

**As Passed by the Senate**

**131st General Assembly**

**Regular Session**

**2015-2016**

**Sub. H. B. No. 9**

**Representative Boose**

**Cosponsors: Representatives Blessing, Hambley, Hood, Scherer, Sprague, Strahorn, Young, Dever, Driehaus, Rogers, Anielski, Antonio, Ashford, Baker, Barnes, Brown, Buchy, Burkley, Butler, Celebrezze, Cera, Clyde, Conditt, Derickson, Dovilla, Duffey, Fedor, Green, Grossman, Hackett, Hagan, Henne, Hill, Huffman, Johnson, T., Koehler, Kraus, Lepore-Hagan, Maag, McClain, McColley, O'Brien, M., O'Brien, S., Patterson, Perales, Phillips, Ramos, Reineke, Retherford, Rezabek, Romanchuk, Ryan, Schuring, Sears, Smith, K., Stinziano, Sweeney, Sykes, Terhar, Thompson**

**Senators Gardner, Peterson, Sawyer, Tavares, Uecker**

---

**A BILL**

To amend sections 107.03, 125.01, 125.071, and 5703.48 and to enact section 5703.95 of the Revised Code to create a Tax Expenditure Review Committee for the purpose of periodically reviewing existing tax expenditures and to prohibit the Director of Administrative Services from making purchases by competitive sealed proposal without prior Controlling Board approval.

**BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF THE STATE OF OHIO:**

**Section 1.** That sections 107.03, 125.01, 125.071, and 5703.48 be amended and section 5703.95 of the Revised Code be enacted to read as follows:

**Sec. 107.03.** The governor shall submit to the general 13  
assembly, not later than four weeks after its organization, a 14  
state budget containing a complete financial plan for the 15  
ensuing fiscal biennium, excluding items of revenue and 16  
expenditure described in section 126.022 of the Revised Code. 17  
However, in years of a new governor's inauguration, the budget 18  
shall be submitted not later than the fifteenth day of March. In 19  
years of a new governor's inauguration, only the new governor 20  
shall submit a budget to the general assembly. In addition to 21  
other things required by law, the governor's budget shall 22  
contain: 23

(A) A general budget summary by function and agency 24  
setting forth the proposed total expenses from each and all 25  
funds and the anticipated resources for meeting such expenses; 26  
such resources to include any available balances in the several 27  
funds at the beginning of the biennium and a classification by 28  
totals of all revenue receipts estimated to accrue during the 29  
biennium under existing law and proposed legislation. 30

(B) A detailed statement showing the amounts recommended 31  
to be appropriated from each fund for each fiscal year of the 32  
biennium for current expenses, including, but not limited to, 33  
personal services, supplies and materials, equipment, subsidies 34  
and revenue distribution, merchandise for resale, transfers, and 35  
nonexpense disbursements, obligations, interest on debt, and 36  
retirement of debt, and for the biennium for capital outlay, to 37  
the respective departments, offices, institutions, as defined in 38  
section 121.01 of the Revised Code, and all other public 39  
purposes; and, in comparative form, the actual expenses by 40  
source of funds during each fiscal year of the previous two 41  
bienniums for each such purpose. No alterations shall be made in 42  
the requests for the legislative and judicial branches of the 43

state filed with the director of budget and management under 44  
section 126.02 of the Revised Code. If any amount of federal 45  
money is recommended to be appropriated or has been expended for 46  
a purpose for which state money also is recommended to be 47  
appropriated or has been expended, the amounts of federal money 48  
and state money involved shall be separately identified. 49

(C) A detailed estimate of the revenue receipts in each 50  
fund from each source under existing laws during each year of 51  
the biennium; and, in comparative form, actual revenue receipts 52  
in each fund from each source for each year of the two previous 53  
bienniums; 54

(D) The estimated cash balance in each fund at the 55  
beginning of the biennium covered by the budget; the estimated 56  
liabilities outstanding against each such balance; and the 57  
estimated net balance remaining and available for new 58  
appropriations; 59

(E) A detailed estimate of the additional revenue receipts 60  
in each fund from each source under proposed legislation, if 61  
enacted, during each year of the biennium; 62

(F) A description of each tax expenditure; a detailed 63  
estimate of the amount of revenues not available to the general 64  
revenue fund under existing laws during each fiscal year of the 65  
biennium covered by the budget due to the operation of each tax 66  
expenditure; and, in comparative form, the amount of revenue not 67  
available to the general revenue fund during each fiscal year of 68  
the immediately preceding biennium due to the operation of each 69  
tax expenditure. The report prepared by the department of 70  
taxation pursuant to section 5703.48 of the Revised Code shall 71  
be submitted to the general assembly as an appendix to the 72  
governor's budget. As used in this division, "tax expenditure" 73

has the same meaning as in section 5703.48 of the Revised Code. 74

(G) The most recent report prepared by the tax expenditure 75  
review committee under division (F) of section 5703.95 of the 76  
Revised Code, which shall be submitted to the general assembly 77  
as an appendix to the governor's budget. 78

**Sec. 125.01.** As used in this chapter: 79

(A) "Order" means a copy of a contract or a statement of 80  
the nature of a contemplated expenditure, a description of the 81  
property or supplies to be purchased or service to be performed, 82  
other than a service performed by officers and regular employees 83  
of the state, and per diem of the national guard, and the total 84  
sum of the expenditure to be made therefor, if the sum is fixed 85  
and ascertained, otherwise the estimated sum thereof, and an 86  
authorization to pay for the contemplated expenditure, signed by 87  
the person instructed and authorized to pay upon receipt of a 88  
proper invoice. 89

(B) "Invoice" means an itemized listing showing delivery 90  
of the supplies or performance of the service described in the 91  
order, and the date of the purchase or rendering of the service, 92  
or an itemization of the things done, material supplied, or 93  
labor furnished, and the sum due pursuant to the contract or 94  
obligation. 95

(C) "Products" means materials, manufacturer's supplies, 96  
merchandise, goods, wares, and foodstuffs. 97

(D) "Produced" means the manufacturing, processing, 98  
mining, developing, and making of a thing into a new article 99  
with a distinct character in use through the application of 100  
input, within the state, of Ohio products, labor, skill, or 101  
other services. "Produced" does not include the mere assembling 102

or putting together of non-Ohio products or materials.	103
(E) "Ohio products" means products that are mined,	104
excavated, produced, manufactured, raised, or grown in the state	105
by a person where the input of Ohio products, labor, skill, or	106
other services constitutes no less than twenty-five per cent of	107
the manufactured cost. With respect to mined products, such	108
products shall be mined or excavated in this state.	109
(F) "Purchase" means to buy, rent, lease, lease purchase,	110
or otherwise acquire supplies or services. "Purchase" also	111
includes all functions that pertain to the obtaining of supplies	112
or services, including description of requirements, selection	113
and solicitation of sources, preparation and award of contracts,	114
all phases of contract administration, and receipt and	115
acceptance of the supplies and services and payment for them.	116
(G) "Services" means the furnishing of labor, time, or	117
effort by a person, not involving the delivery of a specific end	118
product other than a report which, if provided, is merely	119
incidental to the required performance. "Services" does not	120
include services furnished pursuant to employment agreements or	121
collective bargaining agreements.	122
(H) "Supplies" means all property, including, but not	123
limited to, equipment, materials, other tangible assets, and	124
insurance, but excluding real property or an interest in real	125
property.	126
(I) "Competitive selection" means any of the following	127
procedures for making purchases:	128
(1) Competitive sealed bidding under section 125.07 of the	129
Revised Code;	130
(2) <del>Competitive sealed proposals under section 125.071 of</del>	131

<del>the Revised Code;</del>	132
<del>(3) Reverse auctions under section 125.072 of the Revised Code.</del>	133
	134
<b>Sec. 125.071.</b> (A) In accordance with rules the director of administrative services shall adopt, the director may make purchases by competitive sealed proposal whenever the director determines that the use of competitive sealed bidding is not possible or not advantageous to the state.	135
	136
	137
	138
	139
(B) Proposals shall be solicited through a request for proposals. The request for proposals shall state the relative importance of price and other evaluation factors. Notice of the request for proposals shall be given in accordance with rules the director shall adopt.	140
	141
	142
	143
	144
(C) Proposals shall be opened so as to avoid disclosure of contents to competing offerors.	145
	146
In order to ensure fair and impartial evaluation, proposals and related documents submitted in response to a request for proposals are not available for public inspection and copying under section 149.43 of the Revised Code until after the award of the contract.	147
	148
	149
	150
	151
(D) As provided in the request for proposals, and under rules the director shall adopt, discussions may be conducted with responsible offerors who submit proposals determined to be reasonably susceptible of being selected for award for the purpose of ensuring full understanding of, and responsiveness to, solicitation requirements. Offerors shall be accorded fair and equal treatment with respect to any opportunity for discussion regarding any clarification, correction, or revision of proposals. No disclosure of any information derived from	152
	153
	154
	155
	156
	157
	158
	159
	160

proposals submitted by competing offerors shall occur when 161  
discussions are conducted. 162

(E) Award may be made to the offeror whose proposal is 163  
determined to be the most advantageous to this state, taking 164  
into consideration factors such as price and the evaluation 165  
criteria set forth in the request for proposals. The contract 166  
file shall contain the basis on which the award is made. 167

(F) The director shall not make any purchases under this 168  
section without the prior approval of the controlling board. 169

**Sec. 5703.48.** (A) As used in this section and section 170  
107.03 of the Revised Code, "tax expenditure" means ~~any a~~ tax 171  
provision in the Revised Code that exempts, either in whole or 172  
in part, certain persons, income, goods, services, or property 173  
from the effect of taxes ~~established in the Revised Code~~ levied 174  
by the state, including, but not limited to, tax deductions, 175  
exemptions, deferrals, exclusions, allowances, credits, 176  
reimbursements, and preferential tax rates, provided all of the 177  
following apply to the provision: 178

(1) The provision reduces, or has the potential to reduce, 179  
revenue to the general revenue fund; 180

(2) The persons, income, goods, services, or property 181  
exempted by the provision would have been part of a defined tax 182  
base; 183

(3) The persons, income, goods, services, or property 184  
exempted by the provision are not subject to an alternate tax 185  
levied by the state; 186

(4) The provision is subject to modification or repeal by 187  
an act of the general assembly. 188

(B) The department of taxation shall prepare and submit to 189  
the governor not later than the first day of November in each 190  
even-numbered year a report describing the effect of tax 191  
expenditures on the general revenue fund. The report shall 192  
contain a description of each tax expenditure under existing 193  
laws and, in comparative form, a detailed estimate of the 194  
approximate amount of revenue not available to the state general 195  
revenue fund in each fiscal year of the current and ensuing 196  
fiscal bienniums as a result of the operation of each tax 197  
expenditure. The report shall be prepared in such a manner as to 198  
facilitate the inclusion of the information provided by the 199  
report in the governor's budget. 200

Sec. 5703.95. (A) As used in this section, "tax 201  
expenditure" has the same meaning as in section 5703.48 of the 202  
Revised Code. 203

(B) There is hereby created the tax expenditure review 204  
committee, consisting of seven members, composed of the 205  
following: 206

(1) Three members of the house of representatives 207  
appointed by the speaker of the house of representatives in 208  
consultation with the minority leader of the house of 209  
representatives. Members described in division (B)(1) of this 210  
section shall not all be members of the same party and should be 211  
members of the house of representatives committee that deals 212  
primarily with tax legislation; 213

(2) Three members of the senate appointed by the president 214  
of the senate in consultation with the minority leader of the 215  
senate. Members described in division (B)(2) of this section 216  
shall not all be members of the same party and should be members 217  
of the senate committee that deals primarily with tax 218



legislation; 219

(3) The tax commissioner or the tax commissioner's 220  
designee. The member described in division (B)(3) of this 221  
section shall be a nonvoting member. 222

The speaker of the house of representatives and the 223  
president of the senate shall make initial appointments to the 224  
committee not later than thirty days following the effective 225  
date of the enactment of this section. Thereafter, the terms of 226  
the office for appointed members shall be the same as the term 227  
of each general assembly. Members may be reappointed, provided 228  
the member continues to meet all other eligibility requirements. 229  
Vacancies shall be filled in the manner provided for original 230  
appointments. Any member appointed to fill a vacancy before the 231  
expiration of the term for which the predecessor was appointed 232  
shall hold office as a member for the remainder of that term. 233  
Appointed members of the committee serve at the pleasure of the 234  
member's appointing authority and may be removed only by the 235  
appointing authority. 236

(C) The tax expenditure review committee shall hold its 237  
first meeting within ninety days after the effective date of the 238  
enactment of this section. At the first meeting, the members 239  
shall elect a chairperson, who shall be one of the members 240  
described in division (B)(1) or (2) of this section. Thereafter, 241  
the committee shall meet at least once during the first year of 242  
each fiscal biennium to review existing tax expenditures 243  
pursuant to division (D) of this section, provided the committee 244  
shall hold, for any such expenditure, at least one meeting at 245  
which a person may present to the committee evidence or 246  
testimony related to that expenditure. Any person may submit to 247  
the chairperson a request that the committee meet to accept 248

evidence or testimony on a tax expenditure. The committee is a 249  
public body for the purposes of section 121.22 of the Revised 250  
Code. 251

The chairperson of the committee shall serve until the 252  
thirty-first day of December of each even-numbered year. 253  
Thereafter, members shall elect a new chairperson. If the 254  
preceding chairperson was a member described in division (B) (1) 255  
of this section, the new chairperson shall be a member described 256  
in division (B) (2) of this section. If the preceding chairperson 257  
was a member described in division (B) (2) of this section, the 258  
new chairperson shall be a member described in division (B) (1) 259  
of this section. 260

A vacancy on the committee does not impair the right of 261  
the other members to exercise all the functions of the 262  
committee. The presence of a majority of the voting members of 263  
the committee constitutes a quorum for the conduct of business 264  
of the committee. The concurrence of at least a majority of the 265  
voting members of the committee is necessary for any action to 266  
be taken by the committee. 267

Upon the committee's request, the department of taxation, 268  
development services agency, office of budget and management, or 269  
other state agency shall provide any information in its 270  
possession that the committee requires to perform its duties. 271

The staff of the legislative service commission shall 272  
assist the committee as directed by the committee. 273

(D) The committee shall establish a schedule for review 274  
for each tax expenditure so that each expenditure is reviewed at 275  
least once every eight years. The schedule may provide for the 276  
review of each tax expenditure in the order the expenditures 277

were enacted or modified, beginning with the least recently 278  
enacted or modified tax expenditure. Alternatively, the review 279  
schedule may group tax expenditures by the individuals or 280  
industries benefiting from the expenditures, the objectives of 281  
each expenditure, or the policy rationale of each expenditure. 282  
In its review, the committee shall make recommendations as to 283  
whether each tax expenditure should be continued without 284  
modification, modified, scheduled for further review at a future 285  
date to consider repealing the expenditure, or repealed 286  
outright. For each expenditure reviewed, the committee may 287  
recommend accountability standards for the future review of the 288  
expenditure. The committee may consider, when reviewing a tax 289  
expenditure, any of the relevant factors described in division 290  
(E) of this section. 291

(E) In conducting reviews pursuant to division (D) of this 292  
section, the committee may consider the following factors: 293

(1) The number and classes of persons, organizations, 294  
businesses, or types of industries that would receive the direct 295  
benefit or consequences of the tax expenditure; 296

(2) The fiscal impact of the tax expenditure on state and 297  
local taxing authorities, including any past fiscal effects and 298  
expected future fiscal impacts of the tax expenditure in the 299  
following eight-year period; 300

(3) Public policy objectives that might support the tax 301  
expenditure. In researching such objectives, the committee may 302  
consider the expenditure's legislative history, the tax 303  
expenditure's sponsor's intent in proposing the tax expenditure, 304  
or the extent to which the tax expenditure encourages or would 305  
encourage business growth or relocation into the state, promotes 306  
or would promote growth or retention of high-wage jobs in the 307

<u>state, or aids or would aid community stabilization.</u>	308
<u>(4) Whether the tax expenditure successfully accomplishes</u>	309
<u>any of the objectives identified in division (E)(3) of this</u>	310
<u>section;</u>	311
<u>(5) Whether the objectives identified in division (E)(3)</u>	312
<u>of this section would or could have been accomplished</u>	313
<u>successfully in the absence of the tax expenditure or with less</u>	314
<u>cost to the state or local governments;</u>	315
<u>(6) Whether the objectives identified in division (E)(3)</u>	316
<u>of this section could have been accomplished successfully</u>	317
<u>through a program that requires legislative appropriations for</u>	318
<u>funding;</u>	319
<u>(7) The extent to which the tax expenditure may provide</u>	320
<u>unintended benefits to an individual, organization, or industry</u>	321
<u>other than those the general assembly or sponsor intended or</u>	322
<u>creates an unfair competitive advantage for its recipient with</u>	323
<u>respect to other businesses in the state;</u>	324
<u>(8) The extent to which terminating the tax expenditure</u>	325
<u>may have negative effects on taxpayers that currently benefit</u>	326
<u>from the tax expenditure;</u>	327
<u>(9) The extent to which terminating the tax expenditure</u>	328
<u>may have negative or positive effects on the state's employment</u>	329
<u>and economy;</u>	330
<u>(10) The feasibility of modifying the tax expenditure to</u>	331
<u>provide for adjustment or recapture of the proceeds of the tax</u>	332
<u>expenditure if the objectives of the tax expenditure are not</u>	333
<u>fulfilled by the recipient of the tax expenditure.</u>	334
<u>(F) The committee shall prepare a report of its</u>	335

determinations under division (D) of this section and, not later 336  
than the first day of July of each even-numbered year, submit a 337  
copy of the report to the governor, the speaker of the house of 338  
representatives, the president of the senate, the minority 339  
leader of the house of representatives, and the minority leader 340  
of the senate. The first report shall be submitted either in the 341  
year of the effective date of this section or in the first even- 342  
numbered year thereafter. If the committee maintains a web site, 343  
the committee shall cause a copy of the report to be posted on 344  
the web site in a form enabling access to the report by the 345  
public within thirty days after the report is submitted under 346  
this division. If the committee does not maintain a web site, 347  
the committee shall request that the president of the senate and 348  
the speaker of the house of representatives cause the report to 349  
be posted on the web site of the general assembly. 350

(G) Any bill introduced in the house of representatives or 351  
the senate that proposes to enact or modify one or more tax 352  
expenditures should include a statement explaining the 353  
objectives of the tax expenditure or its modification and the 354  
sponsor's intent in proposing the tax expenditure or its 355  
modification. 356

**Section 2.** That existing sections 107.03, 125.01, 125.071, 357  
and 5703.48 of the Revised Code are hereby repealed. 358