 4901:1-33, AND 4901:1-34 REGARDING RULES Governing Competitive Retail Electric Service and Competitive Retail Natural Gas Service.

CASE Nos. 17-1843-EL-ORD $\begin{array}{r}17-1844-\text {-L-ORD } \\ 17-1862-E L-O R D \\ 17-1845-G A-O R D \\ 17-1846-G A-O R D \\ 17-1847-G A-O R D \\ 17-1848-G A-O R D \\ 17-1849-G A-O R D \\ 17-1850-G A-O R D \\ \text { 17-1851-GA-ORD } \\ \text { 17-1852-GA-ORD }\end{array}$

## ENTRY

Entered in the Journal on September 8, 2021

## I. Summary

\{ $\mathbb{1} \mathbf{1 \}}$ The Commission directs that all interested persons or entities wishing to file comments or reply comments with the Commission regarding the competitive retail electric service and competitive retail natural gas service rules in Ohio Adm.Code Chapters 4901:121, 4901:1-23, 4901:1-24, 4901:1-27, 4901:1-28, 4901:1-29, 4901:1-30, 4901:1-31, 4901:1-32, 4901:1-33, and 4901:1-34 do so no later than October 8, 2021, and October 22, 2021, respectively.

## II. DISCUSSION

\{\| 2$\}$ R.C. $111.15(\mathrm{~B})$ and R.C. $106.03(\mathrm{~A})$ require all state agencies to conduct a review, every five years, of their rules and to determine whether to continue their rules without change, amend their rules, or rescind their rules. At this time, the Commission is reviewing the competitive retail electric service and competitive retail natural gas service (CRNGS) rules in Ohio Adm.Code Chapters 4901:1-21, 4901:1-23, 4901:1-24, 4901:1-27, 4901:1-28, 4901:1-29, 4901:1-30, 4901:1-31, 4901:1-32, 4901:1-33, and 4901:1-34.
$\{\llbracket 3\}$ R.C. 106.03(A) requires that the Commission determine whether the rules:
(a) Should be continued without amendment, be amended, or be rescinded, taking into consideration the purpose, scope, and intent of the statute under which the rules were adopted;
(b) Need amendment or rescission to give more flexibility at the local level;
(c) Need amendment or rescission to eliminate unnecessary paperwork;
(d) Incorporate a text or other material by reference and, if so, whether the citation accompanying the incorporation by reference would reasonably enable the Joint Committee on Agency Rule Review or a reasonable person to whom the rules apply to find and inspect the incorporated text or material readily and without charge and, if the rule has been exempted in whole or in part from R.C. 121.71 to 121.74 because the incorporated text or material has one or more characteristics described in R.C. 121.75(B), whether the incorporated text or material actually has any of those characteristics;
(e) Duplicate, overlap with, or conflict with other rules;
(f) Have an adverse impact on businesses, as determined under R.C. 107.52;
(g) Contain words or phrases having meanings that in contemporary usage are understood as being derogatory or offensive; and
(h) Require liability insurance, a bond, or any other financial responsibility instrument as a condition of licensure.
\{ $\mathbb{T} 4\}$ Additionally, in accordance with R.C. 121.82, in the course of developing draft rules, the Commission must evaluate the rules against the business impact analysis (BIA). If there will be an adverse impact on businesses, as defined in R.C. 107.52, the agency is to incorporate features into the draft rules to eliminate or adequately reduce any adverse impact. Furthermore, the Commission is required, pursuant to R.C. 121.82, to provide the Common Sense Initiative (CSI) office the draft rules and the BIA.
$\{\llbracket 5\}$ On October 3, 2017, the Commission held a workshop in these proceedings to enable interested stakeholders to propose revisions to the rules in Ohio Adm.Code Chapters 4901:1-10, ${ }^{1}$ 4901:1-21, 4901:1-23, 4901:1-24, 4901:1-27, 4901:1-28, 4901:1-29, 4901:1-30, 4901:131, 4901:1-32, 4901:1-33, and 4901:1-34 for the Commission's consideration. Representative of different interested stakeholders attended the workshop, with comments offered by several of the stakeholders.
\{ $\mathbb{\|} 6\}$ According to R.C. 121.95, a state agency, including the Commission, cannot adopt a new regulatory restriction unless it simultaneously removes two or more existing regulatory restrictions.
\{『7] In light of R.C. 121.95, only limited amendments are being proposed for this set of five-year rule reviews.
\{ๆ 8$\}$ Staff has evaluated the rules contained in these chapters. Following its review, Staff recommends the following amendments to the rules:
(a) The amendments found within Ohio Adm.Code Chapter 4901:1-24 and portions of the amendments found within Ohio Adm.Code Chapter 4901:1-27 codify the waivers implemented in the June 3, 2020 Commission Entry issued in Case No. 20-1077-GE-WVR.

[^0](b) The amendments found within Ohio Adm.Code Chapter 4901:1-29 and the remaining portions of amendments found within Ohio Adm.Code Chapter 4901:1-27 reconcile the rule amendments made to Ohio Adm.Code Chapter 4901:1-13 in the most recent five-year rule review cases, Case Nos. 13-2225-GAORD and 19-1429-GA-ORD. These cases consolidated provisions relating to natural gas companies by moving them from the CRNGS rule chapters to the minimum gas service standards chapter, Ohio Adm.Code Chapter 4901:1-13. Accordingly, the proposed amendments remove these certain provisions from the CRNGS rule chapters to avoid duplication.
$\{\boldsymbol{\|} \mathbf{9 \}}$ Attached to this Entry are the proposed amendments to Ohio Adm.Code Chapters 4901:1-21, 4901:1-23, 4901:1-24, 4901:1-27, 4901:1-28, 4901:1-29, 4901:1-30, 4901:131, 4901:1-32, 4901:1-33, and 4901:1-34 (Attachments A, C, E, G, I, K, M, O, Q, S, and U) and the BIAs (Attachments B, D, F, H, J, L, N, P, R, T, and V), which are also posted on the Commission's Docketing Information System (DIS) website at http://dis.puc.state.oh.us. To minimize the expense of these proceedings, the Commission will serve a paper copy of this Entry only. All interested persons are directed either to input one of the case numbers listed in the case caption above into the Case Lookup box in DIS to view the corresponding documents, or to contact the Commission's Docketing Division to request a paper copy.
$\{\mathbb{1} 10\}$ The Commission requests comments from interested persons to assist in the review required by R.C. 111.15 and R.C. 106.03. Comments should be filed, via electronic filing or in hard copy, by October 8, 2021. Reply comments should be filed by October 22, 2021. All interested persons are directed to file their comments in the case dockets for 17-1843-EL-ORD, et al.

## III. ORDER

$\{\llbracket 11\}$ It is, therefore,
\{『 12\} ORDERED, That all interested persons or entities wishing to file comments or reply comments with the Commission regarding the proposed rules do so no later than October 8, 2021, and October 22, 2021, respectively, and file these comments in the case dockets for 17-1843-EL-ORD, et al. It is, further,
\{ๆ13\} ORDERED, That a copy of this Entry, with the rules and the BIAs, be submitted to CSI, in accordance with R.C. 121.82. It is, further,
\{ๆ14\} ORDERED, That a copy of this Entry be sent to the electric-energy and gaspipeline list-serves. It is, further,
\{ $\mathbb{\|} 15\}$ ORDERED, That a copy of this Entry be served upon all investor-owned electric utilities in the state of Ohio, all certified competitive retail electric service providers in the state of Ohio, all regulated gas and natural gas companies, all certified retail natural gas suppliers, the Ohio Consumers' Counsel, the Ohio Gas Association, the Ohio Petroleum Council, the Ohio Oil and Gas Association, and all other interested persons of record.

## COMMISSIONERS:

Approving:
Jenifer French, Chair
M. Beth Trombold

Lawrence K. Friedeman
Dennis P. Deters

MJS/mef

| Month | Res. Savings CAB | Com. Savings CAB | Ind. Savings CAB | Com. Savings GAS | Ind. Savings GAS | Total <br> Monthly Choice Savings | Monthly <br> PIPP <br> Savings | Monthly Savings Including PIPP | Cumulative PIPP Savings | Cumulative Savings (Incl PIPP) | Cumulative Savings (Excl PIPP) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Apr-97 | \$425,351 | \$43,275 | \$0 |  |  | \$468,626 | \$335,000 | \$803,626 | \$335,000 | \$803,626 | \$468,626 |
| May-97 | \$342,846 | \$39,215 | \$0 |  |  | \$382,061 | \$305,627 | \$687,688 | \$640,627 | \$1,491,314 | \$850,687 |
| Jun-97 | \$195,327 | \$28,158 | \$0 |  |  | \$223,485 | \$59,826 | \$283,311 | \$700,453 | \$1,774,625 | \$1,074,172 |
| Jul-97 | \$87,295 | \$19,242 | \$0 |  |  | \$106,537 | \$57,698 | \$164,235 | \$758,151 | \$1,938,860 | \$1,180,709 |
| Aug-97 | \$76,251 | \$11,529 | \$0 |  |  | \$87,780 | \$49,657 | \$137,437 | \$807,808 | \$2,076,297 | \$1,268,489 |
| Sep-97 | \$83,182 | \$12,863 | \$0 |  |  | \$96,045 | \$47,863 | \$143,908 | \$855,671 | \$2,220,205 | \$1,364,534 |
| Oct-97 | \$128,462 | \$13,284 | \$0 |  |  | \$141,746 | \$68,492 | \$210,238 | \$924,163 | \$2,430,443 | \$1,506,280 |
| Nov-97 | \$395,185 | \$39,517 | \$0 |  |  | \$434,702 | \$238,592 | \$673,294 | \$1,162,755 | \$3,103,737 | \$1,940,982 |
| Dec-97 | \$579,381 | \$123,876 | \$0 |  |  | \$703,257 | \$351,824 | \$1,055,081 | \$1,514,579 | \$4,158,818 | \$2,644,239 |
| Jan-98 | \$824,159 | \$263,876 | \$0 |  |  | \$1,088,035 | \$488,246 | \$1,576,281 | \$2,002,825 | \$5,735,099 | \$3,732,274 |
| Feb-98 | \$682,159 | \$154,769 | \$0 |  |  | \$836,928 | \$539,537 | \$1,376,465 | \$2,542,362 | \$7,111,564 | \$4,569,202 |
| Mar-98 | \$595,217 | \$114,732 | \$0 |  |  | \$709,949 | \$516,279 | \$1,226,228 | \$3,058,641 | \$8,337,792 | \$5,279,151 |
| Apr-98 | \$462,581 | \$80,935 | \$0 |  |  | \$543,516 | \$405,279 | \$948,795 | \$3,463,920 | \$9,286,587 | \$5,822,667 |
| May-98 | \$374,279 | \$43,982 | \$0 |  |  | \$418,261 | \$269,582 | \$687,843 | \$3,733,502 | \$9,974,430 | \$6,240,928 |
| Jun-98 | \$197,956 | \$20,984 | \$0 |  |  | \$218,940 | \$125,985 | \$344,925 | \$3,859,487 | \$10,319,355 | \$6,459,868 |
| Jul-98 | \$93,579 | \$14,839 | \$0 |  |  | \$108,418 | \$89,153 | \$197,571 | \$3,948,640 | \$10,516,926 | \$6,568,286 |
| Aug-98 | \$86,279 | \$9,524 | \$0 |  |  | \$95,803 | \$58,426 | \$154,229 | \$4,007,066 | \$10,671,155 | \$6,664,089 |
| Sep-98 | \$83,279 | \$16,842 | \$0 |  |  | \$100,121 | \$67,518 | \$167,639 | \$4,074,584 | \$10,838,794 | \$6,764,210 |
| Oct-98 | \$154,283 | \$123,849 | \$0 |  |  | \$278,132 | \$84,159 | \$362,291 | \$4,158,743 | \$11,201,085 | \$7,042,342 |
| Nov-98 | \$786,924 | \$459,627 | \$0 |  |  | \$1,246,551 | \$241,897 | \$1,488,448 | \$4,400,640 | \$12,689,533 | \$8,288,893 |
| Dec-98 | \$1,248,953 | \$815,476 | \$0 |  |  | \$2,064,429 | \$386,295 | \$2,450,724 | \$4,786,935 | \$15,140,257 | \$10,353,322 |
| Jan-99 | \$2,841,953 | \$1,524,869 | \$0 |  |  | \$4,366,822 | \$595,015 | \$4,961,837 | \$5,381,950 | \$20,102,094 | \$14,720,144 |
| Feb-99 | \$2,692,746 | \$1,362,745 | \$0 |  |  | \$4,055,491 | \$428,931 | \$4,484,422 | \$5,810,881 | \$24,586,516 | \$18,775,635 |
| Mar-99 | \$1,792,549 | \$1,198,257 | \$0 |  |  | \$2,990,806 | \$491,930 | \$3,482,736 | \$6,302,810 | \$28,069,251 | \$21,766,441 |
| Apr-99 | \$1,295,736 | \$992,843 | \$0 |  |  | \$2,288,579 | \$420,001 | \$2,708,580 | \$6,722,811 | \$30,777,831 | \$24,055,020 |
| May-99 | \$35,928 | \$305,672 | \$0 |  |  | \$341,600 | \$171,237 | \$512,837 | \$6,894,048 | \$31,290,668 | \$24,396,620 |
| Jun-99 | -\$6,482 | \$274,958 | \$0 |  |  | \$268,476 | \$94,756 | \$363,232 | \$6,988,804 | \$31,653,900 | \$24,665,096 |
| Jul-99 | -\$5,169 | \$128,965 | \$0 |  |  | \$123,796 | \$67,171 | \$190,967 | \$7,055,974 | \$31,844,866 | \$24,788,892 |
| Aug-99 | \$323,859 | \$216,852 | \$0 |  |  | \$540,711 | \$62,777 | \$603,488 | \$7,118,752 | \$32,448,355 | \$25,329,603 |
| Sep-99 | \$301,528 | \$287,495 | \$0 |  |  | \$589,023 | \$55,638 | \$644,661 | \$7,174,390 | \$33,093,016 | \$25,918,626 |
| Oct-99 | \$547,523 | \$437,053 | \$0 |  |  | \$984,576 | \$113,827 | \$1,098,403 | \$7,288,217 | \$34,191,419 | \$26,903,202 |
| Nov-99 | \$2,924,475 | \$1,350,835 | \$0 |  |  | \$4,275,310 | \$269,173 | \$4,544,483 | \$7,557,390 | \$38,735,902 | \$31,178,512 |
| Dec-99 | \$4,287,950 | \$2,184,202 | \$0 |  |  | \$6,472,152 | \$438,838 | \$6,910,990 | \$7,996,228 | \$45,646,892 | \$37,650,664 |
| Jan-00 | \$5,411,314 | \$2,833,574 | \$24,986 |  |  | \$8,269,874 | \$696,339 | \$8,966,213 | \$8,692,566 | \$54,613,105 | \$45,920,538 |
| Feb-00 | \$2,147,364 | \$1,606,382 | \$0 |  |  | \$3,753,746 | \$699,457 | \$4,453,203 | \$9,392,023 | \$59,066,307 | \$49,674,284 |
| Mar-00 | \$2,227,071 | \$1,501,788 | \$0 |  |  | \$3,728,859 | \$457,115 | \$4,185,974 | \$9,849,138 | \$63,252,281 | \$53,403,143 |
| Apr-00 | \$1,650,460 | \$866,914 | \$11,678 |  |  | \$2,529,053 | \$120,373 | \$2,649,425 | \$9,969,510 | \$65,901,706 | \$55,932,196 |
| May-00 | \$2,044,089 | \$1,000,117 | \$13,276 |  |  | \$3,057,481 | \$150,316 | \$3,207,797 | \$10,119,826 | \$69,109,503 | \$58,989,677 |
| Jun-00 | \$1,004,800 | \$554,738 | \$14,060 |  |  | \$1,573,599 | \$68,996 | \$1,642,595 | \$10,188,822 | \$70,752,098 | \$60,563,276 |
| Jul-00 | \$710,130 | \$432,868 | \$11,315 |  |  | \$1,154,313 | \$46,821 | \$1,201,134 | \$10,235,643 | \$71,953,232 | \$61,717,589 |
| Aug-00 | \$1,567,967 | \$623,002 | \$20,452 |  |  | \$2,211,421 | \$58,508 | \$2,269,929 | \$10,294,151 | \$74,223,161 | \$63,929,009 |


| Month | Res. Savings CAB | Com. Savings CAB | Ind. Savings CAB | Com. Savings GAS | Ind. Savings GAS | Total Monthly Choice Savings | Monthly <br> PIPP <br> Savings | Monthly Savings Including PIPP | Cumulative PIPP Savings | Cumulative Savings (Incl PIPP) | Cumulative <br> Savings (Excl PIPP) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Sep-00 | \$1,549,256 | \$748,851 | \$17,637 |  |  | \$2,315,744 | \$51,350 | \$2,367,095 | \$10,345,502 | \$76,590,255 | \$66,244,753 |
| Oct-00 | \$2,706,833 | \$1,056,352 | \$13,042 |  |  | \$3,776,227 | \$121,841 | \$3,898,068 | \$10,467,343 | \$80,488,323 | \$70,020,980 |
| Nov-00 | \$6,178,117 | \$2,092,866 | \$38,268 |  |  | \$8,309,251 | \$208,106 | \$8,517,357 | \$10,675,449 | \$89,005,680 | \$78,330,231 |
| Dec-00 | \$13,810,672 | \$4,534,145 | \$45,946 |  |  | \$18,390,763 | \$538,633 | \$18,929,396 | \$11,214,082 | \$107,935,076 | \$96,720,994 |
| Jan-01 | \$14,432,877 | \$3,812,320 | \$0 |  |  | \$18,245,197 | \$752,288 | \$18,997,484 | \$11,966,369 | \$126,932,560 | \$114,966,191 |
| Feb-01 | \$17,203,007 | \$4,588,353 | \$0 |  |  | \$21,791,360 | \$723,181 | \$22,514,541 | \$12,689,551 | \$149,447,101 | \$136,757,550 |
| Mar-01 | \$14,710,273 | \$4,050,611 | \$0 |  |  | \$18,760,884 | \$693,255 | \$19,454,138 | \$13,382,805 | \$168,901,239 | \$155,518,434 |
| Apr-01 | \$9,859,471 | \$2,860,423 | \$0 |  |  | \$12,719,894 | \$571,992 | \$13,291,885 | \$13,954,797 | \$182,193,125 | \$168,238,328 |
| May-01 | \$3,855,778 | \$1,247,301 | \$18,417 |  |  | \$5,121,496 | \$155,768 | \$5,277,264 | \$14,110,565 | \$187,470,389 | \$173,359,824 |
| Jun-01 | \$2,754,276 | \$997,069 | \$9,968 |  |  | \$3,761,313 | \$114,641 | \$3,875,954 | \$14,225,206 | \$191,346,342 | \$177,121,136 |
| Jul-01 | \$1,598,501 | \$603,386 | \$8,469 |  |  | \$2,210,356 | \$69,621 | \$2,279,976 | \$14,294,827 | \$193,626,319 | \$179,331,492 |
| Aug-01 | -\$387,396 | -\$36,966 | \$3,322 |  |  | -\$421,041 | \$48,501 | -\$372,539 | \$14,343,328 | \$193,253,779 | \$178,910,452 |
| Sep-01 | -\$541,007 | -\$101,867 | \$214 |  |  | -\$642,660 | \$44,301 | -\$598,359 | \$14,387,629 | \$192,655,420 | \$178,267,791 |
| Oct-01 | -\$903,224 | -\$246,449 | \$1,115 |  |  | -\$1,148,558 | \$95,536 | -\$1,053,022 | \$14,483,165 | \$191,602,398 | \$177,119,233 |
| Nov-01 | -\$4,785,389 | -\$1,519,422 | \$0 |  |  | -\$6,304,811 | \$166,584 | -\$6,138,228 | \$14,649,748 | \$185,464,170 | \$170,814,422 |
| Dec-01 | -\$6,417,765 | -\$2,190,879 | \$0 |  |  | -\$8,608,644 | \$241,333 | -\$8,367,311 | \$14,891,081 | \$177,096,859 | \$162,205,778 |
| Jan-02 | -\$11,213,067 | -\$4,009,360 | -\$24,850 |  |  | -\$15,247,278 | \$456,852 | -\$14,790,425 | \$15,347,933 | \$162,306,434 | \$146,958,501 |
| Feb-02 | -\$8,931,637 | -\$3,242,954 | -\$16,811 |  |  | -\$12,191,402 | \$342,231 | -\$11,849,171 | \$15,690,165 | \$150,457,263 | \$134,767,098 |
| Mar-02 | -\$6,934,816 | -\$2,364,856 | -\$15,592 |  |  | -\$9,315,264 | \$355,597 | -\$8,959,667 | \$16,045,761 | \$141,497,596 | \$125,451,834 |
| Apr-02 | -\$5,332,798 | -\$1,839,321 | \$0 |  |  | -\$7,172,119 | \$295,298 | -\$6,876,821 | \$16,341,060 | \$134,620,775 | \$118,279,715 |
| May-02 | -\$3,351,622 | -\$1,404,541 | -\$8,027 |  |  | -\$4,764,190 | \$158,107 | -\$4,606,083 | \$16,499,167 | \$130,014,691 | \$113,515,525 |
| Jun-02 | -\$2,013,498 | -\$738,132 | -\$5,322 |  |  | -\$2,756,952 | \$94,387 | -\$2,662,565 | \$16,593,553 | \$127,352,126 | \$110,758,573 |
| Jul-02 | -\$1,101,529 | -\$456,628 | -\$3,312 |  |  | -\$1,561,469 | \$50,750 | -\$1,510,718 | \$16,644,304 | \$125,841,408 | \$109,197,104 |
| Aug-02 | \$236,023 | \$130,777 | \$675 |  |  | \$367,475 | \$44,089 | \$411,564 | \$16,688,393 | \$126,252,972 | \$109,564,579 |
| Sep-02 | \$135,406 | \$121,064 | -\$9 |  |  | \$256,461 | \$41,585 | \$298,046 | \$16,729,978 | \$126,551,017 | \$109,821,040 |
| Oct-02 | \$156,437 | \$113,894 | -\$197 |  |  | \$270,134 | \$62,349 | \$332,483 | \$16,792,327 | \$126,883,501 | \$110,091,174 |
| Nov-02 | \$771,332 | \$309,783 | \$1,902 |  |  | \$1,083,017 | \$217,814 | \$1,300,831 | \$17,010,141 | \$128,184,332 | \$111,174,191 |
| Dec-02 | \$726,676 | -\$6,217 | \$1,461 |  |  | \$721,920 | \$392,134 | \$1,114,055 | \$17,402,276 | \$129,298,386 | \$111,896,111 |
| Jan-03 | \$1,102,780 | -\$1,000,067 | \$0 |  |  | \$102,713 | \$519,274 | \$621,987 | \$17,921,549 | \$129,920,374 | \$111,998,824 |
| Feb-03 | \$5,523,850 | \$1,167,509 | \$8,870 |  |  | \$6,700,229 | \$655,759 | \$7,355,988 | \$18,577,309 | \$137,276,361 | \$118,699,053 |
| Mar-03 | \$4,199,337 | \$509,070 | \$2,948 |  |  | \$4,711,356 | \$601,685 | \$5,313,041 | \$19,178,994 | \$142,589,403 | \$123,410,409 |
| Apr-03 | \$5,673,189 | \$1,770,099 | \$7,841 |  |  | \$7,451,129 | \$236,472 | \$7,687,601 | \$19,415,466 | \$150,277,004 | \$130,861,538 |
| May-03 | \$4,007,475 | \$1,296,707 | \$8,797 |  |  | \$5,312,980 | \$124,194 | \$5,437,173 | \$19,539,660 | \$155,714,177 | \$136,174,517 |
| Jun-03 | \$2,563,180 | \$1,013,374 | \$5,887 |  |  | \$3,582,441 | \$84,048 | \$3,666,490 | \$19,623,708 | \$159,380,667 | \$139,756,959 |
| Jul-03 | \$1,385,724 | \$674,473 | \$3,314 |  |  | \$2,063,510 | \$44,755 | \$2,108,266 | \$19,668,464 | \$161,488,933 | \$141,820,469 |
| Aug-03 | -\$199,255 | -\$82,351 | -\$218 |  |  | -\$281,823 | \$38,953 | -\$242,870 | \$19,707,417 | \$161,246,063 | \$141,538,646 |
| Sep-03 | -\$122,424 | \$3,139 | -\$212 |  |  | -\$119,498 | \$38,189 | -\$81,310 | \$19,745,605 | \$161,164,753 | \$141,419,148 |
| Oct-03 | -\$192,077 | \$100,989 | -\$697 |  |  | -\$91,785 | \$87,000 | -\$4,785 | \$19,832,605 | \$161,159,968 | \$141,327,363 |
| Nov-03 | -\$2,676,204 | -\$786,416 | -\$9,233 |  |  | -\$3,471,853 | \$130,215 | -\$3,341,638 | \$19,962,820 | \$157,818,330 | \$137,855,510 |
| Dec-03 | -\$5,412,084 | -\$2,327,899 | -\$14,949 |  |  | -\$7,754,932 | \$251,134 | -\$7,503,798 | \$20,213,955 | \$150,314,533 | \$130,100,578 |
| Jan-04 | -\$11,732,403 | -\$4,826,612 | -\$27,265 |  |  | -\$16,586,279 | \$369,962 | -\$16,216,317 | \$20,583,916 | \$134,098,215 | \$113,514,299 |


| Month | Res. Savings CAB | Com. Savings CAB | Ind. Savings CAB | Com. Savings GAS | Ind. Savings GAS | Total <br> Monthly Choice <br> Savings | Monthly <br> PIPP <br> Savings | Monthly Savings Including PIPP | Cumulative PIPP Savings | Cumulative Savings (Incl PIPP) | Cumulative <br> Savings (Excl PIPP) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Feb-04 | -\$10,668,507 | -\$4,004,885 | -\$17,696 |  |  | -\$14,691,088 | \$447,855 | -\$14,243,234 | \$21,031,771 | \$119,854,982 | \$98,823,211 |
| Mar-04 | -\$7,356,309 | -\$2,355,718 | -\$10,959 |  |  | -\$9,722,986 | \$334,371 | -\$9,388,615 | \$21,366,142 | \$110,466,366 | \$89,100,225 |
| Apr-04 | -\$5,408,848 | -\$1,596,368 | -\$7,561 |  |  | -\$7,012,777 | \$0 | -\$7,012,777 | \$21,366,142 | \$103,453,590 | \$82,087,448 |
| May-04 | -\$1,849,168 | -\$361,959 | -\$2,501 |  |  | -\$2,213,629 | \$0 | -\$2,213,629 | \$21,366,142 | \$101,239,961 | \$79,873,819 |
| Jun-04 | -\$973,902 | -\$145,292 | -\$1,036 |  |  | -\$1,120,230 | \$0 | -\$1,120,230 | \$21,366,142 | \$100,119,732 | \$78,753,590 |
| Jul-04 | -\$913,368 | -\$223,736 | -\$114,560 |  |  | -\$1,251,664 | \$0 | -\$1,251,664 | \$21,366,142 | \$98,868,068 | \$77,501,926 |
| Aug-04 | -\$116,386 | \$54,895 | \$0 |  |  | -\$61,491 | \$0 | -\$61,491 | \$21,366,142 | \$98,806,577 | \$77,440,435 |
| Sep-04 | \$10,843 | \$67,262 | \$1,170 |  |  | \$79,275 | \$0 | \$79,275 | \$21,366,142 | \$98,885,852 | \$77,519,710 |
| Oct-04 | -\$42,681 | \$137,841 | \$1,460 |  |  | \$96,620 | \$0 | \$96,620 | \$21,366,142 | \$98,982,472 | \$77,616,330 |
| Nov-04 | -\$1,538,128 | -\$436,246 | -\$3,391 |  |  | -\$1,977,765 | \$0 | -\$1,977,765 | \$21,366,142 | \$97,004,707 | \$75,638,565 |
| Dec-04 | -\$1,502,379 | -\$806,935 | -\$4,559 |  |  | -\$2,313,873 | \$0 | -\$2,313,873 | \$21,366,142 | \$94,690,834 | \$73,324,692 |
| Jan-05 | -\$1,578,126 | -\$1,005,151 | -\$2,823 |  |  | -\$2,586,099 | \$0 | -\$2,586,099 | \$21,366,142 | \$92,104,734 | \$70,738,593 |
| Feb-05 | -\$7,501,073 | -\$2,234,889 | -\$14,464 |  |  | -\$9,750,426 | \$0 | -\$9,750,426 | \$21,366,142 | \$82,354,308 | \$60,988,166 |
| Mar-05 | -\$7,712,573 | -\$2,518,040 | -\$18,620 |  |  | -\$10,249,233 | \$0 | -\$10,249,233 | \$21,366,142 | \$72,105,075 | \$50,738,933 |
| Apr-05 | -\$1,844,632 | -\$704,283 | -\$5,848 |  |  | -\$2,554,763 | \$0 | -\$2,554,763 | \$21,366,142 | \$69,550,312 | \$48,184,170 |
| May-05 | -\$1,616,796 | -\$210,553 | -\$2,467 |  |  | -\$1,829,816 | \$0 | -\$1,829,816 | \$21,366,142 | \$67,720,496 | \$46,354,354 |
| Jun-05 | -\$845,291 | -\$44,472 | -\$4,230 |  |  | -\$893,993 | \$0 | -\$893,993 | \$21,366,142 | \$66,826,503 | \$45,460,361 |
| Jul-05 | -\$739,294 | -\$31,196 | -\$621 |  |  | -\$771,110 | \$0 | -\$771,110 | \$21,366,142 | \$66,055,392 | \$44,689,251 |
| Aug-05 | -\$78,266 | \$70,916 | \$0 |  |  | -\$7,350 | \$0 | -\$7,350 | \$21,366,142 | \$66,048,042 | \$44,681,901 |
| Sep-05 | \$210,761 | \$100,586 | \$1,038 |  |  | \$312,384 | \$0 | \$312,384 | \$21,366,142 | \$66,360,427 | \$44,994,285 |
| Oct-05 | \$847,001 | -\$135,534 | \$4,638 |  |  | \$716,106 | \$0 | \$716,106 | \$21,366,142 | \$67,076,533 | \$45,710,391 |
| Nov-05 | \$184,914 | -\$1,283,433 | \$10,074 |  |  | -\$1,088,445 | \$0 | -\$1,088,445 | \$21,366,142 | \$65,988,088 | \$44,621,946 |
| Dec-05 | \$185,165 | -\$1,358,303 | \$1,942 |  |  | -\$1,171,195 | \$0 | -\$1,171,195 | \$21,366,142 | \$64,816,892 | \$43,450,750 |
| Jan-06 | -\$961,598 | -\$2,941,083 | -\$150,058 |  |  | -\$4,052,738 | \$0 | -\$4,052,738 | \$21,366,142 | \$60,764,154 | \$39,398,012 |
| Feb-06 | -\$5,604,909 | -\$3,093,449 | -\$32,232 |  |  | -\$8,730,590 | \$0 | -\$8,730,590 | \$21,366,142 | \$52,033,564 | \$30,667,422 |
| Mar-06 | -\$11,177,508 | -\$4,065,279 | -\$42,318 |  |  | -\$15,285,104 | \$0 | -\$15,285,104 | \$21,366,142 | \$36,748,459 | \$15,382,317 |
| Apr-06 | -\$7,293,950 | -\$2,287,715 | -\$24,904 |  |  | -\$9,606,569 | \$53,181 | -\$9,553,388 | \$21,419,323 | \$27,195,071 | \$5,775,748 |
| May-06 | -\$3,926,951 | -\$1,116,790 | -\$12,355 |  |  | -\$5,056,096 | \$26,802 | -\$5,029,294 | \$21,446,125 | \$22,165,777 | \$719,652 |
| Jun-06 | -\$2,704,723 | -\$598,065 | -\$9,368 |  |  | -\$3,312,155 | \$14,795 | -\$3,297,361 | \$21,460,920 | \$18,868,417 | -\$2,592,503 |
| Jul-06 | -\$1,975,016 | -\$494,379 | -\$8,324 |  |  | -\$2,477,718 | \$8,309 | -\$2,469,409 | \$21,469,229 | \$16,399,008 | -\$5,070,221 |
| Aug-06 | -\$2,101,535 | -\$420,782 | -\$11,119 |  |  | -\$2,533,436 | \$8,075 | -\$2,525,361 | \$21,477,304 | \$13,873,646 | -\$7,603,658 |
| Sep-06 | -\$1,571,928 | -\$516,412 | -\$12,047 |  |  | -\$2,100,387 | \$8,066 | -\$2,092,321 | \$21,485,370 | \$11,781,325 | -\$9,704,045 |
| Oct-06 | -\$5,152,570 | -\$1,734,363 | -\$33,089 |  |  | -\$6,920,021 | \$17,003 | -\$6,903,018 | \$21,502,373 | \$4,878,307 | -\$16,624,066 |
| Nov-06 | -\$9,020,018 | -\$2,654,434 | -\$49,911 |  |  | -\$11,724,363 | \$40,939 | -\$11,683,424 | \$21,543,312 | -\$6,805,117 | -\$28,348,429 |
| Dec-06 | -\$12,714,226 | -\$3,707,906 | -\$75,247 |  |  | -\$16,497,380 | \$59,733 | -\$16,437,647 | \$21,603,046 | -\$23,242,764 | -\$44,845,809 |
| Jan-07 | -\$14,772,242 | -\$5,844,496 | -\$82,866 |  |  | -\$20,699,603 | \$71,970 | -\$20,627,633 | \$21,675,016 | -\$43,870,396 | -\$65,545,412 |
| Feb-07 | -\$21,638,440 | -\$6,425,648 | -\$62,487 |  |  | -\$28,126,575 | \$105,900 | -\$28,020,675 | \$21,780,916 | -\$71,891,071 | -\$93,671,988 |
| Mar-07 | -\$15,335,851 | -\$5,020,217 | -\$41,454 |  |  | -\$20,397,523 | \$91,869 | -\$20,305,654 | \$21,872,785 | -\$92,196,725 | -\$114,069,510 |
| Apr-07 | -\$13,730,839 | -\$4,746,463 | -\$38,360 |  |  | -\$18,515,663 | \$77,960 | -\$18,437,702 | \$21,950,745 | -\$110,634,428 | -\$132,585,173 |
| May-07 | -\$4,045,124 | -\$1,461,868 | -\$24,204 |  |  | -\$5,531,196 | \$41,549 | -\$5,489,647 | \$21,992,294 | -\$116,124,075 | -\$138,116,369 |
| Jun-07 | -\$1,824,264 | -\$756,525 | -\$6,479 |  |  | -\$2,587,269 | \$18,743 | -\$2,568,525 | \$22,011,037 | -\$118,692,601 | -\$140,703,638 |


| Month | Res. Savings CAB | Com. Savings CAB | Ind. Savings CAB | Com. Savings GAS | Ind. Savings GAS | Total Monthly Choice Savings | Monthly PIPP Savings | Monthly Savings Including PIPP | Cumulative <br> PIPP Savings | Cumulative <br> Savings (Incl PIPP) | Cumulative <br> Savings (Excl PIPP) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Jul-07 | -\$1,575,114 | -\$666,103 | -\$11,375 |  |  | -\$2,252,592 | \$13,759 | -\$2,238,833 | \$22,024,796 | -\$120,931,434 | -\$142,956,230 |
| Aug-07 | -\$1,548,150 | -\$648,202 | -\$9,630 |  |  | -\$2,205,982 | \$11,085 | -\$2,194,897 | \$22,035,882 | -\$123,126,330 | -\$145,162,212 |
| Sep-07 | -\$1,483,832 | -\$600,649 | -\$7,762 |  |  | -\$2,092,243 | \$11,445 | -\$2,080,798 | \$22,047,327 | -\$125,207,128 | -\$147,254,455 |
| Oct-07 | -\$2,044,185 | -\$731,511 | -\$6,280 |  |  | -\$2,781,976 | \$14,771 | -\$2,767,205 | \$22,062,098 | -\$127,974,333 | -\$150,036,431 |
| Nov-07 | -\$4,561,749 | -\$1,277,436 | -\$4,391 |  |  | -\$5,843,575 | \$49,773 | -\$5,793,803 | \$22,111,871 | -\$133,768,135 | -\$155,880,006 |
| Dec-07 | -\$8,568,268 | -\$2,599,283 | -\$27,095 |  |  | -\$11,194,646 | \$104,032 | -\$11,090,614 | \$22,215,903 | -\$144,858,749 | -\$167,074,653 |
| Jan-08 | -\$10,096,120 | -\$2,931,314 | -\$24,470 |  |  | -\$13,051,903 | \$131,676 | -\$12,920,228 | \$22,347,579 | -\$157,778,977 | -\$180,126,556 |
| Feb-08 | -\$7,024,941 | -\$1,824,434 | -\$10,632 |  |  | -\$8,860,007 | \$141,785 | -\$8,718,221 | \$22,489,365 | -\$166,497,198 | -\$188,986,563 |
| Mar-08 | -\$7,533,256 | -\$2,519,223 | -\$13,759 |  |  | -\$10,066,238 | \$142,920 | -\$9,923,318 | \$22,632,284 | -\$176,420,516 | -\$199,052,801 |
| Apr-08 | -\$2,506,939 | -\$950,180 | \$2,713 |  |  | -\$3,454,406 | \$73,436 | -\$3,380,970 | \$22,705,720 | -\$179,801,486 | -\$202,507,206 |
| May-08 | -\$1,179,307 | -\$749,652 | \$856 |  |  | -\$1,928,103 | \$31,482 | -\$1,896,621 | \$22,737,202 | -\$181,698,107 | -\$204,435,310 |
| Jun-08 | -\$603,512 | -\$565,362 | -\$1,217 |  |  | -\$1,170,091 | \$20,328 | -\$1,149,763 | \$22,757,530 | -\$182,847,870 | -\$205,605,401 |
| Jul-08 | -\$121,880 | -\$668,469 | \$304 |  |  | -\$790,044 | \$11,537 | -\$778,508 | \$22,769,066 | -\$183,626,378 | -\$206,395,445 |
| Aug-08 | -\$920,216 | -\$692,303 | -\$1,841 |  |  | -\$1,614,359 | \$9,710 | -\$1,604,649 | \$22,778,777 | -\$185,231,027 | -\$208,009,805 |
| Sep-08 | -\$1,587,392 | -\$1,011,676 | -\$3,722 |  |  | -\$2,602,790 | \$8,792 | -\$2,593,998 | \$22,787,569 | -\$187,825,025 | -\$210,612,595 |
| Oct-08 | -\$2,969,271 | -\$977,128 | -\$6,760 |  |  | -\$3,953,159 | \$14,224 | -\$3,938,935 | \$22,801,793 | -\$191,763,960 | -\$214,565,754 |
| Nov-08 | -\$4,157,953 | -\$925,308 | \$4,846 |  |  | -\$5,078,415 | \$43,070 | -\$5,035,346 | \$22,844,862 | -\$196,799,305 | -\$219,644,169 |
| Dec-08 | -\$3,814,931 | \$332,636 | \$22,238 |  |  | -\$3,460,056 | \$92,916 | -\$3,367,141 | \$22,937,778 | -\$200,166,446 | -\$223,104,225 |
| Jan-09 | -\$28,681,170 | -\$9,070,920 | -\$72,169 |  |  | -\$37,824,259 | \$124,409 | -\$37,699,849 | \$23,062,188 | -\$237,866,295 | -\$260,928,484 |
| Feb-09 | -\$22,216,722 | -\$6,779,101 | -\$58,538 |  |  | -\$29,054,361 | \$125,729 | -\$28,928,632 | \$23,187,917 | -\$266,794,927 | -\$289,982,845 |
| Mar-09 | -\$14,231,242 | -\$3,873,959 | -\$28,150 |  |  | -\$18,133,351 | \$95,546 | -\$18,037,806 | \$23,283,463 | -\$284,832,732 | -\$308,116,196 |
| Apr-09 | -\$14,866,518 | -\$4,294,526 | -\$35,204 |  |  | -\$19,196,248 | \$14,350 | -\$19,181,898 | \$23,297,813 | -\$304,014,630 | -\$327,312,444 |
| May-09 | -\$8,101,872 | -\$2,856,819 | -\$18,422 |  |  | -\$10,977,112 | \$6,975 | -\$10,970,138 | \$23,304,788 | -\$314,984,768 | -\$338,289,557 |
| Jun-09 | -\$3,431,341 | -\$1,247,366 | -\$6,467 |  |  | -\$4,685,174 | \$3,592 | -\$4,681,582 | \$23,308,381 | -\$319,666,350 | -\$342,974,731 |
| Jul-09 | -\$2,737,380 | -\$1,060,690 | -\$5,052 |  |  | -\$3,803,121 | \$2,223 | -\$3,800,898 | \$23,310,604 | -\$323,467,248 | -\$346,777,852 |
| Aug-09 | -\$3,552,993 | -\$1,512,985 | -\$20,633 |  |  | -\$5,086,611 | \$2,092 | -\$5,084,519 | \$23,312,696 | -\$328,551,766 | -\$351,864,463 |
| Sep-09 | -\$3,368,242 | -\$1,428,350 | -\$19,836 |  |  | -\$4,816,429 | \$1,949 | -\$4,814,479 | \$23,314,646 | -\$333,366,245 | -\$356,680,892 |
| Oct-09 | -\$7,246,610 | -\$2,384,038 | -\$36,028 |  |  | -\$9,666,676 | \$4,560 | -\$9,662,116 | \$23,319,206 | -\$343,028,362 | -\$366,347,568 |
| Nov-09 | -\$11,737,467 | -\$4,226,695 | -\$54,205 |  |  | -\$16,018,366 | \$8,603 | -\$16,009,764 | \$23,327,808 | -\$359,038,125 | -\$382,365,935 |
| Dec-09 | -\$21,782,094 | -\$7,865,117 | -\$109,853 |  |  | -\$29,757,064 | \$14,783 | -\$29,742,282 | \$23,342,591 | -\$388,780,407 | -\$412,122,999 |
| Jan-10 | -\$40,572,070 | -\$17,771,809 | -\$190,682 |  |  | -\$58,534,561 | \$25,333 | -\$58,509,229 | \$23,367,923 | -\$447,289,636 | -\$470,657,560 |
| Feb-10 | -\$37,456,299 | -\$17,263,379 | -\$166,964 |  |  | -\$54,886,642 | \$23,999 | -\$54,862,644 | \$23,391,922 | -\$502,152,279 | -\$525,544,202 |
| Mar-10 | -\$29,544,799 | -\$12,895,726 | -\$125,155 |  |  | -\$42,565,680 | \$20,305 | -\$42,545,375 | \$23,412,227 | -\$544,697,654 | -\$568,109,882 |
| Apr-10 | -\$10,205,850 | -\$5,302,857 | -\$44,161 |  |  | -\$15,552,868 | \$0 | -\$15,552,868 | \$23,412,227 | -\$560,250,522 | -\$583,662,750 |
| May-10 | -\$5,030,596 | -\$1,850,366 | -\$11,344 |  |  | -\$6,892,306 | \$0 | -\$6,892,306 | \$23,412,227 | -\$567,142,828 | -\$590,555,056 |
| Jun-10 | -\$3,111,808 | -\$1,367,655 | -\$10,126 |  |  | -\$4,489,589 | \$0 | -\$4,489,589 | \$23,412,227 | -\$571,632,417 | -\$595,044,645 |
| Jul-10 | -\$2,355,905 | -\$929,182 | -\$4,453 |  |  | -\$3,289,540 | \$0 | -\$3,289,540 | \$23,412,227 | -\$574,921,957 | -\$598,334,185 |
| Aug-10 | -\$1,906,242 | -\$750,001 | -\$3,512 |  |  | -\$2,659,755 | \$0 | -\$2,659,755 | \$23,412,227 | -\$577,581,712 | -\$600,993,940 |
| Sep-10 | -\$2,515,082 | -\$1,055,284 | -\$11,219 |  |  | -\$3,581,584 | \$0 | -\$3,581,584 | \$23,412,227 | -\$581,163,296 | -\$604,575,524 |
| Oct-10 | -\$3,682,710 | -\$1,296,045 | -\$13,255 |  |  | -\$4,992,010 | \$0 | -\$4,992,010 | \$23,412,227 | -\$586,155,306 | -\$609,567,534 |
| Nov-10 | -\$8,929,195 | -\$2,980,686 | -\$36,259 |  |  | -\$11,946,139 | \$0 | -\$11,946,139 | \$23,412,227 | -\$598,101,446 | -\$621,513,674 |


| Month | Res. Savings CAB | Com. Savings CAB | Ind. Savings CAB | Com. Savings GAS | Ind. Savings GAS | Total <br> Monthly Choice Savings | Monthly <br> PIPP <br> Savings | Monthly Savings Including PIPP | Cumulative PIPP Savings | Cumulative Savings (Incl PIPP) | Cumulative Savings (Excl PIPP) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Dec-10 | -\$14,247,734 | -\$4,376,832 | -\$31,214 |  |  | -\$18,655,779 | \$0 | -\$18,655,779 | \$23,412,227 | -\$616,757,225 | -\$640,169,453 |
| Jan-11 | -\$20,178,145 | -\$7,226,845 | -\$66,450 |  |  | -\$27,471,440 | \$0 | -\$27,471,440 | \$23,412,227 | -\$644,228,665 | -\$667,640,894 |
| Feb-11 | -\$17,503,090 | -\$6,663,572 | -\$57,222 |  |  | -\$24,223,884 | \$0 | -\$24,223,884 | \$23,412,227 | -\$668,452,549 | -\$691,864,778 |
| Mar-11 | -\$15,140,570 | -\$5,431,256 | -\$49,063 |  |  | -\$20,620,889 | \$0 | -\$20,620,889 | \$23,412,227 | -\$689,073,439 | -\$712,485,667 |
| Apr-11 | -\$9,382,832 | -\$2,899,984 | -\$22,843 |  |  | -\$12,305,658 | \$0 | -\$12,305,658 | \$23,412,227 | -\$701,379,096 | -\$724,791,324 |
| May-11 | -\$5,043,450 | -\$1,581,832 | -\$15,485 |  |  | -\$6,640,768 | \$0 | -\$6,640,768 | \$23,412,227 | -\$708,019,864 | -\$731,432,092 |
| Jun-11 | -\$2,526,502 | -\$908,185 | -\$7,605 |  |  | -\$3,442,292 | \$0 | -\$3,442,292 | \$23,412,227 | -\$711,462,156 | -\$734,874,384 |
| Jul-11 | -\$1,869,945 | -\$802,740 | -\$6,252 |  |  | -\$2,678,937 | \$0 | -\$2,678,937 | \$23,412,227 | -\$714,141,094 | -\$737,553,322 |
| Aug-11 | -\$1,695,636 | -\$671,399 | -\$4,174 |  |  | -\$2,371,209 | \$0 | -\$2,371,209 | \$23,412,227 | -\$716,512,303 | -\$739,924,531 |
| Sep-11 | -\$2,030,481 | -\$881,393 | -\$7,308 |  |  | -\$2,919,182 | \$0 | -\$2,919,182 | \$23,412,227 | -\$719,431,485 | -\$742,843,713 |
| Oct-11 | -\$3,140,807 | -\$1,164,355 | -\$10,329 |  |  | -\$4,315,491 | \$0 | -\$4,315,491 | \$23,412,227 | -\$723,746,976 | -\$747,159,204 |
| Nov-11 | -\$6,997,438 | -\$2,263,598 | -\$34,310 |  |  | -\$9,295,346 | \$0 | -\$9,295,346 | \$23,412,227 | -\$733,042,322 | -\$756,454,550 |
| Dec-11 | -\$12,557,750 | -\$3,945,419 | -\$64,240 |  |  | -\$16,567,409 | \$0 | -\$16,567,409 | \$23,412,227 | -\$749,609,731 | -\$773,021,959 |
| Jan-12 | -\$18,651,178 | -\$5,916,444 | -\$76,824 |  |  | -\$24,644,446 | \$0 | -\$24,644,446 | \$23,412,227 | -\$774,254,177 | -\$797,666,405 |
| Feb-12 | -\$20,382,726 | -\$6,813,519 | -\$80,778 |  |  | -\$27,277,024 | \$0 | -\$27,277,024 | \$23,412,227 | -\$801,531,201 | -\$824,943,429 |
| Mar-12 | -\$16,793,300 | -\$5,589,328 | -\$60,396 |  |  | -\$22,443,024 | \$0 | -\$22,443,024 | \$23,412,227 | -\$823,974,225 | -\$847,386,453 |
| Apr-12 | -\$9,349,064 | -\$3,600,962 | -\$45,096 |  |  | -\$12,995,122 | \$0 | -\$12,995,122 | \$23,412,227 | -\$836,969,347 | -\$860,381,575 |
| May-12 | -\$7,406,658 | -\$2,572,108 | -\$29,530 |  |  | -\$10,008,296 | \$0 | -\$10,008,296 | \$23,412,227 | -\$846,977,643 | -\$870,389,871 |
| Jun-12 | -\$3,202,658 | -\$1,327,809 | -\$13,942 |  |  | -\$4,544,409 | \$0 | -\$4,544,409 | \$23,412,227 | -\$851,522,052 | -\$874,934,280 |
| Jul-12 | -\$2,380,923 | -\$1,043,505 | -\$7,700 |  |  | -\$3,432,128 | \$0 | -\$3,432,128 | \$23,412,227 | -\$854,954,180 | -\$878,366,408 |
| Aug-12 | -\$1,986,608 | -\$848,902 | -\$8,092 |  |  | -\$2,843,602 | \$0 | -\$2,843,602 | \$23,412,227 | -\$857,797,782 | -\$881,210,010 |
| Sep-12 | -\$2,321,318 | -\$1,044,077 | -\$11,926 |  |  | -\$3,377,321 | \$0 | -\$3,377,321 | \$23,412,227 | -\$861,175,104 | -\$884,587,332 |
| Oct-12 | -\$3,653,559 | -\$1,102,057 | -\$11,358 |  |  | -\$4,766,974 | \$0 | -\$4,766,974 | \$23,412,227 | -\$865,942,077 | -\$889,354,306 |
| Nov-12 | -\$7,303,123 | -\$2,016,031 | -\$30,021 |  |  | -\$9,349,175 | \$0 | -\$9,349,175 | \$23,412,227 | -\$875,291,253 | -\$898,703,481 |
| Dec-12 | -\$10,718,224 | -\$3,009,674 | -\$34,951 |  |  | -\$13,762,849 | \$0 | -\$13,762,849 | \$23,412,227 | -\$889,054,102 | -\$912,466,330 |
| Jan-13 | -\$17,561,829 | -\$5,237,632 | -\$51,727 |  |  | -\$22,851,187 | \$0 | -\$22,851,187 | \$23,412,227 | -\$911,905,289 | -\$935,317,517 |
| Feb-13 | -\$18,925,582 | -\$5,598,939 | -\$45,406 |  |  | -\$24,569,927 | \$0 | -\$24,569,927 | \$23,412,227 | -\$936,475,216 | -\$959,887,444 |
| Mar-13 | -\$16,218,739 | -\$4,350,721 | -\$28,889 |  |  | -\$20,598,350 | \$0 | -\$20,598,350 | \$23,412,227 | -\$957,073,565 | -\$980,485,793 |
| Apr-13 | -\$9,824,400 | -\$2,408,704 | -\$10,098 |  |  | -\$12,243,202 | \$0 | -\$12,243,202 | \$23,412,227 | -\$969,316,767 | -\$992,728,995 |
| May-13 | -\$3,969,390 | -\$1,005,427 | -\$8,133 |  |  | -\$4,982,951 | \$0 | -\$4,982,951 | \$23,412,227 | -\$974,299,717 | -\$997,711,946 |
| Jun-13 | -\$2,415,361 | -\$657,077 | -\$4,765 |  |  | -\$3,077,203 | \$0 | -\$3,077,203 | \$23,412,227 | -\$977,376,921 | -\$1,000,789,149 |
| Jul-13 | -\$2,215,582 | -\$723,016 | -\$6,497 |  |  | -\$2,945,095 | \$0 | -\$2,945,095 | \$23,412,227 | -\$980,322,016 | -\$1,003,734,244 |
| Aug-13 | -\$2,138,758 | -\$765,977 | -\$8,254 |  |  | -\$2,912,988 | \$0 | -\$2,912,988 | \$23,412,227 | -\$983,235,004 | -\$1,006,647,232 |
| Sep-13 | -\$2,047,364 | -\$639,512 | -\$6,073 |  |  | -\$2,692,950 | \$0 | -\$2,692,950 | \$23,412,227 | -\$985,927,954 | -\$1,009,340,182 |
| Oct-13 | -\$2,815,864 | -\$818,831 | -\$16,192 |  |  | -\$3,650,886 | \$0 | -\$3,650,886 | \$23,412,227 | -\$989,578,840 | -\$1,012,991,068 |
| Nov-13 | -\$7,562,682 | -\$2,155,379 | -\$62,083 |  |  | -\$9,780,144 | \$0 | -\$9,780,144 | \$23,412,227 | -\$999,358,984 | -\$1,022,771,212 |
| Dec-13 | -\$13,763,019 | -\$3,797,676 | -\$51,496 |  |  | -\$17,612,191 | \$0 | -\$17,612,191 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,016,971,175 | -\$1,040,383,403 |
| Jan-14 | -\$15,981,935 | -\$4,344,835 | -\$46,431 |  |  | -\$20,373,200 | \$0 | -\$20,373,200 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,037,344,376 | -\$1,060,756,604 |
| Feb-14 | -\$8,748,912 | -\$792,898 | \$6,411 |  |  | -\$9,535,399 | \$0 | -\$9,535,399 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,046,879,775 | -\$1,070,292,003 |
| Mar-14 | -\$15,113,887 | -\$4,423,825 | -\$45,744 |  |  | -\$19,583,455 | \$0 | -\$19,583,455 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,066,463,230 | -\$1,089,875,458 |
| Apr-14 | -\$9,661,541 | -\$2,203,349 | -\$20,533 |  |  | -\$11,885,423 | \$0 | -\$11,885,423 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,078,348,653 | -\$1,101,760,881 |


| Month | Res. Savings CAB | Com. Savings CAB | Ind. Savings CAB | Com. Savings GAS | Ind. Savings GAS | Total Monthly Choice Savings | Monthly <br> PIPP <br> Savings | Monthly Savings Including PIPP | Cumulative PIPP Savings | Cumulative Savings (Incl PIPP) | Cumulative <br> Savings (Excl PIPP) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| May-14 | -\$4,308,980 | -\$879,750 | -\$7,338 | \$38,047 | \$34,335 | -\$5,123,687 | \$0 | -\$5,123,687 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,083,472,340 | -\$1,106,884,568 |
| Jun-14 | -\$2,499,474 | -\$638,593 | -\$5,820 | -\$5,630 | \$61,031 | -\$3,088,486 | \$0 | -\$3,088,486 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,086,560,826 | -\$1,109,973,054 |
| Jul-14 | -\$2,327,035 | -\$625,615 | -\$6,631 | -\$42,096 | \$59,117 | -\$2,942,259 | \$0 | -\$2,942,259 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,089,503,084 | -\$1,112,915,312 |
| Aug-14 | -\$2,581,985 | -\$750,265 | -\$8,389 | -\$63,833 | \$77,033 | -\$3,327,439 | \$0 | -\$3,327,439 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,092,830,524 | -\$1,116,242,752 |
| Sep-14 | -\$2,569,170 | -\$632,911 | -\$6,336 | -\$17,212 | \$67,644 | -\$3,157,984 | \$0 | -\$3,157,984 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,095,988,508 | -\$1,119,400,736 |
| Oct-14 | -\$3,731,082 | -\$814,930 | -\$12,555 | \$37,077 | \$73,254 | -\$4,448,236 | \$0 | -\$4,448,236 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,100,436,744 | -\$1,123,848,972 |
| Nov-14 | -\$8,519,324 | -\$1,952,682 | -\$35,137 | \$30,825 | \$67,232 | -\$10,409,087 | \$0 | -\$10,409,087 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,110,845,831 | -\$1,134,258,059 |
| Dec-14 | -\$12,884,435 | -\$3,090,609 | -\$61,504 | \$47,032 | \$48,796 | -\$15,940,721 | \$0 | -\$15,940,721 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,126,786,552 | -\$1,150,198,780 |
| Jan-15 | -\$24,103,802 | -\$6,731,228 | -\$96,765 | \$101,261 | \$40,306 | -\$30,790,227 | \$0 | -\$30,790,227 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,157,576,779 | -\$1,180,989,007 |
| Feb-15 | -\$27,342,772 | -\$7,357,262 | -\$106,216 | \$169,688 | \$18,540 | -\$34,618,022 | \$0 | -\$34,618,022 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,192,194,801 | -\$1,215,607,029 |
| Mar-15 | -\$23,346,881 | -\$6,432,525 | -\$96,751 | \$245,073 | \$25,336 | -\$29,605,747 | \$0 | -\$29,605,747 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,221,800,548 | -\$1,245,212,776 |
| Apr-15 | -\$13,206,425 | -\$3,819,985 | -\$60,265 | \$73,304 | \$18,404 | -\$16,994,968 | \$0 | -\$16,994,968 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,238,795,516 | -\$1,262,207,744 |
| May-15 | -\$5,874,990 | -\$1,659,536 | -\$24,504 | \$63,709 | \$19,577 | -\$7,475,743 | \$0 | -\$7,475,743 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,246,271,259 | -\$1,269,683,488 |
| Jun-15 | -\$3,022,034 | -\$953,870 | -\$14,081 | \$6,185 | \$31,353 | -\$3,952,446 | \$0 | -\$3,952,446 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,250,223,705 | -\$1,273,635,933 |
| Jul-15 | -\$2,517,799 | -\$838,616 | -\$11,460 | \$13,055 | \$35,924 | -\$3,318,895 | \$0 | -\$3,318,895 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,253,542,601 | -\$1,276,954,829 |
| Aug-15 | -\$2,236,562 | -\$706,709 | -\$12,089 | -\$34,315 | \$82,867 | -\$2,906,808 | \$0 | -\$2,906,808 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,256,449,408 | -\$1,279,861,636 |
| Sep-15 | -\$2,421,039 | -\$776,506 | -\$12,446 | \$3,354 | \$49,646 | -\$3,156,991 | \$0 | -\$3,156,991 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,259,606,399 | -\$1,283,018,627 |
| Oct-15 | -\$3,143,346 | -\$990,394 | -\$20,122 | \$11,751 | \$64,692 | -\$4,077,419 | \$0 | -\$4,077,419 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,263,683,818 | -\$1,287,096,046 |
| Nov-15 | -\$6,647,549 | -\$2,120,236 | -\$42,765 | \$32,806 | \$78,831 | -\$8,698,913 | \$0 | -\$8,698,913 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,272,382,731 | -\$1,295,794,959 |
| Dec-15 | -\$11,434,927 | -\$3,771,764 | -\$60,957 | \$8,563 | \$72,641 | -\$15,186,444 | \$0 | -\$15,186,444 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,287,569,175 | -\$1,310,981,403 |
| Jan-16 | -\$16,112,731 | -\$5,678,615 | -\$94,065 | -\$34,989 | \$9,775 | -\$21,910,625 | \$0 | -\$21,910,625 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,309,479,800 | -\$1,332,892,028 |
| Feb-16 | -\$18,597,905 | -\$6,753,189 | -\$119,339 | -\$1,951 | \$18,368 | -\$25,454,015 | \$0 | -\$25,454,015 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,334,933,815 | -\$1,358,346,043 |
| Mar-16 | -\$15,872,469 | -\$5,580,592 | -\$102,175 | \$7,502 | \$13,209 | -\$21,534,525 | \$0 | -\$21,534,525 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,356,468,340 | -\$1,379,880,568 |
| Apr-16 | -\$10,415,718 | -\$3,156,401 | -\$49,603 | \$10,821 | \$6,722 | -\$13,604,179 | \$0 | -\$13,604,179 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,370,072,519 | -\$1,393,484,747 |
| May-16 | -\$5,964,571 | -\$1,727,504 | -\$24,245 | -\$11,723 | \$44,730 | -\$7,683,313 | \$0 | -\$7,683,313 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,377,755,832 | -\$1,401,168,060 |
| Jun-16 | -\$3,487,938 | -\$1,055,352 | -\$14,102 | -\$24,004 | \$55,326 | -\$4,526,070 | \$0 | -\$4,526,070 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,382,281,902 | -\$1,405,694,130 |
| Jul-16 | -\$1,991,284 | -\$607,071 | -\$6,338 | -\$29,412 | \$71,233 | -\$2,562,872 | \$0 | -\$2,562,872 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,384,844,774 | -\$1,408,257,002 |
| Aug-16 | -\$2,033,848 | -\$612,147 | -\$6,595 | -\$31,069 | \$86,108 | -\$2,597,551 | \$0 | -\$2,597,551 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,387,442,325 | -\$1,410,854,553 |
| Sep-16 | -\$2,009,458 | -\$597,987 | -\$7,340 | -\$6,580 | \$55,578 | -\$2,565,788 | \$0 | -\$2,565,788 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,390,008,113 | -\$1,413,420,341 |
| Oct-16 | -\$2,257,699 | -\$619,928 | -\$10,332 | \$67,158 | \$80,285 | -\$2,740,516 | \$0 | -\$2,740,516 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,392,748,629 | -\$1,416,160,857 |
| Nov-16 | -\$5,015,771 | -\$1,363,107 | -\$32,609 | -\$46,694 | \$1,689 | -\$6,456,492 | \$0 | -\$6,456,492 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,399,205,120 | -\$1,422,617,349 |
| Dec-16 | -\$8,848,222 | -\$2,602,060 | -\$39,483 | -\$52,895 | \$77,846 | -\$11,464,815 | \$0 | -\$11,464,815 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,410,669,935 | -\$1,434,082,163 |
| Jan-17 | -\$8,602,412 | -\$1,932,895 | -\$23,094 | -\$197,580 | \$16,657 | -\$10,739,324 | \$0 | -\$10,739,324 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,421,409,259 | -\$1,444,821,488 |
| Feb-17 | -\$10,479,905 | -\$3,212,465 | -\$45,344 | -\$189,553 | \$20,621 | -\$13,906,646 | \$0 | -\$13,906,646 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,435,315,906 | -\$1,458,728,134 |
| Mar-17 | -\$12,403,111 | -\$3,981,768 | -\$66,462 | -\$14,808 | \$13,044 | -\$16,453,105 | \$0 | -\$16,453,105 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,451,769,011 | -\$1,475,181,239 |
| Apr-17 | -\$7,152,840 | -\$2,079,943 | -\$33,637 | -\$44,992 | \$20,985 | -\$9,290,427 | \$0 | -\$9,290,427 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,461,059,438 | -\$1,484,471,666 |
| May-17 | -\$4,249,551 | -\$1,084,496 | -\$16,756 | -\$19,605 | \$51,743 | -\$5,318,664 | \$0 | -\$5,318,664 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,466,378,103 | -\$1,489,790,331 |
| Jun-17 | -\$2,846,544 | -\$749,126 | -\$12,220 | -\$29,457 | \$67,299 | -\$3,570,047 | \$0 | -\$3,570,047 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,469,948,150 | -\$1,493,360,378 |
| Jul-17 | -\$2,432,674 | -\$673,504 | -\$11,964 | \$17,247 | \$53,984 | -\$3,046,912 | \$0 | -\$3,046,912 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,472,995,062 | -\$1,496,407,290 |
| Aug-17 | -\$2,371,761 | -\$675,104 | -\$12,487 | \$2,572 | \$16 | -\$3,056,763 | \$0 | -\$3,056,763 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,476,051,825 | -\$1,499,464,053 |
| Sep-17 | -\$2,539,390 | -\$714,249 | -\$12,382 | \$5,325 | \$60,276 | -\$3,200,419 | \$0 | -\$3,200,419 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,479,252,244 | -\$1,502,664,472 |


| Month | Res. Savings CAB | Com. Savings CAB | Ind. Savings CAB | Com. Savings GAS | Ind. Savings GAS | Total <br> Monthly Choice Savings | $\begin{array}{\|c\|} \hline \text { Monthly } \\ \text { PIPP } \\ \text { Savings } \end{array}$ | Monthly Savings Including PIPP | Cumulative PIPP Savings | Cumulative Savings (Incl PIPP) | Cumulative <br> Savings (Excl PIPP) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Oct-17 | -\$2,648,172 | -\$744,642 | -\$15,885 | \$22,212 | \$43,730 | -\$3,342,756 | \$0 | -\$3,342,756 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,482,595,000 | -\$1,506,007,228 |
| Nov-17 | -\$7,587,488 | -\$1,966,136 | -\$50,909 | \$30,457 | \$50,781 | -\$9,523,295 | \$0 | -\$9,523,295 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,492,118,295 | -\$1,515,530,523 |
| Dec-17 | -\$12,595,841 | -\$3,405,446 | -\$73,570 | -\$42,110 | \$70,159 | -\$16,046,808 | \$0 | -\$16,046,808 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,508,165,103 | -\$1,531,577,331 |
| Jan-18 | -\$22,918,445 | -\$6,713,323 | -\$115,325 | \$16,576 | \$56,107 | -\$29,674,409 | \$0 | -\$29,674,409 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,537,839,513 | -\$1,561,251,741 |
| Feb-18 | -\$11,398,416 | -\$2,573,054 | -\$37,638 | \$32,141 | \$35,553 | -\$13,941,414 | \$0 | -\$13,941,414 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,551,780,927 | -\$1,575,193,155 |
| Mar-18 | -\$13,701,257 | -\$4,102,488 | -\$71,874 | \$97,706 | \$23,532 | -\$17,754,381 | \$0 | -\$17,754,381 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,569,535,308 | -\$1,592,947,536 |
| Apr-18 | -\$14,252,376 | -\$4,362,801 | -\$80,331 | \$48,637 | \$20,711 | -\$18,626,161 | \$0 | -\$18,626,161 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,588,161,468 | -\$1,611,573,696 |
| May-18 | -\$6,279,749 | -\$1,859,047 | -\$35,776 | \$20,324 | \$15,933 | -\$8,138,314 | \$0 | -\$8,138,314 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,596,299,783 | -\$1,619,712,011 |
| Jun-18 | -\$2,785,837 | -\$866,876 | -\$13,609 | \$15,332 | \$43,914 | -\$3,607,076 | \$0 | -\$3,607,076 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,599,906,859 | -\$1,623,319,087 |
| Jul-18 | -\$2,391,788 | -\$728,416 | -\$12,355 | \$17,243 | \$71,279 | -\$3,044,037 | \$0 | -\$3,044,037 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,602,950,896 | -\$1,626,363,124 |
| Aug-18 | -\$2,370,543 | -\$763,545 | -\$11,058 | -\$8,968 | \$73,229 | -\$3,080,885 | \$0 | -\$3,080,885 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,606,031,780 | -\$1,629,444,009 |
| Sep-18 | -\$2,377,345 | -\$747,286 | -\$11,546 | \$8,187 | \$48,877 | -\$3,079,113 | \$0 | -\$3,079,113 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,609,110,894 | -\$1,632,523,122 |
| Oct-18 | -\$3,048,855 | -\$877,058 | -\$21,557 | -\$8,173 | \$41,244 | -\$3,914,399 | \$0 | -\$3,914,399 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,613,025,293 | -\$1,636,437,521 |
| Nov-18 | -\$8,245,795 | -\$2,195,153 | -\$46,857 | \$49,759 | \$57,367 | -\$10,380,680 | \$0 | -\$10,380,680 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,623,405,972 | -\$1,646,818,201 |
| Dec-18 | -\$7,107,855 | -\$486,892 | -\$11,127 | -\$131,642 | \$36,444 | -\$7,701,071 | \$0 | -\$7,701,071 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,631,107,044 | -\$1,654,519,272 |
| Jan-19 | -\$14,432,062 | -\$4,330,882 | -\$90,482 | -\$9,463 | -\$117,386 | -\$18,980,275 | \$0 | -\$18,980,275 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,650,087,319 | -\$1,673,499,547 |
| Feb-19 | -\$20,526,817 | -\$6,533,568 | -\$128,396 | \$24,773 | \$23,583 | -\$27,140,424 | \$0 | -\$27,140,424 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,636,251,318 | -\$1,659,663,546 |
| Mar-19 | -\$17,106,315 | -\$5,386,552 | -\$109,858 | -\$51,686 | -\$1,770 | -\$22,656,180 | \$0 | -\$22,656,180 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,658,907,497 | -\$1,682,319,726 |
| Apr-19 | -\$11,367,867 | -\$3,623,774 | -\$74,339 | \$49,716 | \$10,455 | -\$15,005,809 | \$0 | -\$15,005,809 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,673,913,306 | -\$1,697,325,534 |
| May-19 | -\$6,410,621 | -\$1,840,759 | -\$28,594 | \$17,288 | \$30,188 | -\$8,232,499 | \$0 | -\$8,232,499 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,682,145,805 | -\$1,705,558,033 |
| Jun-19 | -\$3,592,368 | -\$1,200,432 | -\$15,590 | -\$6,574 | \$26,184 | -\$4,788,780 | \$0 | -\$4,788,780 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,686,934,584 | -\$1,710,346,813 |
| Jul-19 | -\$2,998,675 | -\$1,087,420 | -\$14,994 | \$18,709 | \$39,386 | -\$4,042,994 | \$0 | -\$4,042,994 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,690,977,578 | -\$1,714,389,806 |
| Aug-19 | -\$2,813,061 | -\$1,067,297 | -\$15,342 | \$18,693 | \$40,760 | -\$3,836,246 | \$0 | -\$3,836,246 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,694,813,825 | -\$1,718,226,053 |
| Sep-19 | -\$2,859,421 | -\$1,071,283 | -\$14,214 | \$25,450 | \$46,097 | -\$3,873,371 | \$0 | -\$3,873,371 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,698,687,196 | -\$1,722,099,424 |
| Oct-19 | -\$3,348,874 | -\$1,102,361 | -\$19,762 | \$2,084 | \$44,122 | -\$4,424,791 | \$0 | -\$4,424,791 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,703,111,987 | -\$1,726,524,215 |
| Nov-19 | -\$8,645,982 | -\$2,655,864 | -\$57,042 | \$107,477 | \$56,498 | -\$11,194,913 | \$0 | -\$11,194,913 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,714,306,900 | -\$1,737,719,128 |
| Dec-19 | -\$16,457,094 | -\$5,480,208 | -\$131,140 | \$96,260 | \$42,802 | -\$21,929,380 | \$0 | -\$21,929,380 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,736,236,280 | -\$1,759,648,508 |
| Jan-20 | -\$18,659,395 | -\$6,818,494 | -\$157,018 | \$112,697 | \$23,420 | -\$25,498,789 | \$0 | -\$25,498,789 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,761,735,069 | -\$1,785,147,297 |
| Feb-20 | -\$20,153,919 | -\$7,318,893 | -\$164,857 | \$119,648 | \$8,427 | -\$25,498,789 | \$0 | -\$27,509,594 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,789,244,663 | -\$1,812,656,891 |
| Mar-20 | -\$18,103,090 | -\$6,385,425 | -\$141,270 | \$82,100 | \$4,253 | -\$25,498,789 | \$0 | -\$24,543,434 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,813,788,097 | -\$1,837,200,325 |
| Apr-20 | -\$13,271,864 | -\$4,320,014 | -\$95,686 | \$60,573 | \$7,402 | -\$25,498,789 | \$0 | -\$17,619,589 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,831,407,686 | -\$1,854,819,914 |
| May-20 | -\$10,105,148 | -\$3,022,800 | -\$59,180 | \$39,324 | \$19,243 | -\$25,498,789 | \$0 | -\$13,128,560 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,844,536,246 | -\$1,867,948,474 |
| Jun-20 | -\$4,981,287 | -\$1,563,980 | -\$27,330 | \$26,538 | \$29,521 | -\$25,498,789 | \$0 | -\$6,516,538 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,851,052,783 | -\$1,874,465,012 |
| Jul-20 | -\$3,427,680 | -\$1,231,796 | -\$19,076 | \$12,545 | \$34,018 | -\$25,498,789 | \$0 | -\$4,631,990 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,855,684,773 | -\$1,879,097,001 |
| Aug-20 | -\$2,885,618 | -\$1,016,131 | -\$16,235 | \$14,923 | \$37,981 | -\$25,498,789 | \$0 | -\$3,865,080 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,859,549,853 | -\$1,882,962,081 |
| Sep-20 | -\$2,619,833 | -\$818,632 | -\$10,300 | \$28,296 | \$18,070 | -\$25,498,789 | \$0 | -\$3,402,399 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,862,952,253 | -\$1,886,364,481 |
| Oct-20 | -\$4,316,431 | -\$1,409,642 | -\$24,376 | \$30,873 | \$40,906 | -\$25,498,789 | \$0 | -\$5,678,670 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,868,630,922 | -\$1,892,043,150 |
| Nov-20 | -\$5,812,412 | -\$1,607,908 | -\$37,387 | \$62,014 | \$40,068 | -\$25,498,789 | \$0 | -\$7,355,625 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,875,986,547 | -\$1,899,398,775 |
| Dec-20 | -\$11,200,126 | -\$3,625,383 | -\$80,765 | \$106,855 | \$47,245 | -\$25,498,789 | \$0 | -\$14,752,175 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,890,738,722 | -\$1,914,150,950 |
| Jan-21 | -\$19,491,141 | -\$6,666,876 | -\$143,223 | \$154,450 | \$31,771 | -\$26,115,017 | \$0 | -\$26,115,017 | \$23,412,228 | -\$1,916,853,739 | -\$1,940,265,967 |
| Feb-21 | -\$21,196,479 | -\$7,336,740 | -\$152,312 | \$156,417 | \$4,674 | -\$26,115,017 | \$0 | -\$28,524,440 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,945,378,180 | -\$1,968,790,408 |


| Month | Res. Savings CAB | $\begin{array}{c\|} \hline \text { Com. Savings } \\ \text { CAB } \end{array}$ | Ind. Savings CAB | Com. Savings GAS | Ind. Savings GAS | Total Monthly Choice Savings | Monthly <br> PIPP <br> Savings | Monthly Savings Including PIPP | Cumulative PIPP Savings | Cumulative Savings (Incl PIPP) | Cumulative <br> Savings (Excl PIPP) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mar-21 | -\$20,318,419 | -\$7,231,681 | -\$154,242 | \$99,776 | \$10,154 | -\$26,115,017 | \$0 | -\$27,594,413 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,972,972,592 | -\$1,996,384,820 |
| Apr-21 | -\$8,209,071 | -\$2,226,020 | -\$40,889 | \$92,010 | \$9,969 | -\$26,115,017 | \$0 | -\$10,374,000 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,983,346,592 | -\$2,006,758,820 |
| May-21 | -\$5,479,371 | -\$1,314,604 | -\$16,485 | \$85,657 | \$34,582 | -\$26,115,017 | \$0 | -\$6,690,222 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,990,036,814 | -\$2,013,449,042 |
| Jun-21 | -\$3,289,413 | -\$864,557 | -\$8,249 | \$44,137 | \$38,264 | -\$26,115,017 | \$0 | -\$4,079,817 | \$23,412,227 | -\$1,994,116,631 | -\$2,017,528,860 |


[^0]:    1 Subsequently, in Case No. 17-1842-EL-ORD, the Commission proceeded separately with the five-year review of Ohio Adm.Code Chapter 4901:1-10. The case caption for these proceedings has been modified accordingly.

